

# REVIEWS/COMPTES RENDUS

- James Douglas Thwaites et André Leblanc, *Le Monde du travail au Québec. Bibliographie/The World of Labour in Quebec. Bibliography* by Joanne Burgess / 285
- Elizabeth Jane Errington, *Wives and Mothers, Schoolmistresses and Scullery Maids: Working Women in Upper Canada, 1790-1840* by Judith Fingard / 286
- Colin D. Howell, *Northern Sandlots: A Social History of Maritime Baseball* by Stacy L. Lorenz / 287
- Pierre Dubois, *Les vrais maîtres de la forêt québécoise* by Jean-Roch Cyr / 290
- Jacques-Paul Couturier et Phyllis E. LeBlanc, dir. *Économie et société en Acadie, 1850-1950* et Nicolas Landry, *Les pêches dans la péninsule acadienne, 1850-1950* par Léon Robichaud / 291
- John C. Kennedy, *People of the Bays and Headlands: Anthropological History and the Fate of Communities in the Unknown Labrador* by Patricia A. Thornton / 295
- Odette Vincent (s.d.), Maurice Asselin, Benoît-Beaudry Gourd, Clément Mercier, Roland Viau, Marc Côté, Jean-Pierre Marquis, Marc Riopel, Cécile Sabourin, *Histoire de l'Abitibi-Témiscamingue* par Denis Goulet, Christine Hudon et Pierre Lanthier / 297
- Jeremy Mouat, *Roaring Days: Rossland's Mines and the History of British Columbia* by David M. Emmons / 299
- José Igartua, *Arvida au Saguenay. Naissance d'une ville industrielle* par Marc Vallières / 300
- Mercedes Steedman, Peter Suschnigg, and Dieter K. Buse, eds., *Hard Lessons: The Mine Mill Union in the Canadian Labour Movement* by Thomas Dunk / 302
- Suzanne Morton, *Ideal Surroundings: Domestic Life in a Working-Class Suburb in the 1920s* by Robert A.J. McDonald / 304
- Donald H. Avery, *Reluctant Host: Canada's Response to Immigrant Workers, 1896-1994* by Carmela Patrias / 306
- Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse, *Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957* by Donald Howard Avery / 308
- Sam Gindin, *The Canadian Auto Workers: The Birth and Transformation of a Union* by Kevin Boyle / 310
- Susan Crean, *Grace Hartman: A Woman for Her Time* by Terry Crowley / 312
- David Brundage, *The Making of Western Labor Radicals: Denver's Organized Workers 1878-1905* by David Bright / 313

- Leon Fink, *In Search of the Working Class: Essays in American Labor History and Political Culture* by Andy Parnaby / 315
- J. Robert Constantine, ed., *Gentle Rebel: Letters of Eugene V. Debs* by W.M. Dick / 317
- Colin Gordon, *New Deals: Business, Labor, and Politics in America, 1920-1935* by David E. Hamilton / 319
- Stephen Amberg, *The Union Inspiration in American Politics: The Autoworkers and the Making of a Liberal Industrial Order* by Elizabeth Fones-Wolf / 321
- Robert Asher and Ronald Edsforth (with the assistance of Stephen Merlino), eds., *Autowork* by Robert H. Zieger / 323
- Gilbert G. Gonzalez, *Labor and Community: Mexican Citrus Worker Villages in a Southern California County, 1900-1950* by Peter Seixas / 324
- Elizabeth A. Fones-Wolf, *Selling Free Enterprise: The Business Assault on Labor and Liberalism, 1945-1960* by Stephen Scheinberg / 326
- Dorothy Ray Healey and Maurice Isserman, *California Red: A Life in the American Communist Party* by Joan Sangster / 327
- Harvey Klehr, John E Haynes and Fridrikh I. Firsov, *The Secret World of American Communism* by Michael Jabara Carley / 329
- Bryan D. Palmer, *E.P. Thompson: Objections and Oppositions* by Neville Kirk / 333
- Cormac O'Grada, *Ireland Before and After the Famine: Explorations in Economic History, 1800-1925* by Gary Owens / 335
- Jean-Louis Robert, *Les Ouvriers, la Patrie et la Révolution* by Christine Piette / 337
- Lee Palmer Wandel, *Voracious Idols and Violent Hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel* by James M. Stayer / 338
- Hans-Jurgen Arendt, Sabine Hering, and Leonie Wagner, eds., *Nationalsozialistische Frauenpolitik vor 1933: Dokumentation* by Rosemarie Schade / 340
- Eduardo Silva, *Prince of the People: The Life and Times of a Brazilian Free Man of Colour* by Roderick J. Barman / 341
- Christine Hünefeldt, *Paying the Price of Freedom: Family and Labor among Lima's Slaves, 1800-1854* by Sonya Lipsett-Rivera / 342
- Kevin A. Yelvington, *Producing Power: Ethnicity, Gender, and Class in a Caribbean Workplace* by O. Nigel Bolland / 344
- Zachary Lockman, ed., *Workers and Working Classes in the Middle East: Struggles, Histories, Historiographies* by Hasan Kayali / 345
- Martin J. Murray, *The Revolution Deferred: The Painful Birth of Post-Apartheid South Africa* by William Freund / 347
- Laurie Graham, *On the Line at Subaru-Isuzu: The Japanese Model and the American Worker* by James Rinehart / 349
- Lydia Morris, *Dangerous Classes: The Underclass and Social Citizenship*; Jonathan Simon, *Poor Discipline: Parole and the Social Control of the Underclass, 1890-1990*; and, Christopher Jencks, *The Homeless* by Mark J. Stern / 351

# REVIEWS / COMPTES RENDUS

James Douglas Thwaites et André Leblanc, *Le Monde du travail au Québec. Bibliographie/The World of Labour in Quebec. Bibliography* (Québec: Presses de l'Université du Québec 1995).

EN 1973, LA parution d'une bibliographie consacrée au monde du travail québécois inaugurerait la *Collection Histoire des travailleurs québécois* et annonçait une période de grande vitalité pour l'histoire ouvrière au Québec. Aujourd'hui, les auteurs, James Thwaites et André Leblanc, nous livrent une nouvelle version, bilingue, qui rend compte de la production considérable des vingt dernières années. Tout comme la première édition, celle-ci conçoit l'histoire ouvrière comme un vaste champ qui embrasse à la fois l'histoire sociale des travailleurs et l'histoire du mouvement ouvrier. Le lecteur y trouvera donc des études du travail et de la condition ouvrière, de même que des analyses du syndicalisme et de l'action politique ouvrière, en passant par les relations industrielles et les politiques sociales. Une même ouverture caractérise la bibliographie aux plans de la couverture chronologique (de la Nouvelle-France à l'époque contemporaine) et de la provenance disciplinaire des contributions retenues (histoire, sciences humaines et sociales).

A l'intérieur de ces paramètres, les auteurs et les membres de leur équipe ont procédé à une cueillette qui visait l'exhaustivité. Si certains principes directeurs

et les critères de sélection sont identifiés dès l'entrée en matière, leur application suscite toutefois des réserves. Aucune distinction n'est établie entre sources et études (contrairement à la première édition), ni entre les articles publiés dans les revues savantes et ceux d'une ou deux pages tirées de la presse ou des revues à grand tirage. Tout est confondu. Les critères de sélection laissent souvent perplexes: pourquoi avoir retenu certaines études consacrées à la démographie historique et en avoir écarté tant d'autres; pourquoi avoir exclu certains titres de Bruno Ramirez sur les Italiens de Montréal, notamment, l'article sur les ouvriers italiens du Canadien Pacifique; comment expliquer l'absence de la belle étude de Lucia Ferretti sur Saint-Pierre-Apôtre; pourquoi retenir les mémoires de maîtrise de Peter Bischoff et Jacques Ferland mais exclure leurs PhD, etc. ... En feuilletant les pages du volume, les surprises et les interrogations s'accroissent. Et une conclusion se profile, s'il est possible de repérer tant d'omissions dans les domaines de recherche que l'on connaît bien, qu'en est-il des autres champs?

Cette bibliographie souffre d'une autre lacune qui limite singulièrement son utilité pour les chercheurs. En effet, les auteurs ont choisi de produire un ouvrage dont les perspectives analytiques sont extrêmement réduites. La grille de classement ne retient que la nature du document — articles, ouvrages, thèses, journaux et périodes, documents sonores et audiovisuels. Elle ne tente aucune analyse du contenu des oeuvres et ne propose aucun regroupement par thème ou par sujet; elle n'établit aucune distinction chrono-

gique. Pour réperer la production historique sur un sujet, il faut donc se fier soit à l'index des auteurs, soit à l'index analytique, lequel «est composé à partir des mots-clé du titre ..., de même que des éléments du contenu.» (5) Cependant, l'examen de cet index suggère que, sauf de rares exceptions, le classement s'est effectué uniquement à partir des mots-clé du titre. Ainsi, celui que s'intéresse à un individu ne le trouvera que si son nom apparaît dans le titre d'une monographie ou d'un article. Celle qui s'intéresse à un sujet spécifique devra consulter une série de rubriques, tâche compliquée par leur classement alphabétique et les multiples renvois. Inversement, le recours aux seuls mots-clé produit parfois une telle quantité de références — environ 80 références pour «grève, gréviste,» plus de cent pour enseignant(e), instituteur/institutrice, professeur(e)» et au-delà de 175 pour Montréal — que seul les plus courageux oseront poursuivre leur enquête.

Enfin, tout en travail d'uniformisation, de vérification et de correction aurait pu être mené avec plus de minutie. On retrouve donc des variations dans les noms et prénoms d'auteurs (#350, #486, #1215, #6210), des titres incomplets (#352), des références incorrectes (#1406), des exemples du mauvais classement (#5313, #5322) et des erreurs dans l'index analytique. (563)

Joanne Burgess  
Université de Québec à Montréal

Elizabeth Jane Errington, *Wives and Mothers, Schoolmistresses and Scullery Maids: Working Women in Upper Canada, 1790-1840* (Montréal and Kingston: McGill-Queen's University Press 1995).

THIS IS A BOOK which deals with the routine experiences of some women in Upper Canada between 1790 and 1840. Errington attaches great importance to the temporal dimensions of the study — it is stressed seven times in the seven and one-

half page epilogue, for example — but the significance of what appear to be purely political dates is never explained. Although the focus is allegedly on work — domestic (productive and reproductive), paid and voluntary — the perspective captured most persuasively is not that of the routine woman. Rather, the author explores the experiences of the literate, and usually mature and privileged household manager of the genteel variety. The stories of a handful of "good" women with such well known names as Cartwright, Harris, Jameson, Jarvis, Langton, Macaulay, Moodie, O'Brien, Powell, Russell, Simcoe, and Traill, living either in pioneering rural settlements or provincial urban communities, provide the narrative voice. The discussion also ranges over such diverse topics as marriage breakdown (which does not happen to any of the principals), infanticide (ditto, though perhaps to children of their maids), poor relief (ditto), and hotel-keeping (ditto).

Since the title might lead the reader to expect a more inclusive approach, it is uncertain whether the elitist emphasis was dictated by inclination or by sources. Some omissions were clearly out of choice. At the outset, the author denies all responsibility for black and native women (xvi-xvii), though, interestingly, the occasional black woman emerges in the text to defy her exclusivism and cry out for historical integration. (109, 142) Like most qualitatively inclined historians of society, Errington is heavily dependent on the press, which provides the bulk of her information on non-elites. Her major supplement to the newspapers are travel accounts and immigrant guides and, for the most intimate details of family life, private papers, especially Mary O'Brien's journal. It is strange that such vital sources are not complemented with the kind of public and semi-public documents which historians of the turn of the 19th century are accustomed to use such as petitions to government, court and probate records, business ledgers and day-books, and British missionary society pa-

pers. The gaps produced by a narrow and often serendipitous range of research materials are serious. By ignoring ecclesiastical archives, for example, on the ground that "This volume does not explore the impact that differing ethnicity and religious beliefs had on women and their work" (250) Errington misses the experiences of educational workers in the charity schools and the debate on appropriate education for the daughters of the poor. Instead teaching and education are interpreted as the preserve of "Ladies' Academies" and "Seminaries of Respectability." In terms of coverage, the author avoids historical demography and unabashedly claims to be ignorant of demographic trends.

The evidence is sometimes at odds with the interpretation. The central characters are supposed to be joined to their husbands in companionate marriages, but the descriptions of the marriages imply at best a senior-junior partnership and at worst a master-servant relationship. Most of the women, overwhelmed with running the household and bearing and raising the children, depended on the assistance of other women — close relatives in times of crisis, neighbours in emergencies, and the domestic help or servant for coping with the daily grind. Errington's discussion of the rural help and urban servant follows closely the findings of the American literature on the subject but the perspective is always that of the mistress or other agent of authority.

While the topics in the discussion are attractively ordered — the colonial setting, marriage and motherhood, pioneering and rural housekeeping, urban and elitist housekeeping and benevolence, paid work in the marketplace and the school — the amount of repetition is irritating. Admittedly this makes it an excellent book for students — each significant fact and interpretation is repeated at least the three obligatory times preferred by pedagogues. Other readers, however, might have preferred to read about Upper

Canada's working women in one or two cogently written and well edited articles.

Judith Fingard  
Dalhousie University

Colin D. Howell, *Northern Sandlots: A Social History of Maritime Baseball* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1995).

AS MORE SCHOLARS begin to look seriously at sport, books like *Northern Sandlots: A Social History of Maritime Baseball* are finally being written. This means that social historians like Colin Howell — and no longer only historians working in physical education departments — are seeking to understand sport's development and significance. It also means, to borrow Howell's words, that scholars are now producing a growing "number of useful studies that rescue sport history from the celebratory impulses of sports enthusiasts." (3) Howell has put together an interesting and insightful analysis of Maritime baseball. Most importantly, he effectively links the game's development in the region to wider changes in society and social relations. As a result, Howell accomplishes what all of the best recent work in the field of sport history aims to do: he casts new light on not only the history of sport in Canadian society, but also the history of Canadian society itself.

A member of the Department of History at Saint Mary's University, Howell has written previously on a number of topics in Maritime history, including health, the professionalization of medicine, and social reform. Here, he explores the different social purposes served by baseball in Atlantic Canada from the mid-19th century to about 1960. In particular, he is "interested in the way that baseball was implicated in broader discourses involving respectable behaviour, masculinity and femininity, regionalism and nationalism, and class, ethnicity, and race." (ix) *Northern Sandlots* is Howell's at-

tempt at unravelling these discourses, and clarifying their connection to wider cultural changes and social processes. In terms of method and methodology, Howell has drawn extensively from other recent research in sport and leisure history. In particular, he is indebted to those historians and socialists who see sport and recreation as contested terrain — a site of class, gender, ethnic, racial, and community rivalries which, in turn, are linked to inequities inherent in modern industrial capitalism. Howell therefore views the development as primarily a series of struggles, conflicts, and compromises among different social groups.

Howell's analysis focuses on baseball's connection to larger issues, and on the most important meanings and identities that were attached to the game in various time periods. He sees the negotiation and redefinition of class and gender relations as keys to understanding baseball's evolution during most of the 19th century. As large numbers of working-class men — and some women — became involved in the sport, baseball was enveloped in debates over respectability, manliness, femininity, and moral improvement. In the progressive era, baseball became part of a wide-ranging discussion about health, social regeneration, and rational recreation. Moreover, as the game developed into a marketable commodity, the interests of promoters, entrepreneurs, and spectators often clashed with those of bourgeois reformers who viewed sport as an instrument of social reform. After World War I, however, the discourse surrounding Maritime baseball changed significantly. In the 1920s and 1930s, community-level, amateur baseball was at its peak in Atlantic Canada. As a result, Howell places community identity and regional integrity at the core of baseball's meaning to Maritime Canadians in the interwar period. In the 1950s, however, local baseball was swamped by a variety of new entertainment choices, including a continent-wide sporting market associated with post-industrial consumer soci-

ety. As a result, a century-old tradition of competitive, community-level baseball in the Maritimes disappeared by about 1960.

In *Northern Sandlots*, Howell makes important historiographical contributions on three levels: social history, regional history, and sport history. For those acquainted with developments in the "new" social history over the past two decades, the central concerns of *Northern Sandlots* — class and gender, work and play, community and region, race and ethnicity — are familiar ones. Those unfamiliar with recent scholarly work in sport history however, may be surprised by Howell's effective application of this kind of analysis to Maritime baseball. This study also contributes to research in working-class history by exploring the social and cultural dimensions of working-class experience. Similarly, Howell's analysis of regional baseball in the context of community life adds to a growing body of research into Maritime identity and culture.

One of the book's main contributions to the field of sport history is also connected to this regional emphasis. Howell provides a much-needed regional study of sport in the hinterland, away from the main centres or organized sport that have preoccupied most historians. Similarly, he offers some essential balance to much traditional work on baseball by concentrating on the small-town, community-oriented, amateur and semi-professional game, rather than major league baseball. Above all, though, this study's main value lies in its contributions to Canadian sport historiography; Howell is one of only a handful of historians to have applied the tools of good social history — and some of the most useful approaches to sport and leisure history — skilfully and successfully in a Canadian context. This book also takes a much more analytical approach to sport history than almost all previous Canadian studies. As a result, perhaps *Northern Sandlots* can best be characterized as a small step for social history and sport history in general, but a

much larger step for the field of Canadian sport history.

Despite the book's narrow title, then, *Northern Sandlots* is much more than "just" a history of Maritime baseball. Howell addresses many broader issues in this volume. However, in providing the reader with a larger context for his regional research, Howell sometimes focuses too much on the general picture, without giving adequate attention to local examples. For example, in discussing baseball's role in the social construction of masculinity, the medial and religious discourses connected to the sport's development, and the "reform" of professional baseball in the progressive era, Howell does not provide enough evidence and illustrations from the Maritimes to give the reader an adequate sense of the local flavour of these debates. In other areas, however, Howell does an excellent job of examining the Maritime context. For instance, he discusses many useful examples of the ethnic, occupational, and inter-town rivalries that fuelled the game's early growth, and he provides a solid assessment of the meaning of baseball for the region's black communities and native peoples. Howell's treatment of the introduction of professional baseball to Atlantic Canada in the 1880s and changes in Maritime baseball in the two decades prior to World War I are also solidly grounded in local evidence. Finally, Howell's examination of semi-pro baseball in the 1940s and 1950s is probably the strongest piece of regional research in the book — especially his analysis of baseball's weakening attachment to community life as local athletes were replaced by American imports, and Maritime leagues came to be judged solely by their ability to produce major-league prospects.

There are also a number of ways in which the book could be improved. First, Howell needs to explain baseball's contributions to working-class identity and solidarity in the 19th century more precisely, using specific evidence and exam-

ples. A more serious problem is that although Howell makes frequent reference to gender relations, he relies far too heavily on the secondary literature, and on American examples, to make his points. In the end the experiences of *Maritime* women — and Atlantic Canadian reactions to their involvement in baseball — are almost completely absent from this study. Another weakness of the book is that Howell never really examines the language of community pride and regional identity that allegedly dominated the discourse surrounding Maritime baseball after World War I. Unfortunately, while Howell demonstrates the growing prominence of provincial and regional amateur baseball championships in the 1920s and 1930s, he fails to convey a clear sense of the discourse of civic accomplishment, and show what baseball actually meant to Maritime communities.

The book's argument about the collapse of local baseball in the 1950s is also suggestive, but not completely convincing. While some parts of Howell's analysis are certainly valid, his explanation of the role of mass consumerism, television, the automobile, and regional economic decline in this process is not fully developed. In addition, Howell exaggerates the extent to which the mass consumer culture that swallowed up small-town baseball was a post-World War II phenomenon. People in the Maritimes were being drawn into a broader mass culture of sports, entertainment, advertising, and consumer products several decades before the 1940s and 1950s. Fans in Atlantic Canada avidly followed major league baseball, for instance, much earlier than Howell seems to indicate. His argument about the demise of local baseball therefore needs to be reformulated to take into account the wider cultural identities that already existed alongside a strong regional Maritime Identity in the interwar period.

Despite these weaknesses, *Northern Sandlots* is probably the best Canadian study available of both a single sport, and

sport in a particular region. Quite simply, it is one of the best pieces of Canadian sport history that I have read. Howell's analysis is incisive, his research is extensive, and he has carefully located Maritime baseball in a broad social, economic, and cultural context. Even though some of Howell's arguments need to be bolstered with additional evidence, *Northern Sandlots* is a fine synthesis of social history, regional history, and sport history.

Stacy L. Lorenz  
Augustana University College

Pierre Dubois, *Les vrais maîtres de la forêt québécoise*, préface de Richard Desjardins (Montréal: Les Éditions Écosociété 1995).

AVEC LA PUBLICATION de *Les vrais maîtres de la forêt québécoise*, les défenseurs de la saine gestion de la ressource forestière, du développement durable et de la relance des communautés rurales québécoises disposent d'un outil de travail utile. Rédacteur en chef du magazine *Forêt et conservation* et membre fondateur du *Collectif Forêt-intervention*, l'ingénieur forestier et journaliste Pierre Dubois présente un ouvrage de sensibilisation et d'information sur la surexploitation de la forêt boréale québécoise. Réalisé avec l'appui financier de plusieurs groupes écologiques et syndicaux ce court ouvrage très dense vise à faire comprendre au grand public et aux autorités l'extrême gravité de la situation forestière au Québec.

D'entrée de jeu, l'auteur souligne l'influence subtile de l'industrie forestière sur le milieu universitaire et son accès privilégié aux responsables de l'administration des forêts. Selon lui, la soumission des élites forestières et politiques aux intérêts de la grande industrie est la cause majeure des problèmes forestiers au Québec. La manière d'effectuer les coupes (la coupe à blanc en particulier) a des répercussions indéniables sur les écosystèmes. Il existe aussi un paradoxe évi-

dent entre l'opulence de l'industrie forestière et l'appauvrissement des communautés forestières dans une industrie qui est le pilier de l'économie régionale au Québec. Malgré des profits incroyables, les grands conglomerats industriels qui contrôlent les papeteries canadiennes réussissent, au moindre indice d'une crise, à obtenir avantages, concessions et compromis de leurs partenaires sociaux. Ceux qui gagnent leur vie dans la forêt font la plupart du temps les frais de ce comportement pour le moins irresponsable. En fait, dans le monde du travail au Québec, il existe peu d'emplois aussi difficiles, dangereux, mal payés et dépourvus de conditions décentes que le métier de bûcheron, que ce soit chez ceux qui manient la scie à chaîne ou chez les opérateurs de débuseuse.

Devant les abus des entreprises forestières et leur manque d'implication dans le développement régional, le gouvernement fait preuve de mollesse à l'égard des compagnies quand vient le temps de faire respecter la législation et la réglementation forestières. Selon Dubois, la *Loi sur les forêts* de 1986 procure des avantages certains aux entreprises au détriment des travailleurs forestiers. Par exemple, en permettant la désyndicalisation du travail forestier, la loi a contribué à détériorer les conditions de travail en forêt. Pendant ce temps, les gouvernements, en particulier le gouvernement fédéral, s'efforcent de défendre l'image de l'industrie forestière canadienne sur les marchés internationaux. Selon Dubois, l'élaboration de la Stratégie nationale sur les forêts canadiennes (1991-1992), que le Québec n'a pas signée et dont il fut absent des délibérations, «fut une vaste entreprise de relations publiques où le développement durable devint, non pas le vrai visage de la forêt canadienne, mais un simple maquillage.» (89)

Face aux menaces qui pèsent sur la ressource forestière et aux problèmes des localités rurales, Dubois ne voit de solution que dans une action collective pour «remettre l'industrie à sa place.» (93)



Pour assurer l'avenir de la forêt, il faut, entre autres, bannir les coupes à blanc, limiter les superficies des coupes et interdire les pesticides chimiques et autres pratiques destructives. L'État doit obliger l'industrie à respecter les sous-traitants et leur main-d'oeuvre. Afin d'équilibrer le marché du bois et de le retirer du joug de l'industrie, l'État doit aussi accorder la priorité à la forêt privée pour approvisionner les usines de sciage et de pâtes et papiers et maintenir le rôle de la Régie des marchés agricoles dans la fixation du prix du bois. Enfin, il faudrait songer à adopter le modèle technologique suédois et une organisation du travail forestier semblable à ce qui se fait en Suède, où la majorité des travailleurs forestiers sont suédiqués.

L'ouvrage contient en annexe le manifeste du Collectif Forêt-intervention, un groupe d'une douzaine de forestiers et forestières qui propose de remplacer la façon dont les ressources forestières sont utilisées actuellement par un système visant l'établissement d'un régime forestier démocratique et juste, en tenant compte d'abord du bien-être de la population qui dépend de la ressource et de ce que la forêt peut raisonnablement produire.

Jean-Roch Cyr  
Université du Nouveau-Brunswick  
(Fredericton)

Jacques-Paul Couturier et Phyllis E. Le-Blanc, dir. *Économie et société en Acadie, 1850-1950* (Moncton, Éditions d'Acadie 1996).

Nicolas Landry, *Les pêches dans la péninsule acadienne, 1850-1950* (Moncton, Éditions d'Acadie 1994).

L'HISTORIOGRAPHIE acadienne connaît depuis quelques années un renouveau important. La publication d'*Économie et société en Acadie, 1850-1950* vise à mieux diffuser cette nouvelle histoire. Dirigé par Jacques-Paul Couturier et Phyllis E. Le-Blanc, l'ouvrage rassemble l'essentiel de

six thèses récentes qui représentent la diversité des champs d'études. On y retrouve à la fois des sujets déjà traités dans l'historiographie — la formation des élites, les rapports avec l'État, la colonisation — et des sujets plutôt négligés — les pêches, la migration vers la ville et l'industrie des pâtes et papiers. Couturier ajoute des textes de présentation et de conclusion en soulignant d'une part le caractère novateur des mémoires et des thèses qui transforment actuellement l'historiographie de l'Acadie et d'autre part leur faible diffusion dans la communauté historique. Une bibliographie de ces études peu connues, préparée par Mélanie Méthot, offre un outil pratique aux chercheurs. Chacun des articles comprend de plus de nombreuses notes de bas de page. Des résumés des articles et des notices biographiques des auteurs complètent l'ouvrage.

Le premier article porte sur une des composantes principales de la montée du nationalisme acadien au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle, soit la formation d'une élite locale. Les recherches de Sheila Andrew remettent en question le modèle d'une élite homogène dominant pour son profit l'ensemble de la population. Son analyse de l'origine et du profil des membres de l'élite démontre facilement que ce groupe n'est pas issu des couches les plus aisées dans société où la richesse est d'ailleurs plutôt rare. Le statut socio-économique de cette élite demeure en fait assez précaire, même dans les professions. Andrew observe qu'il n'y a pas d'unité idéologique parmi l'élite acadienne et que celle-ci ne parvient pas à dominer la population du point de vue politique. Le lecteur a parfois l'impression d'observer deux groupes aux comportements différents: des gens plus près de la base qui représentent leurs concitoyens et un groupe plus restreint qui prétend représenter et diriger l'opinion de la «nation.» Malgré les divisions sur des sujets d'ordre pratiques, le discours de l'élite restreinte (si on peut la nommer ainsi) obtient un important soutien dans la population comme le démontre l'en-

thousiasme entourant la Convention nationale acadienne de 1881. L'auteur constate néanmoins que cet enthousiasme n'implique pas l'unanimité et qu'il est plus marqué dans les régions relativement prospères où le discours axé sur l'agriculture trouve des adhérents naturels. Les recherches d'Andrew ne permettent pas de définir un nouveau modèle mais elles démontrent que tout n'a pas encore été dit sur la montée de l'élite nationaliste acadienne.

L'article principal de Jacques-Paul Couturier s'attaque à l'image courante voulant que la population acadienne vive en marge des institutions judiciaires jusqu'à la fin du XIXe siècle. L'auteur situe très bien le lecteur en présentant d'abord la perception de ces institutions, la composition du personnel — presque exclusivement anglophone — des cours de justice et le fonctionnement de l'appareil judiciaire. Puis, à partir d'une analyse exhaustive des causes civiles, Couturier conclut que la faible participation des Acadiens au système judiciaire tient plus de leur situation économique que d'une quelconque appréhension envers les institutions anglophones. Il note de plus qu'il n'y a pas nécessairement de biais anti-francophone dans le système. Les défenseurs dans les poursuites pour créances subissent généralement le même sort défavorable sans égard à l'origine ethnique. L'analyse des causes non-pécuniaires, notamment celles reliées à la propriété foncière mène à des conclusions encore plus frappantes. Couturier note que les Acadiens sont sur-représentés dans ce genre de causes et qu'ils n'hésitent pas à poursuivre d'autres Acadiens. Les comportements varient selon les localités, mais ces données démontrent que les Acadiens utilisent bel et bien les cours de justice pour régler des différends entre eux. L'auteur n'exclut pas l'existence de mécanismes d'arbitrages extra-judiciaires, mais il nous oblige certainement à revoir l'ensemble des rapports entre les Acadiens et l'État

et à réévaluer les fondements de leur marginalité politique.

C'est du côté des pêches que nous amène Nicolas Landry, en grande partie afin de remédier à l'absence d'étude globale des pêcheries acadiennes. Un ouvrage distinct, commenté plus loin, offre une description plus approfondie de cette industrie alors que sa participation au collectif vise surtout à mettre en relief l'importance des pêches dans l'économie de Caraquet à la fin du XIXe siècle. L'article conserve certains éléments de synthèse par un survol des facteurs de production et de l'évolution des prises. Landry soulève aussi, sans toutefois les explorer en détail, les problématiques de la pluriactivité économique, du système de crédit des marchands jersiais, et du déclin des compagnies jersiaises à la fin du XIXe siècle. Du côté du système de crédit, Landry décrit le phénomène d'endettement permanent des pêcheurs mais juge que la survie de la compagnie dépend de ce système. (89) En fait, c'est l'héritage global de la présence jersiaise dans la baie des Chaleurs qui est ici en cause. Landry préfère toutefois attendre les résultats d'enquêtes plus substantielles avant de se prononcer sur ce sujet. (95) Malgré la retenue de l'auteur par rapport à l'interprétation des données, l'article offre un point de départ qui nous permet de comparer les pêcheries acadiennes à celles de Terre-Neuve ou de la Gaspésie.

Jean-Roch Cyr nous transporte ensuite dans l'arrière-pays du nord du Nouveau-Brunswick que l'on tente de coloniser pendant la Dépression des années 1930. Il nous apprend d'abord qu'il s'agit d'un phénomène social très important qui touche directement 2,4 pour cent de la population néo-brunswickoise alors que la colonisation au Québec déplace 1,7 pour cent de la population. L'impact sur la population acadienne est encore plus important car ce sont les Acadiens qui font le plus grand nombre de requêtes pour de nouvelles terres. Cyr cherche d'abord à présenter les grandes lignes de ce phénomène. Il décrit et analyse les

objectifs et les actions des diverses parties impliquées dans le processus: le gouvernement fédéral, le gouvernement provincial, les municipalités, le clergé, les compagnies forestières, sans négliger les colons. L'article laisse aussi une place importante aux divers programmes, aux règlements et à leur application. Même si les projets n'ont pas atteints tous leurs objectifs, l'auteur estime que tous les participants ont su tirer profit de la colonisation car celle-ci permettaient de résoudre, du moins temporairement, certains problèmes criants de l'époque. Néanmoins, à l'instar de J.I. Little, Cyr conclut que le contrôle du territoire par les compagnies forestières, allié à l'idéologie du retour à la terre, n'a pas permis d'instituer un mode de vie économiquement viable pour les colons.

Pêcheurs, cultivateurs et bûcherons, les Acadiens sont aussi présents à la ville, notamment à Moncton. Dans son article, Phyllis E. LeBlanc s'oppose principalement au discours nationaliste, repris par de nombreux historiens, qui présente la ville comme un lieu de prolétarianisation contrôlé par les anglophones. À partir d'une analyse quantitative, l'auteure tente d'établir si les transformations économiques ont eu un impact différent selon l'appartenance linguistique. Elle nous offre d'abord une brève histoire économique de Moncton de 1870 à 1940 et une description de sa méthodologie. Le cœur de l'article est formé de l'analyse de la composition socio-professionnelle et ethnique de la main d'œuvre chez les principaux employeurs de la ville. En sélectionnant cet échantillon, LeBlanc a voulu suivre la composition de la main d'œuvre dans ces entreprises et faire ressortir l'impact des transformations dans les principaux secteurs d'activité. L'auteure constate que la transformation de l'économie locale vers les services commerciaux aurait pu être défavorable aux francophones non seulement à cause des salaires moins élevés de ce secteur par rapport aux manufactures, mais aussi à cause du peu de francophones embauchés

par Eaton. Les données démontrent en effet qu'au cours de la période étudiée, la proportion de francophones chez les principaux employeurs de la ville est en déclin constant (33 pour cent en 1911, 17 pour cent en 1938) alors que les francophones augmentent leur poids démographique pour former le tiers de la population en 1941. LeBlanc note que «le statut socio-professionnel des travailleurs varie selon l'appartenance linguistique» (144) et que «les francophones sont presque totalement absents» des catégories supérieures d'emploi chez l'Intercolonial et chez Eaton. (147) Certains francophones réussissent à gravir les plus hauts échelons de la hiérarchie socio-professionnelle, mais le tableau VII (145) démontre clairement que plus de la moitié des anglophones occupent des postes dans les trois catégories les plus élevées alors que la majorité des francophones se situent dans les trois catégories inférieures. Alors que de nombreuses différences entre les groupes ethniques ressortent de ces données, l'auteure tente parfois de mettre en évidence une participation acadienne à part entière dans l'économie et dans la société urbaine. La conclusion de l'article, qui réfère à d'autres parties de la thèse, met notamment l'accent sur la formation d'une bourgeoisie acadienne et sur la mise en place d'institutions nationales. Problème occasionné par la réduction d'une importante thèse en vingt-deux pages, le lecteur a l'impression qu'une grande partie de l'argumentation de l'auteure ne s'est pas retrouvée dans cet article.

La contribution de Nicole Lang porte sur la compagnie Fraser, une entreprise de pâtes et papiers qui domine Edmundston, petite ville du nord-ouest du Nouveau-Brunswick. Lang veut d'abord décrire comment cette entreprise familiale est devenue une corporation impersonnelle, puis analyser l'impact de cette évolution sur les employés. La première partie de l'article décrit l'évolution de la compagnie vers une intégration verticale. Elle comprend une analyse des liens entre les stratégies économiques, les structures ad-

ministratives et de l'apparition de nouveaux gestionnaires. Pour réaliser la seconde portion de l'étude, consacrée aux travailleurs, l'auteure a eu recours à une série d'entrevues d'anciens employés de l'usine, ce qui lui a permis de composer avec la rareté des sources syndicales. Fraser étant le seul employeur industriel, les employés, peu mobiles, se sont adaptés au passage du style de gestion paternaliste et autoritaire des fondateurs (Fraser, Matheson et Brebner) à celui plus impersonnel des gestionnaires et ingénieurs qui prennent l'entreprise en main à partir de 1932. L'obtention, après 20 ans d'efforts, d'une première convention collective en 1938 permet aux employés d'améliorer graduellement leurs conditions de travail et leurs salaires. Le déclin du paternalisme et la syndicalisation facilitent en fait le dialogue car les fondateurs n'acceptaient pas que leurs employés critiquent leur gestion. Très modéré puisque l'économie locale dépend largement de son employeur principal, le syndicat évite le recours à la grève. Côté linguistique, Lang note simplement que la gestion de l'entreprise est entre les mains d'anglophones alors que la main d'œuvre est en grande majorité francophone. Habile mélange de l'histoire de l'entreprise et de l'histoire des travailleurs, la contribution de Lang offre un excellent point de comparaison de l'expérience acadienne dans le secteur forestier par rapport à celle du Québec, de l'Ontario ou de la Colombie-Britannique.

Couturier et LeBlanc ont réussi à offrir aux chercheurs et aux étudiants un accès plus facile à ces études qui bouleversent la manière de faire l'histoire de l'Acadie. Notons toutefois que les recherches sur l'Acadie d'après la Déportation portent essentiellement sur le Nouveau-Brunswick, foyer principal de la population acadienne des Maritimes depuis le début du XIXe siècle. Cette histoire est aussi largement masculine. Le mémoire de Ginette Lafleur, dont un extrait fut publié dans *Moncton 1871-1929* (Moncton, Éditions d'Acadie, 1990), de-

meure une des rares contributions à l'histoire des femmes acadiennes depuis la Déportation. Signalons au passage que les lecteurs qui sont peu familiers avec la géographie du Nouveau-Brunswick chercheront en vain dans *Économie et société* une carte qui leur permettrait de situer les régions et les lieux cités dans les textes. Néanmoins, l'historiographie acadienne connaît un nouveau départ et l'expérience acadienne pourra dorénavant s'intégrer aux débats qui entourent les transformations économiques et sociales de la période 1850-1950.

Dans *Les pêches dans la péninsule acadienne, 1850-1900*, Nicolas Landry décrit en plus de détail le fonctionnement de cette industrie dont il a fourni une esquisse dans l'ouvrage précédent. Tout comme dans l'article commenté plus haut, l'auteur opte pour une approche descriptive plutôt qu'analytique. Dès le départ, une carte situe la péninsule acadienne dans l'ensemble du Nouveau-Brunswick et indique la localisation des principaux établissements de la région. L'ouvrage ne comporte pas de bibliographie mais de nombreuses notes accompagnent chacun des chapitres. Le premier chapitre offre une bonne description du contexte géographique et économique dans lequel vivent les Acadiens alors que le chapitre deux décrit les circonstances générales des pêches. Les chapitres subséquents recouvrent les différentes composantes de l'industrie: les équipements et les techniques, les marchés et les prix, la main d'œuvre, la ressource, et les différentes formes d'interventions gouvernementales. Chaque thème est ensuite subdivisé selon le type de pêche: la morue, le homard, le maquereau et le hareng.

Les chercheurs, autant ceux qui s'intéressent aux pêches que ceux qui s'intéressent à l'histoire économique acadienne, trouveront dans cet ouvrage plusieurs éléments intéressants. L'attention portée aux ressources autres que la morue offre enfin une meilleure perspective de l'ensemble de l'industrie. L'importance attachée au rôle des gouvernements, sur-

tout du gouvernement fédéral, (quatre chapitres sur dix) permet de mieux comprendre une industrie dont la gestion, comme on le sait maintenant, dépasse la simple récolte de la ressource. L'ouvrage laisse enfin une bonne place à la main d'oeuvre, tant celle qui fait la récolte que celle qui travaille à l'apprêtage.

Si l'ouvrage demeure largement descriptif, Landry définit plusieurs problématiques sur lesquels ses successeurs devront se pencher. Citons à titre d'exemple le fait que «les changements touchant les pêches se produisent toujours un peu plus vite dans le sud des Maritimes que dans la Péninsule.» (132) Landry présente les divers facteurs en cause dont l'isolement géographique, le rôle du gouvernement fédéral, l'attitude des pêcheurs et le conservatisme des compagnies jersiaises. Le poids relatif de chacun de ces facteurs reste à déterminer. Enfin, il n'est pas surprenant de constater que la pluriactivité économique est très importante chez les Acadiens de la péninsule, une autre problématique qui devra être analysée en plus de détail.

En général, parallèlement à d'autres études consacrées aux pêches et à la forêt, cet ouvrage pourra servir de base à l'élaboration d'une véritable histoire économique de l'Acadie au XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle, histoire à laquelle il faudra un jour ajouter la composante agricole.

Léon Robichaud  
Centre Canadien d'Architecture

John C. Kennedy, *People of the Bays and Headlands: Anthropological History and the Fate of Communities in the Unknown Labrador* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1995).

THIS IS AN IMPORTANT BOOK for several reasons. First, it fills a major void in the history of Labrador: describing the origins, apogée and demise of the two hundred year-old way of life of European "settlers" living in the most isolated part of the region. Second, it contributes to

many historiographical debates: such as marginality, seasonality, economic pluralism, merchant-settler relations, and leakage in merchant credit and control. Third, it provides wonderful empirical evidence on such major topics of Newfoundland history as "Resettlement" and the Grenfell Mission. In 1992 the people of southeastern Labrador numbered less than three thousand, living in eleven communities but still dispersing to 47 summer stations to fish for salmon and cod: a form of transhumance once widespread in Newfoundland.

Ostensibly the book is set within the context of economic and community changes that are threatening much of rural Eastern Canada on the one hand, and the more specific crisis posed by the 1992 moratorium on cod fishing on the other. It seeks indirectly to ask what is the future of such people and communities? Kennedy's answer ultimately is depressingly pessimistic. The decentralized "Settler" lifestyle is incompatible with the ever increasing economic and institutional tendencies to centralize services that pressure people to move to one or two rural centres where lack of employment and subsistence opportunities result in growing economic dependency. From a theoretical standpoint he argues that throughout their history the people and communities of southeastern Labrador are powerless victims of larger economic structures and forces. I am not entirely convinced by Kennedy's arguments here. Indeed he offers many examples of resistance and agency, but ultimately believes that the very things that are central to the way of life — decentralization, self-sufficiency and individualism — undermined Labradorians' ability to be effective. Perhaps if Kennedy had focused on values, beliefs, motivations and behavioural strategies rather than on structural relationships, or if he had analyzed rather than merely described the ways people adapted to, manipulated or adjusted to external forces, he might have reached a different conclusion.

This said the book has really very little to do with these larger questions and theories. It is instead a thoroughly researched, descriptive, baseline study of the origins, rise and decline of the people and communities of this remote and obscure region. This, to my mind, is its great strength. Kennedy has skilfully welded field and archival methods. One gets a real sense of "a way of life" and the people and places where this was played out. The first four chapters describe the evolution of European settlement, the central chapter outlines the essential "Settler" way of life, while the remaining four chapters chart the impact of various economic changes on this experience. Some of the changes he believes are compatible, but most he judges incompatible. The pivotal central chapter on the Settler adaptation is unfortunately far too short and lacks any formal analysis. How exactly did the various parts fit together: what was the structure and role of the informal economy? The last chapter is the least successful. It does not quite seem to fit; describing the plethora of institutions that have arisen in the last two decades to oversee government development schemes, we feel far removed from the people and communities they are designed to serve.

Much of this history is not new, but its strength lies in its meticulous detail and how extremely well it is brought together, and brought to life in the context of larger debates. There are no new archival sources used here (except possibly the Newfoundland Ranger Reports) and no original analysis of the data. Nevertheless, there are some new contributions: the role of Inuit women and illicit trade with the Americans in fostering permanent settlement — the former providing spouses, the latter supplies; and the description of a durable "Settler" way of life that involved seasonal transhumance between isolated winter homes in the inner bays (for trapping, firewood, subsistence activities and protection) and larger outer island and headland communities (for

seals, salmon and cod for sale). These latter coastal activities often took place alongside visitors from Newfoundland. Finally, the impact of the Grenfell Mission, the Labrador Development Company lumbering operation, and more recently the construction of military bases on these communities and the settler way of life has nowhere else been so clearly documented. In essence he argues, despite strong tendencies towards centralization that these developments set in motion, the people and communities could adapt so long as their ability to exploit the summer fishery and carry out crucial winter subsistence activities such as collecting firewood were not jeopardized.

Comparing the chronology and process of initial settlement in southeastern Labrador to that of the Strait of Belle Isle, I am struck not by the differences, but by the similarities. While I have no doubt that the existence of Inuit enclaves offered a potential source of spouses for would-be settlers, I find it hard to believe that this would have been an option for all potential planters. We are given no sense of the proportion of indigenous spouses among this first generation. Moreover, the timing of initial settlement (1830-1870) coincides exactly with that to the south and with the beginnings of Newfoundland stationer fishery which annually brought many families to the coast. The role and importance of the American Labrador Whale and Cod Fishery has been largely ignored and this book goes a long way in rectifying this lacuna. The evidence Kennedy puts forward that trade with American visitors "allowed many planters and former servants to gain some measure of independence and security," however, contradicts his claim that the relationship between merchants and servants — and later settlers — was one of "dominance" rather than "interdependence."

For those readers not primarily concerned with the place itself this book still has a lot to offer. The impact of the State on such communities and way of life is

painstakingly detailed — especially regarding schools, medical services, poor relief, mail and wireless and finally the Newfoundland Rangers. The similarities between the impact here and in the North as highlighted by people like Peter Usher is striking. Even richer is his description of how several non-State exogenous developments have been responsible for a reorientation away from mobile services, usually at summer locations, to centralized services on a few fixed winter settlements. Chief among these have been the centralizing tendencies of the array of institutions associated with the Grenfell Mission (especially orphanages and boarding schools), the establishment of a "modern" lumber town at Port Hope Simpson, and the establishment of several military bases. Many of these developments are similar to what has been happening to communities in the Canadian North. Greater attention to the sorts of issues and forms of analysis used here might have given this book wider appeal.

The dust cover would have us believe that this is a book about what will become of the people and communities long dependent on fishing now that the cod stocks have virtually disappeared. The book should be read for what it is: an excellent, thorough and well-contextualized baseline description of the people and communities of southeastern Labrador. This former issue is really only discussed briefly in the introduction and the conclusion. Judging it on these grounds can only do disservice to what is otherwise a fascinating and very vivid and well-told story.

Patricia A. Thornton  
McGill University

Odette Vincent (s.d.), Maurice Asselin, Benoît-Beaudry Gourd, Clément Mercier, Roland Viau, Marc Côté, Jean-Pierre Marquis, Marc Riopel, Cécile Sabourin, *Histoire de l'Abitibi-Témiscamingue* (Québec: Institut québécois de recherche sur la culture 1995).

CE SEPTIÈME ouvrage de la collection *Les régions du Québec* s'inscrit dans la lignée des précédents: volumineuse synthèse d'histoire régionale, il aborde son sujet par les aspects physiques (géologie, climat, etc.) pour ensuite traiter, de manière chronologique, des grandes périodes historiques (les Amérindiens, la colonisation et l'agriculture, l'industrialisation et l'urbanisation, la période actuelle). Il s'agit d'une véritable somme, bien documentée et bien illustrée, destinée, quelques chapitres mis à part, au grand public.

Il ne fait aucun doute que ce livre est une réussite. Reposant sur des recherches souvent inédites ainsi que sur d'abondantes statistiques, et rehaussé par des cartes d'une exceptionnelle qualité, il a en outre le mérite de proposer une intéressante réflexion sur la notion de région. L'Abitibi-Témiscamingue, en effet, est une ligne de partage non seulement entre deux eaux (comme l'indique le mot algonquin «abitibi»), mais aussi entre des cultures et des langues. Il en ressort une région aux contours fluctuants, à la population aussi composite que mouvante. L'équipe dirigée par Odette Vincent a bien rendu cet aspect des choses, dans la mesure où elle a campé la région dans le milieu plus vaste du nord québécois et ontarien. Cette diversité n'a cependant pas interdit aux auteurs de recourir à un thème unitaire. Le Nord-Ouest québécois, en effet, n'est pas seulement l'oeuvre de quelques grands politiciens, hommes d'affaires ou autre «développeurs.» Son histoire se place également sous le signe du peuple. La citation de Michelet qui ouvre l'ouvrage donne d'ailleurs le ton. Depuis les Amérindiens jusqu'aux contemporains de Richard Desjardins, il ne fait nul doute que la personnalité profonde de la région

relève plus des milieux populaires que des classes dominantes. L'ouvrage appuie fortement sur ce trait.

Et pourtant, tout dans la nature de ces lieux décourage un peuplement continu: l'isolement, le froid en hiver, les insectes en été, un réseau hydrographique tourné vers le Nord. Il est vrai que la région a peu accueilli d'habitants. En 1991, l'Abitibi-Témiscamingue ne comptait tout au plus que 160,000 habitants. Mais à défaut du nombre d'individus, la diversité des communautés est des plus remarquables.

D'abord les Amérindiens, auxquels le présent ouvrage accorde près d'une centaine de pages (sans compter maints passages dans les chapitres consacrés aux populations d'origine européenne). Dans une langue parfois trop technique, il est longuement question des premières traces de leur présence, de leurs modes de vie, de leurs déplacements et de leurs guerres. Puis la colonisation par les Européens, dont les véritables débuts ont lieu à partir du dernier tiers du XIXe siècle, avec notamment l'aide de religieux tels que les Oblats. C'est le Témiscamingue qui s'ouvre en tout premier, dès les années 1860, grâce au système d'exploitation agroforestier. Toutefois, cette colonisation ne favorise pas tant la multiplication de petits villages que la formation précoce de localités densément peuplées. Cela s'explique sans doute par le fait que le processus est en bonne partie le fruit à la fois de décisions politiques (plans Gordon, Vautrin, etc.) et d'investissements industriels, ce qui provoque un peuplement par à-coups. L'agriculture suit, mais de façon limitée. C'est la forêt (dans le Témiscamingue) et, au tournant du siècle, les mines de cuivre et d'or (en Abitibi) qui assurent la plus grande part du démarrage économique de la région. Les mines, en particulier, attirent une population aux origines diversifiées, quoique majoritairement francophone. En plus des anglophones, viennent en effet des Ukrainiens et des Finlandais, ainsi que des membres d'autres communautés, en nombre plus restreint toutefois. Ces popula-

tions sont encadrées dès le départ par des institutions religieuses, ce qui a pour effet d'accroître les solidarités ethniques (de même que les tensions interethniques, notamment à partir des années 1930). Jusqu'en 1950, les entreprises minières et forestières et les institutions religieuses ont prospéré en Abitibi-Témiscamingue. Mais à partir de cette année, le développement régional se met à ralentir. Le Nord minier ne génère plus une croissance assurant celle de la population. Certes, les investissements étrangers s'accroissent, mais ils ne parviennent pas à enrayer la progression du chômage, car ils visent avant tout la modernisation de l'outillage et non pas l'extension des activités. Et si de nouveaux sites d'exploitation sont ouverts, plus au nord, en revanche d'autres sont fermés au sud. La présence de l'État, en particulier dans le tertiaire, s'accroît dans les années 1970, pour cependant plafonner la décennie suivante. Et encore, elle ne suffit pas pour freiner l'exode vers le Sud et l'Ontario. Quant aux tentatives locales de reprendre en main l'économie, elles n'ont pas la capacité voulue face à l'effort demandé. La dépendance à l'extérieur de l'extérieur s'alourdit. La situation actuelle n'est donc guère florissante, mais la volonté de survivre n'en est pas moins forte.

En effet, l'Abitibi-Témiscamingue refuse le déclin. Dès les années 1930, apparaissent des chantiers forestiers coopératifs, auxquels feront écho l'expérience communautaire de Guyenne, que l'ouvrage évoque à maintes reprises, et, plus récemment, des entreprises sous contrôle local comme Tembec et ARDA. Les organisations d'entraide se multiplient après 1950. Par ailleurs, autre signe de cette volonté de survivre, la région affiche son originalité sur les plans politique et culturel. En votant CCF et Crédit social, elle accueille des partis politiques issues de l'Ouest canadien et peu populaires au Québec. Il en est de même sur le plan musical, avec le style fortement «western» qui inspire maints artistes du coin. Ajoutons, dans cette lignée, une vie



locale très colorée, dont les auteurs, par excès de pudeur, ne font pas suffisamment état. Il n'aurait pas été mauvais d'en dire davantage sur des endroits comme le notoire Paris Valley. La prédominance numérique des hommes sur les femmes en Abitibi-Témiscamingue n'est sans doute pas étranger à la forte animation dans de tels lieux. Toutefois, comme le montre bien le livre, la part des femmes, notamment dans la vie associative et les services liés à la santé, fut loin d'être négligeable.

Par ailleurs la région entretient des liens profonds avec le nord de l'Ontario. Faut-il rappeler que ce n'est qu'en 1898 que l'Abitibi est rattachée au Québec? Au XXe siècle, la région subit des tiraillements linguistiques qui la rapprochent des villes minières de la province voisine. Son économie est plus orientée vers Toronto que vers Montréal. En outre, sa vie sociale et économique fait écho à celle de l'agglomération de Sudbury (telle qu'analysée par l'équipe de C.M. Wallace et A. Thomson dans *Sudbury, Rail Town to Regional Capital* [Toronto 1993]): on y retrouve, en effet, les mêmes contrastes entre le rural et le minier, la même diversité ethnique, les mêmes conflits entre communistes et anti-communistes au sein des populations finlandaises et ukrainiennes, la même conjoncture gréviste, les mêmes interventions étatiques à partir des années 1960-70, les mêmes frustrations face au Sud et les mêmes volontés de se reprendre en main pour contrer le déclin.

Évidemment, un ouvrage d'une telle ampleur n'est pas sans défauts. Certains chapitres sont trop exclusivement descriptifs, voire scolaires et leur lecture en devient fastidieuse. Il y a beaucoup de répétitions d'un chapitre à l'autre, et souvent de l'essoufflement devant la matière à couvrir. Cette hyperdescription manque parfois de regard critique. On passe trop rapidement sur la xénophobie d'un Réal Caouette, que l'on présente de manière édulcorée. La Galerie des célébrités nées dans la région, au chapitre 14, finit par lasser. Par ailleurs, il existe des trous gênants. L'étude des services sanitaires,

si elle rend justice au rôle crucial joué par les infirmières, passe toutefois sous silence l'évolution des structures hospitalières et de la profession médicale. Les communautés non francophones font l'objet d'un traitement insuffisant compte tenu de leur poids. Il en est de même de bien des pratiques culturelles, et notamment du religieux, où l'on se cantonne aux institutions et aux membres des congrégations. Enfin, il existe un contraste excessif dans la narration entre les deuxième et troisième parties, c'est-à-dire entre les périodes avant et après 1950: d'un côté, en effet, nous avons de valeureux pionniers, débrouillards et courageux, et de l'autre, des victimes malheureuses et exploitées. Sans doute aurait-il fallu mieux harmoniser la présentation.

Au total, cependant, ces faiblesses n'atténuent ni l'intérêt ni la portée de ce livre, qui demeure une belle illustration de recherche collective.

Denis Goulet  
Christine Hudon  
Pierre Lanthier

Jeremy Mouat, *Roaring Days: Rossland's Mines and the History of British Columbia* (Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press 1995).

FOR DECADES at least Canadian and American historians have been posing questions that require comparisons between the historical experiences of their own and other nations. The requirement is more often implicit than stated, but concepts of Canadian or American exceptionalism become meaningless without at least a few passing references to Europe or other new-worlds — Australia, Brazil, or South Africa — or to one another. Did other settler societies behave as those of the Western Hemisphere did, and did the settlers of Canada behave like those of the United States? Did other industrializing nations, new or old, experience the same profound social class tensions, and did

the tensions manifest themselves in the same way in Canada and the United States?

It was with some of these comparative issues in mind that I began Jeremy Mouat's book on Rossland. Rossland was a Western Canadian mining town with immigrant workers (including, I assumed, some Catholic Irish). I had dozens of questions. Was Rossland as rowdy as an American mining town? Was it as violent? Would worker activism and protest be similar to that in the United States? What about the adjustments to and by immigrant workers? Would the mine barons be as litigious as their Yankee counterparts? Would mining land hunger involve the same dispossession of the native peoples as it did in the Black Hills? Would the Canadian authorities, both national and provincial, attempt by law to foreclose on American economic adventurism? Would Rossland's miners form ethnic-occupational enclaves as they did in Butte? If they did none of these things, why not? From such comparative questions we learn more about both Canadian and American history.

With the exception of some frustratingly brief discussions of the relative serenity of Rossland compared to, say, Bodie or Tombstone, Mouat supplies no information on any of these issues. He does discuss the provincial and national response to freebooting American capitalists in Rossland, but not in the context of "colonial" or "post-colonial" self-construction and with no comparative analysis.

Maybe I should have read his title more carefully. He intended a book about Rossland and the making of *British Columbia*, not Rossland in the context of Western hemispheric mining towns, and the first rule of reviewing is never criticize an author for not doing what he/she never intended to do. But Mouat does not make a very convincing case that Rossland had much at all to do with the making of British Columbia. In fact, he

never really says what he thinks Rossland had to do with making the province.

The book is only 160 pages long. It needs a better reason for being. As it stands, it poses no central problem; it never answers the question, "What's the point?" And there was a point that begged to be made: The history of Rossland was different from/the same as that of American mining towns and this is why.

Maybe Mouat omitted the "American angle" as a declaration of Canadian historical independence. Why not, then, use the histories of other mining towns — Australian, for example, if Mouat doesn't like American — to establish a model against which to compare Rossland? Or use Rossland as the model against which to compare them.

As it stands, Mouat has given us a brief history of a British Columbia mining town that itself had a brief history. He does an adequate job of it, but I speak for those historians of labour, immigration, the diasporic Irish, indigenous people, working-class communities, mining, western expansion, and violence and public order, in expressing my disappointment that he did not read some books and articles on other times and other places to make those times and places a part of this story.

David M. Emmons  
University of Montana

José Igartua, *Arvida au Saguenay. Naissance d'une ville industrielle* (Montréal: McGill-Queen's University Press 1996).

CETTE SYNTHÈSE sur l'histoire des travailleurs d'une grande entreprise industrielle québécoise des années 1925-1940 s'inscrit dans le courant de plus en plus riche des études sur les travailleurs industriels, les entreprises qui les emploient, les localités et régions qui les abritent et enfin les caractéristiques de leur mobilité. Fondé sur des sources originales, tant de l'entreprise (fichier d'embauche et de gestion du personnel, documents du ser-

vice immobilier et études diverses) que d'institutions régionales (paroisse, municipalité, et notamment ses rôles d'évaluation), l'ouvrage de José Igartua présente une vue dynamique et structurée des travailleurs de l'usine d'Arvida, aussi bien au travail, qu'à la ville et dans leur famille, sans oublier dans leur organisation syndicale et lors de la grève de 1941.

Un premier chapitre («Le royaume du Saguenay») évoque les débuts de la mise en valeur des sites hydroélectriques du Saguenay (Ile-Maligne et Chute-à-Caron) par James B. Duke en association avec William Price au début, puis avec Arthur Vining Davis de l'Alcoa (les deux premières lettres de chaque partie de son nom désigneront d'ailleurs Arvida), situés dans le contexte du développement démographique et économique du Saguenay-Lac-Saint-Jean. Le second aborde la construction par la compagnie de la ville d'Arvida selon ses plans d'urbanisme, une ville de compagnie dirigée par ses cadres en vertu d'une charte municipale sur mesure, dotée d'activités sportives et culturelles également organisées par ses employés et contrôlée socialement par les églises, catholique surtout, appuyées financièrement par la compagnie. Les archives paroissiales mettent clairement en lumière leurs rapports étroits autant que les efforts de l'Église catholique de prendre en main une population d'origines diverses encore mal enracinée.

Deux chapitres dégagent ensuite les caractéristiques de la main-d'oeuvre et constituent autant d'études serrées, dans le premier cas, de l'embauche des travailleurs (recrutement) ou des cessations d'emploi (départs volontaires ou congédiements) à partir des fiches d'embauche de l'Alcan et de diverses techniques statistiques sophistiquées (régression linéaire et analyse de classification multiple), pas aussi révélatrices toutefois que l'auteur l'aurait souhaité et très hermétiques pour une forte majorité des lecteurs potentiels. Par ce moyen, Igartua cherche à cerner les facteurs explicatifs

des mouvements de la main-d'oeuvre, reflétant les stratégies d'embauche des travailleurs par l'Alcan en fonction de ses besoins par secteurs dominants d'activité et de la répartition ethnique et géographique recherchée, nettement entravée par les limites de la disponibilité régionale de travailleurs. Il cherche à cerner aussi les facteurs impliqués dans la persévérance de l'emploi et la constitution d'un «noyau fondateur» de travailleurs stables. Il fait ressortir nettement les deux phases intensives d'embauche lors de la construction et de la reprise économique de la seconde moitié des années 1930, lesquelles encadrent le creux de la grande dépression avec des effets très prononcés. Dans le second cas, Igartua aborde le travail en usine, d'abord en décrivant conjointement les «secteurs de travail» et les métiers ou professions qui s'y rattachent, puis sommairement les méthodes rudimentaires et rapide de formation des travailleurs, ensuite les conditions de travail (milieu de travail, accidents) et finalement les salaires et le niveau de vie (le coût du logement essentiellement).

Un autre chapitre exploite systématiquement les rôles d'évaluation d'Arvida pour étudier l'habitat urbain et la formation de quartiers dans la ville («quartier des anglais» et «quartier ouvrier»), la répartition des ménages et des familles par quartiers et catégories socio-professionnelles (illustrés par d'intéressants plans schématiques de la ville), les modes d'occupation des logements et notamment la cohabitation et finalement le roulement et la stabilité des ménages. Igartua introduit dans ce portrait les variables ethniques et religieuses, dans le contexte d'une localité et d'une entreprise passablement diversifiées à ce titre, du moins au début. Il observe également des itinéraires individuels qui, sans prétendre à la représentativité, confirment la complexité de situations difficiles à synthétiser. La démarche amorcée présente un fort potentiel cependant, surtout avec un couplage plus systématique encore

avec le fichier des employés et le fichier de la population saguenayenne.

Le chapitre suivant réalise une étude des comportements démographiques des travailleurs de l'Alcan et de leurs familles, à partir du couplage du fichier des employés et du fichier sur la population saguenayenne de l'IREP. Même si la courte période d'observation, la diversité d'origine des travailleurs et leur grande mobilité rendent difficile la couverture complète des 6200 travailleurs fichés, le relevé rejoint une forte proportion des couplages possibles (1400 sur environ 1700) des employés de l'Alcan (plus de 80%). Le mariage, la naissance, la fécondité des couples, l'origine géographique et par catégories professionnelles des pères à l'embauche, les cohortes de mariages d'avant 1929, les âges au mariage, les intervalles protogénésiques, les taux de fécondité des femmes et la taille des familles retiennent principalement l'attention, comparés fréquemment au portrait régional.

Les deux derniers chapitres comportent, d'une part, une histoire assez classique du syndicalisme au Saguenay servant de contexte à la fondation d'un syndicat catholique à l'Alcan en 1937 et, d'autre part, une histoire de la grève de 1941 à l'Alcan, de son déroulement et des facteurs qui en expliquent l'éclosion «spontané» malgré l'interdiction en vigueur pendant la guerre. Même si l'accent y est mis sur la dimension syndicale, les rapports sont éloquentes avec le milieu arvidien et les conditions de recrutement de la main-d'oeuvre.

L'ouvrage constitue l'aboutissement de recherches à long terme, qui ont déjà suscité plusieurs communications et publications, et une consolidation de la plupart d'entre elles. Assez curieusement toutefois, la répartition de la main-d'oeuvre par catégories professionnelles amorcée dans «La mobilité professionnelle...» *Labour/Le Travail*, 20 (automne 1987) n'est pas reprise, ni développée dans l'ouvrage. Tenant compte des importants travaux de l'IREP sur la question, con-

crétisés récemment dans l'ouvrage de Gérard Bouchard, *Tous les métiers du monde: le traitement des données professionnelles en histoire sociale*. (PUL, 1996), il aurait été intéressant (et le serait certainement dans une étape ultérieure du projet) de voir cette dimension approfondie dans le contexte d'une grande entreprise industrielle, greffée à une région essentiellement agro-forestière. Enfin, toute la seconde moitié de l'ouvrage ne semble pas avoir fait l'objet de publication antérieure.

La présentation demeure dépouillée et l'appareil des références plutôt simplifié. Un bloc d'illustrations inséré entre l'introduction et le premier chapitre nous fait vivre visuellement en une vingtaine d'images les grands traits des chapitres qui suivent, une innovation très intéressante. Cet ouvrage rejoint à la fois les questions ouvrières et syndicales, démographiques, sociales et urbaines, ethniques, économiques et sociales (l'entreprise et sa main-d'oeuvre). Au total, cette exploration diversifiée du monde des travailleurs de l'Alcan les suit à l'usine, à la ville, dans leurs familles et dans leur action sociale. Une étude à lire absolument pour tous ceux qui s'intéressent à l'une ou l'autre de ces voies de recherche.

Marc Vallières  
Université Laval

Mercedes Steedman, Peter Suschnigg, and Dieter K. Buse, eds., *Hard Lessons: The Mine Mill Union in the Canadian Labour Movement* (Toronto and Oxford: Dundurn Press 1995).

THE 1980S and 1990s have been hard times for organized labour, particularly in the private sector where rates of unionization have declined significantly. This context presents the labour movement with new challenges. *Hard Lessons* is a timely book in that it offers commentary on the legal, economic, and political situation which workers face and an assess-

ment of the contribution of smaller, alternative unions to the labour movement in Canada.

The book grew out of a conference held in May 1993 at Laurentian University in Sudbury to commemorate the centennial of the Canadian Union of Mine, Mill and Smelter Workers. Mine Mill was one of the most successful of the independent Canadian unions and as such its story is important in its own right. The origins of the union lay in the western Federation of Miners. At the height of its success in the 1950s Mine Mill had over one hundred thousand members in fifty locals. But Mine Mills' history is also significant at this point in time for the lessons it may offer regarding the potential and limitations of smaller alternative unions. Ironically, the celebration of 100 years of independent trade unionism also marked the end of this particular tradition. In August of that year the last Mine Mill Local, 598 of Sudbury, voted to merge with the CAW.

The book consists of 21 chapters and is divided into 8 parts. As is often the case with collections that have their origin in a conference, it is something of an eclectic mix. The fact that the conference participants included academics and union activists adds to the varied nature of the contributions. Chapters written as serious academic arguments complete with extensive endnotes, such as Eric Tucker's history of labour law, are soon followed by a transcription of a panel discussion among former union activists. Despite the book's title, there are actually only 3 chapters (1, 6 and 11) which focus specifically on Mine Mill. Another chapter (19) which deals with the cultural work of Weir Reid discusses aspects of Local 598's history but only as a backdrop to Reid's biography.

Articles by John O'Grady, Bryan Palmer, Charlotte Yates, Eric Tucker, and Dieter Buse provide academic perspectives on the place of smaller alternative unions in the labour movement (Palmer), Weir Reid's contribution to the building

of a formal working-class culture through his work as a recreation director for Mine Mill Local 598 (Buse), the legal and labour market difficulties faced by the labour movement today (O'Grady, Tucker), and the organizational and political dilemmas that arise when unions such as the CAW merge with other unions from non-auto sectors of the economy (Yates). Jean-Claude Parrot and Madeleine Parent offer perspectives from the view point of activists on the nature of the current situation confronting labour and what needs to be done. Other chapters deal with everything from how the increase in women's participation in the labour market introduces new issues into labour organizing, to an exposé of past-Tory governments' collusion with employers in health and safety legislation and enforcement, to the impact of technological change on the workplace.

Despite the diversity within the collection, several subjects run through or form the backdrop to many of the papers. One is that small alternative unions have had a greater commitment to democracy and dedication to the interests of their members than the large, often US-based internationals. Another is the active community involvement of Mine Mill and the significance of community contributions, especially by the wives of workers, often organized into "Ladies Auxiliaries," to the union's success. The competition between Mine Mill and the Steelworkers for the Sudbury mining workforce is a theme common to many of the contributions. And finally, the wisdom or not of the imminent merger with the CAW is directly or indirectly addressed in several of the articles.

Given that the conference was held to celebrate Mine Mill's centenary, it is not surprising that there is less critical assessment of the controversies, successes and failures that marked Mine Mill's history than one would like. Those who seek thematic and stylistic consistency may find the eclecticism of the collection disconcerting. Use of the book also may be lim-

ited by the fact it is not easily pigeon-holed as either serious academic or popular history. This would be unfortunate, however, because overall the book does contain a lot of interesting information and analyses of the situation facing the union movement, especially smaller alternative unions, at this point in time. Behind the particular debates about the struggles between Mine Mill and the Steelworkers, Mine Mills' ultimately failed attempt to create a formal workers' culture, and the merger with the CAW are issues of fundamental importance to the labour movement. Balancing the need for grassroots democracy and responsiveness to and involvement with local communities, with concerns about economies of scale and access to economic and other resources is not easily accomplished. *Hard Lessons* has the merit of providing what may be considered first hand data in the form of past and present union activists' perspectives on these questions, expressed in their own words, and second level analyses of some of these concerns by professional historians and social scientists.

I came home from viewing the film "Margaret's Museum" to read the last short chapter by labour activist, musician and performer Utah Phillips. Phillips recounts how and why he brought some of Joe Hill's ashes with him to the conference. These two examples of a kind of veneration of the relics of individuals who may be considered saints of labour were a reminder of how important memory and symbols are to successful social and political movements. The most important contribution of *Hard Lessons* may be that it will help maintain the memory of an organization which for many stands as an important symbol of a tradition of democratic, community-oriented, and activist unionism.

Thomas Dunk  
Lakehead University

Suzanne Morton, *Ideal Surroundings: Domestic Life in a Working-Class Suburb in the 1920s* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1995).

GENDER HISTORIANS are challenging the way we think about, and understand, the lives of working people. In a special 1993 edition of the American journal *Labor History*, Elizabeth Faue and Alice Kessler-Harris established a framework within which to explore the relationship between gender history and labour history. Faue defines gender as "the social knowledge of manhood and womanhood and the ways that institutions and individuals employ this knowledge," Kessler-Harris as "the socially shaped cluster of attributes, expectations, and behaviors assigned to different sexes." Kessler-Harris's observations on the relationship between gender and class are particularly interesting. Along with, and like, class, she argues, gender "provides the normative and ideational boundaries within which people choose to identify themselves and to act." But to understand the relationship between class and gender, labour historians must first "lay seige" to the idea "that the male-centered workplace is the locus from which the identity, social relations and consciousness of working people ultimately emanates." Instead, they should think systematically about the gendered role of class formation in the household.

*Ideal Surroundings*, Suzanne Morton's study of domestic life in a Halifax suburb in the 1920s, fits comfortably into the framework outlined by Faue and Kessler-Harris: it explores working-class history from the perspective of gender, and it focuses on the home, the family, and the community rather than the workplace. The community that Morton selected is Richmond Heights, a 325-acre section of north Halifax devastated by the Halifax Harbour explosion of 1917 but reconstructed under the direction of the Halifax Relief Commission. The reconstruction offered a unique opportunity to

see inside a predominantly working-class suburb through the records generated in the 1920s by the Relief Commission, including documents relating to rental property and pensions. Lacking census manuscript records, Morton also examined the economic and social character of the neighbourhood through an impressive array of other textual sources, ranging from city directories and newspapers to wills and the records of voluntary associations. When community-level analysis was beyond the scope of her sources, she included data for the city as a whole.

The book explores the meaning of gender by comparing ideal notions of masculinity and femininity with the reality of lived experience. It does so for a period when deindustrialization was limiting economic growth in Halifax and the surrounding region, and when mass, or commercial, culture was penetrating the lives of working people. Not surprisingly, Morton finds elements of both continuity and change in the gender ideals of Richmond Heights residents. The "basic household gender ideals remained constant," she suggests, "with married men assigned to the role of breadwinner and married women responsible for household management and mothering." Yet, this "rigidity appeared to conflict with an emerging mass culture" of flappers and fashion and commercial fun. Economic change undermined the ability of men to sustain their roles as breadwinners and triggered a "local crisis of masculinity" that led men to retreat further into their traditional masculine roles, isolating women from the mainstream of a male-centered working-class culture. Reinforced by the influence of mass culture — which emphasized as a source of values consumption over production, the home over the workplace, and female-centered over male-centered space — the "exclusion of women from mainstream working-class culture along the lines of skill and gender ... weakened the entire class." (153-5)

At its core *Ideal Surroundings* exhibits a tension between two different approaches to the study of gender, one social, the other cultural. The book is structured around Morton's economic and social analysis of life in Richmond Heights. After identifying the "values" of respectable working people at the beginning of the book, Morton explores the relationship between ideals and reality through chapters organized according to the life cycle. This approach adds age to the mix of class and gender as categories of analysis, though the focus remains very much on the latter. The chapter on "Elderly Men and Women" offers useful insights into the different meaning of gender identity in youth and old age, and suggests that the dependency and vulnerability shared by older men and women made gender less relevant to the way that they — as opposed to younger people — lived. The chapter on "Husbands and Wives, Fathers and Mothers" explores the domestic lives of married men and women in a decade of uncertainty and change. In "Single Mothers and Female Household Heads," Morton shows how the ideal of a male family wage assigned to widows and abandoned women an existence of poverty and unemployment. In "Men" she effectively draws upon a growing literature about masculinity to find that "age-old [masculine] characteristics of strength and skill" were being replaced in the 1920s by "a new kind of manhood based on the [man's] ability to support a family." (130)

The final chapter most fully engages the subject of commercial culture and the corrosive effect that mass culture had on the class identities of young women. Here Morton concludes that a "masculine working-class culture as it had evolved was unable to incorporate the parade of young women composed of stenographers, clerks, waitresses, and telephone operators into its mainstream ... it was this parade of high heels and silk stockings that led the Canadian working class farther into the world of mass culture and

homogenous consumption." (150) In other words, mass culture eroded the class identity of working women, creating a relationship between consumerism and class that was fundamentally antagonistic. While more suggestive than definitive, Morton's analysis of the links between class, gender, and consumerism is provocative, and one of the highlights of the book.

Curiously, Morton does not include a chapter on children, arguing that children did not participate in the creation of gender ideals. Yet, as Reinhard Seider shows in a superb study of "Childhood experiences in Viennese working-class families around 1900" (*Continuity and Change*), recollections of childhood can reveal much about the gendered characteristics of men and women in their roles as parents. Morton did interview two women who were children in the 1920s, and both contacts usefully illuminated the subject of gender relations in Richmond Heights. A chapter on children would have enriched the book's analysis of working-class family life and encouraged fuller use of the technique of oral history.

In addition, while the book is most provocative and the issue of gender most sharply engaged when Morton explores the cultural dimensions of gender, such as the meaning of hunting and fishing to the identity of men as "men", or the meaning of being a "June bride" to young women, too often gender disappears into a detailed discussion of objective social data. Thus, while Morton's definition of gender emphasizes the dynamic "process" by which masculine and feminine identities were "constructed" (6), in practice much of the book's life-cycle analysis has a static quality that more describes social condition than analyzes cultural construction. The problem forces readers to think about the value of studying a concept that is fundamentally cultural from a social perspective. In this sense *Ideal Surroundings*, one of the first three volumes published by the University of Toronto Press in its new "Studies in Gender and His-

tory" series, raises an important methodological question about the field of gender history.

Robert A.J. McDonald  
University of British Columbia

Donald H. Avery, *Reluctant Host: Canada's Response to Immigrant Workers, 1896-1994* (Toronto: McClelland and Stewart 1995).

DONALD AVERY'S *Reluctant Host* focuses primarily on the effects of labour, ethnic, political and bureaucratic pressure groups on Canada's immigration and refugee policies. Avery situates his analysis within the international context by relating immigration policy to foreign policy and by comparing Canadian policies to those of other countries, especially the United States. But as he tells us in his introduction, this is not simply a history of immigration policy: *Reluctant Host* also considers the living and working conditions of immigrant workers in Canada and the response of immigrants to their treatment by the host society. Avery is especially interested in immigrant protest expressed through radical unions and political parties, and in the attempt by the Canadian state to control such "dangerous foreigners."

The ambitious scope of *Reluctant Host* is best illustrated by the impressive range of sources on which Avery relies. He marshals a variety of primary sources, including the records of the Departments of Immigration, Justice, External Affairs; the papers of various politicians and civil servants involved in the making of immigration policy; the records and publications of a large number of groups that attempted to influence this policy, including the Canadian Manufacturers' Association, the Canadian Congress of Labour, various ethnic and religious organizations, and professional associations such as the Canadian Medical Association. Avery also studies the coverage of immigration in Canada's leading newspa-



pers and the reports of the commissions established to consider the question of immigration. Finally, he makes use of numerous published and unpublished secondary studies on immigration that have appeared in the last few decades.

Avery's analysis of the tensions between the needs of Canada's capitalist labour market (employers in the resource sector, agriculture and manufacturing in particular), the objectives of organized labour and professional associations and the fears of nativist groups, is consistently excellent. It was in this area that his first book, *Dangerous Foreigners* (1979) broke new ground. Avery challenged earlier works that suggested that most of the Europeans who arrived in Canada before the Great Depression settled on the land. He focused instead on the reliance of mining, lumbering, harvesting and railroad construction on unskilled, transient immigrant labourers who were the only ones prepared to put up with the irregular pay, high accident rates, crude living conditions and isolation that characterized these types of work. The indispensability of such workers for the Canadian economy led the government to override nativist objections to immigration from southern and eastern Europe. Significant sections of *Dangerous Foreigners*, updated and revised, are incorporated into *Reluctant Host*. But while the earlier work was concerned with European immigrant workers, *Reluctant Host* includes a chapter on the place of Asian workers in British Columbia prior to World War II. Because immigrants from Asia were the most exploited of the immigrant labourers and their presence in Canada aroused the greatest hostility, the new chapter allows Avery to bring sharply into focus the conflict between capitalist employers seeking cheap labour, organized labour fearful of competition, and nativists bent on the exclusion of "unassimilable" Asian immigrants, and to demonstrate that at times racism prevailed over the demands of large employers in shaping immigration policy.

By extending the analysis of immigration policy through the early 1990s Avery is able to show that Canada continued to rely on immigrant labourers to fill seasonal, low paying jobs in mining and agriculture in particular. His long-range analysis, however, also points to significant changes in the country's immigration needs. The economy of post-war Canada required more professional, technical, managerial and other highly trained workers than the country was producing. The migration of well-educated Canadians to the United States, moreover, increased the need to fill these labour requirements through immigration. It was above all in the interest of recruiting such workers from abroad that criteria of education and training replaced race, colour and religion in the selection of immigrants during the 1960s. The decrease in xenophobia and racism as a consequence of World War II and pressure from increasingly influential ethnic lobbies also contributed to the establishment of these new, universalistic criteria for selecting immigrants. But if new immigration needs allowed some formerly excluded groups to come to Canada, they also created new tensions within the country. The aims of those who argued that Canada now required skilled, educated immigrants, clashed with the objectives of some ethnic lobbies intent on maintaining the sponsorship system that allowed them to bring their relatives to Canada regardless of their qualifications.

In keeping with his sophisticated analysis of the complex forces that shaped immigration policy, Avery attempts to show the role of humanitarianism, economic self-interest, racism and security considerations in shaping Canada's refugee policies. The value of Avery's comparative approach is evident here. The ongoing debates over policy can only be fully understood in the international context: the great increase in the number of asylum seekers from the Third World in recent years and the increasing stringency of selection in western Europe

and the United States help to explain the growing anxieties over Canada's relatively generous refugee policies. Avery's analysis of the resistance of such groups as the Canadian Labour Congress, the Inter-Church Committee for Refugees, the Canadian Jewish Congress, the Canadian Hispanic Congress, and the Canadian Civil Liberties Association to attempts to restrict the volume and composition of the refugee flow to Canada, however, offers an important reminder that not all Canadians agree with the restrictive refugee policies introduced by the Mulroney government.

Understandably, given the main focus of the book, the responses of immigrant workers to their conditions of work and residence occupy a far less important place in *Reluctant Host* than do Canadian responses to immigrants. But while Avery's attempt to be comprehensive by considering the immigrants' perspective is commendable, this is the least satisfactory part of a book otherwise impressive in the range and sophistication of its analysis. The description of living and working conditions helps to explain why Canadians disdained certain jobs that immigrant labourers and domestics took and why employers found it necessary to seek workers from abroad. But this theme is treated unevenly through the book — we are told little about the conditions of immigrants after about 1950. Similarly, the responses of immigrants to the conditions they encountered in Canada are considered only for a small part of the period covered by the book. Avery explains why some immigrant workers joined radical unions and political parties such as the Industrial Workers of the World, the Canadian Socialist Party, and the Social Democratic Party prior to World War I, but this theme is not pursued in the discussions of the immigrant experience in the interwar and post-World War II periods. Admittedly, Avery's interest in this subject seems to have been elicited by the anxieties that immigrant radicalism created among Canadians and by the great

efforts expended by the state to stem this radicalism. After World War II the influence of radicals within immigrant communities apparently declined, and efforts to prevent communists from entering Canada overshadowed concerns with radicalism within immigrant communities in Canada. But since the subject of immigrant protest is introduced, it would certainly have been worth considering the reasons for the decline in immigrant radicalism in post-war Canada. Was it the result of the establishment of the welfare state and the more general "taming" of the Canadian working class? Was it a sign of the greater integration of immigrants into Canadian society through labour unions and political parties? Did it reflect the greater presence and influence of skilled and educated immigrants and of second and third generations within ethnic communities?

Carmela Patrias  
Brock University

Reg Whitaker and Gary Marcuse, *Cold War Canada: The Making of a National Insecurity State, 1945-1957* (Toronto: University of Toronto Press 1995).

THIS COMPREHENSIVE study, which combines the talents of political scientist Reg Whitaker and freelance writer Gary Marcuse, is now the definitive study of the impact of the Cold War on Canadian society prior to 1960. Not surprisingly, their saga begins with the 5 September 1945 defection of Igor Gouzenko, an obscure Red Army cypher clerk at the Soviet Embassy in Ottawa. The next 110 pages systematically analyze how a select group of high ranking civil servants and cabinet ministers attempted to deal with this unique threat to Canada's national security, culminating in the creation of the Royal Commission on Espionage and the subsequent treason trials, while Lester B. Pearson and his liberal internationalist colleagues at External Affairs were busy

defining Canada's role within the evolving US-British anti-Soviet alliance.

Whitaker and Marcuse join a long list of critics who have condemned the proceedings of the RC Espionage as representing, in the words of civil libertarian John George Diefenbaker, a violation of "every vestige of those things we regard as essential to the preservation of the liberty of the subject." (69) But their critique has two great advantages: the benefit of a rich body of secondary literature, as well as the memoirs and papers of many of the participants; and their own ability to utilize the Access to Information Act to obtain a wide range of classified government documents, including reports of the Royal Canadian Mounted Police Security Service. This latter material is used with devastating effect when describing how the "Mounties" harassed suspected communists whether they were civil servants subject to security clearance, former members of "progressive" organizations such as the Canadian Association of Scientific Workers, or activists within the Canadian peace movement. Even worse was the RCMP's enthusiasm for sharing their poorly documented suspicions with the US Federal Bureau of Investigation — information which was often passed on to professional anti-communist witch-hunters such as Senators Joseph McCarthy and William Jenner, and their clones in the House Committee on Un-American Activities.

The authors deeply resent the willingness of the Liberal elite, especially External Affairs mandarins Lester Pearson and Norman Robertson, and Defence Minister Brooke Claxton, for accepting "an American Cold War definition," and of facilitating the intrusion of "McCarthyism" into Canadian society. Nor do they accept the argument that Canada's secret system of "institutionalized anonymous informing upon the private lives and beliefs of civil servants," (171) was morally superior or personally less damaging than the US public loyalty enquiries. The best that

could be said was that "Canada practised only restricted witch-hunting." (187)

Inevitably, a book of this scope has some sections which sparkle more than others. For this reviewer, at least, the most interesting and revealing topics were those dealing with the Royal Commission on Espionage and its legacy; the persecution of diplomat Herbert Norman, film maker John Grierson and "peacenik" Reverend James Endicott; the strange symbiotic relationship between the RCMP and the CCF/NDP. Special venom is reserved for "the zealotry with which Cold War social democrats carried the anti-Communist fight, especially in the crucial trade union movement," (267) where, the authors claim, "Canada came closest to McCarthyism." (267) Yet it could be argued that between 1948 and 1957 the CCF was fighting for its very existence against powerful political and corporate enemies, vulnerable to the Red smear particularly in Québec where premier Maurice Duplessis had branded the party as "the vestibule" of Communism." (306)

While some readers might find the continued reference to US developments somewhat disconcerting, I felt that this attempt to place major events of the period within a broader context was quite effective. One might question, however, whether too much emphasis was placed on US trends and on American-Canadian relations, and not enough on Canada's participation in British defence planning between 1945 and 1957. Another small flaw is the authors' somewhat ambivalent assessment of the liberal internationalist mandarins, in general, and foreign minister Lester B. Pearson, in particular. For example, in the section dealing with the Canadian peace movement during the Korean War Pearson is portrayed as a narrow-minded and vindictive functionary; while in the Herbert Norman case (1950-57) he is praised for his courage and resolve in upholding the honour of his colleague and friend. Unfortunately, this dichotomy is not clarified, in part because

the book does not include a proper conclusion — a place where many of these issues could have been reassessed.

There are also some places in the text where the historical evidence provided does not justify certain generalizations. On page 371, for instance, the authors claim that there is "much more reason today to suspect" that the United States used biological weapons in Korea, an opinion which is not shared by those US historians who have examined the subject thoroughly. Equally suspect is their assertion that Canada's 1957 involvement in NORAD was inevitable: "It is hard to see how, after Ogdensburg (1940), Canada could have arrived at any other destination." (147) Surely, the experiences of World War II and the pattern of the Cold War so deftly described in this text helped determine this outcome!

These criticisms aside, this is a fine study which combines extensive research, effective organization and an engaging writing style. It should become essential reading for university courses which deal with Canadian foreign policy and political developments during the Cold War.

Donald Howard Avery  
University of Western Ontario

Sam Gindin, *The Canadian Auto Workers: The Birth and Transformation of a Union* (Toronto: James Lorimer and Company 1995).

IN STYLE, Sam Gindin's *The Canadian Auto Workers* is a textbook, designed to introduce union members to the history of the Canadian Auto Workers (CAW). In content, it is, as the author claims, an "essay" on the CAW's history, intended "not to be comprehensive ... but to address and develop questions and themes that are relevant to the union in the present." (vii) In particular, Gindin wants to explore the reasons for the CAW's 1985 decision to break away from the United Automobile Workers (UAW) and to ex-

amine the demands that historic event placed on the Canadian union. Writing a textbook and a synthetic essay are decidedly different tasks, and Gindin does an admirable job pulling them together. The book is engagingly written, well illustrated, and effectively supplemented by a number of informational boxes, precisely the attributes of a first-rate textbook. His interpretative framework is thoughtful and provocative. Perhaps because he sees his primary goal as speaking to present CAW concerns, however, Gindin overstates the degree to which UAW and CAW leaders and activists determined their unions' paths. As a result, he downplays the pivotal political contexts within which union leaders made their decisions.

Gindin, a high-level CAW staff member, follows the gradual divergence of the Canadian and American auto workers from the pre-union era to the present. He recognizes that broad social forces — economic change, corporate policy making — helped to shape the two groups' experiences. In Gindin's view, though, the American and Canadian UAWs were driven apart primarily because they developed different union cultures, rooted in different forms of nationalism. In the 1930s and 1940s, Canadian autoworkers followed the lead of their American brothers and sisters, battling the state for legitimation and employers for recognition and a share of power. The Canadian UAW took longer than the American to achieve their victories, but by the late 1940s the two groups had secured the same basic right to collective bargaining.

From that point on, Gindin argues, the Canadian and American UAWs followed increasingly different paths. Under Walter Reuther's direction, the American UAW forged a compact with industrial capital and the liberal state. Reuther traded any claim to a say in corporate decision-making for an ever-more generous package of raises and fringe benefits. He undercut rank and file militancy by bureaucratizing the union. And he surrendered the UAW's political independence

for an increasingly intimate relationship with the Democratic Party. Building on nationalist fear of American hegemony, Canadian UAW leaders refused to accept the same deal. The Canadians continued to contest production, health and safety standards inside the shop, while rejecting those portions of the American agreements, such as profit sharing, that reduced militancy. They maintained a healthy degree of democracy inside the union. And they refused to commit themselves unconditionally to, though they certainly allied themselves with, the Canadian Commonwealth Federation/New Democratic Party (CCF/NDP).

The divisions created in the 1950s widened in the next three decades. The Canadian UAW drew renewed strength and vigour from the social movements that in the 1960s challenged the postwar order, while the calcifying American UAW "proved incapable of tapping into [the movement's] energy and potential." (166) The Canadians were thus prepared to fight back when capitalists and their political allies viciously turned on organized labour in the late 1970s. American UAW leaders, meanwhile, folded in the face of the corporate onslaught, retreating into concession bargaining. This fundamental difference, brought to a head in the 1982 bargaining round, led the Canadians to leave the UAW in September 1985 and to form the CAW.

Gindin makes a critical point as he traces the long-standing differences between the Canadian and American UAW. But he stops short of probing the source of those differences. Gindin's discussion of the 1950s and 1960s makes the problem clear. Contrary to Gindin's assertion, Walter Reuther never abandoned hope of breaking management's control of corporate decision-making. Throughout the 1950s and 1960s, he repeatedly called for national economic planning, public control of pricing policy, and public review of technological innovation. Similarly, the UAW was hardly divorced from the social movements of the 1960s. The union

played a pivotal role in the most important of the decade's movements, the struggle for civil rights. Taken together, these efforts indicate that American UAW leaders were not all that different from their Canadian counterparts in their hopes and aspirations for the Union. The crucial difference between the two branches of the UAW, rather, lay in the leaders' ability to act on those hopes and aspirations. That is the difference that Gindin's analysis needs to probe.

Any such analysis should begin with the political contexts within which the unionists operated. As a number of commentators have noted, the American constitutional system essentially marginalizes third parties. An organization that wishes to participate in the mainstream of American politics, and therefore to shape public policy, must align itself with one of the two major parties. By so doing, however, it joins a coalition of other groups that may not share its goals. The post-World War II American UAW followed the logic the system had created, joining a Democratic Party coalition that fully supported corporate control of industrial capitalism's awesome power. The UAW tried to change the party's focus, but its efforts failed. As a result, the post-World War II union was forced to operate in a political economy dominated by corporate power. Canadian UAW leaders had a bit more room to manoeuvre. The parliamentary system allowed alternative voices. To be sure, the CCF/NDP did not always provide that voice. But it served as enough of an opposition to unfettered capitalism to prod the larger parties to the left. As a result, the Canadian UAW had at least some room to maintain the oppositional culture that Gindin celebrates.

Gindin ends the book with several chapters extolling the CAW's vibrancy. It became a truly national union in the late 1980s and 1990s, as it merged with a number of other Canadian unions. It works to build and maintain a "culture of resistance" within the expanding union

ranks. And it struggles to move from "social unionism" to "movement unionism," through which the union would lead a "profound change in the nature of society." (208) Thus does the CAW remain true, Gindin concludes, to the union culture that led to its creation. Only by understanding the structures that fostered that culture, however, will future activists be able to build on the past that Gindin rightly celebrates.

Kevin Boyle

University of Massachusetts, Amherst

Susan Crean, *Grace Hartman: A Woman for her Time* (Vancouver: New Star Books 1995).

TO AFFIRM THAT the advance of women in so many areas of life in Western countries has been one of the 20th century's most important legacies it is only necessary to recall the times when jobs were posted according to sex. The role of Grace Hartman, president of the Canadian Union of Public Employees during the turbulent years from 1975 to 1983, was seldom determining in this process, although significant at varying degrees.

Aware of her subject's strengths and weaknesses, writer Susan Crean has judiciously cast Hartman as "a woman for her time." Crean is sensitive to context and as she attempts to establish the environment she notes the findings of such labour historians as Ruth Frager, Craig Heron, Joan Sangster, and Wayne Roberts. While there is much to be learned about Canadian public service unions in this biography, surroundings sometimes overtake subject because evidence pertaining to Hartman is thin, deriving mainly from oral testimony. Crean's account of Hartman's life nevertheless unfolds smoothly in a well-crafted account.

Grace Hartman came late to labour activism and to prominence as an advocate of women's rights. Born into an ordinary family in Toronto in 1918, she left school early for manual labour following

the early death of her mother and the failure of her father's business activities. She was influenced by communist ideology and activities during the 1930s, but marriage and children created a Willowdale suburban housewife who did not venture back to paid employment until 1954 when she secured a secretarial job with the municipality of North York. Landing in a pink collar ghetto, she joined the local of the National Union of Public Employees (amalgamated with the National Union of Public Service Employees to form CUPE in 1963) and became its president in 1960 when she was forty-two years old.

Grace Hartman's ascent within CUPE was rapid during the next decade and a half. She was a good listener, well-organized, steady, and non-threatening — essential qualities during the stormy early inner life of CUPE as related here, particularly when it was headed by the mercurial Stan Little. A co-operative non-aggression pact with another rising CUPE star, Shirley Carr, removed what might otherwise have been a barrier. Hartman's personal experiences and trade union role sensitized her to women's issues, particularly in the workplace, at a time when even in a public service union "a woman at a convention was looked upon as a piece of ass." (54) Her union credentials lent themselves nicely to the largely middle-class women's movement of the 1960s. Hartman helped to found the National Action Committee on the Status of Women and lobbied for the Royal Commission established by the Trudeau government. Throughout she retained an intellectual independence based on her identification with working women. While adverse to the more arcane debates within the women's liberation movement, she was no less critical of unions, declaring in 1971 that the "majority of working women will continue to turn their backs on unions until union leaders begin to treat them as persons with equal status." (136)

When Hartman assumed the helm of CUPE in 1975 it had become the country's largest union, though it was viewed suspiciously by the industrial unions and individuals like the vituperative Dennis McDermott of the Auto Workers, with whom Hartman sparred. Hartman's chief accomplishments, Crean emphasizes, remained in the promotion of women within the workplace, union organization, and Canadian society more generally. Hartman rose to the occasion in the 1981 Ontario hospital workers' strike when she vehemently pointed out the inequities of the province's labour legislation and paid the price in a two-month jail term.

Other than the constancy of Hartman's advocacy of women, there was little ideology that governed her conduct in office, perhaps because the range of issues that today command the attention of union leaders detracts from a more coherent approach. Susan Crean rightly concludes that Grace Hartman was viewed generally "as a traditional trade unionist, neither bureaucrat nor expert, an unrepentant democrat, a modest and decent person. She was a woman other women liked to work for; a leader who habitually urged workers to reach beyond their jobs, to grow with their work. If labour historians and journalists said that she made her mark as a woman but not as an innovative leader in the movement because she lacked clout with the inner councils of labour, they weren't exactly wrong." (220-1) Susan Crean gets her subject right in an informative and balanced biography.

Terry Crowley  
University of Guelph

David Brundage, *The Making of Western Labor Radicals: Denver's Organized Workers, 1878-1905* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1994).

ARGUMENTS OVER THE NATURE, origins and importance of so-called "western Labour radicalism" have long been a fea-

ture of working-class history both in the United States and in Canada. For more than three decades historians have debated the issue, arguing variously the case for Turner's frontier hypothesis, the structural impact of uneven national economic development upon the West, and the peculiarly harsh conditions experienced by workers in the region's resource extraction industries. One might be forgiven for thinking that there was little new to add to the matter. David Brundage comes perilously close to confirming this suspicion.

*The Making of Western Labor Radicalism* is a study of the evolution of labour organizations and ideologies in Denver, Colorado between 1878 and 1905. It argues that the radicalism of such organizations as the Socialist Party of America (SPA) and the Industrial Workers of the World (IWW) did not derive from the "violence associated with frontier conditions or to the rapid emergence of an exploitative corporate capitalism in the mining West" but rather to the "traditions embedded in the world of nineteenth-century craft unionism and labor reform." (2) In this respect, Brundage's approach to the IWW differs from that of Melvyn Dubosky in *We Shall Be All*, in which the focus is on the economic and social changes that transformed the United States in the late 1800s. The SPC and IWW did not, Brundage suggests, represent a sharp break with labour's past practices and beliefs. Instead, they drew upon the legacy of the craft union movement of the 1870s and 1880s. As such, their support for internationalism, syndicalism, a movement culture centred on working-class opposition to the saloon, and for the militancy found in nascent industrial unions all placed the IWW and the SPC squarely within the mainstream of Denver labour's historical development.

Brundage provides a well-organized account of the above mentioned components of labour radicalism, dedicating a separate chapter each to internationalism, movement culture, syndicalism and the

roots of industrial unionism. Brundage argues that craft unionists were key players in Denver's Irish National Land League in the years 1880-83, an organization that did much to ease Catholic-Protestant rivalries among workers and which offered workers the experience of fighting for a cause greater than the confines of a single trade or craft. As such, the Land League provided many Denver workers with a sense of mutualism that was crucial to the rise of the Knights of Labor (KOL), to which the author turns his attention next. Brundage focuses on the Knights of Labor in regard to the anti-saloon movement in Denver, a movement more commonly identified with the middle class. Brundage argues that the KOL's own opposition was based on its belief that the saloon was an institution that "hindered the growth of a unified labor movement and served as a key social base for a corrupt and antilabor political machine." He thus reads the KOL's desire to stamp out the saloon as part of its broader attempt to create an autonomous movement culture "within which Denver's organized workers could fulfill their needs for companionship, recreation, and education." (53-4)

In the remainder of the book, Brundage turns from culture to politics and economics. He explores the failure of the rise of trade unions in the late 1880s to translate into success for the local United Labor Party, and traces an interest in syndicalism among Denver workers to this period. Finally, Brundage notes the impact of the mid-1890's economic depression upon Denver's craft unions, notably their failure to protect their own members from the ravages of unemployment. At the same time, the depression heralded a new wave of organization and militancy among Denver's unskilled workers, culminating in the rise of the IWW after the turn of the century.

All this is fine, if Brundage's aim were simply to describe the evolution of organized labour in Denver during the late 1800s. It is less satisfactory, how-

ever, as justification for his choice of title: *The Making of Western Labor Radicalism*. Attractive in outline, Brundage's argument is less persuasive upon closer examination. Three criticisms in particular might be made.

First, Brundage goes too far in his desire to correct the emphasis of earlier historians upon discontinuities that resulted from changing material conditions in the West. Although launched in 1905, Denver's IWW did not make significant progress until almost a decade later. By then, the city's population was well in excess of 140,000, four times its size in 1880. During the same period, Denver's manufacturing sector had grown from 259 establishments to almost 1,500. Denver was a different city at the end of Brundage's study than at the beginning, and his constant emphasis upon the continuity of labour's experiences and response seems a little perverse. Brundage himself observes that "out-migration from Denver during the 1870s and 1880s was even higher than the national norm," which leads one to wonder to what extent (and by what process) Denver workers were able to establish traditions of any lasting impact. Against this background of rapid growth and shifting population base, there is ample room to question the relevance of working-class support for Denver's Irish nationalist movement in the 1880s to the rise of the IWW some twenty years later.

This leads to the second criticism, the fact that on many occasions early strands of radical labour ideology either failed to win much support among Denver workers or simply died out altogether. As a result, it is difficult to see how they constituted influential components within the IWW in later years. For example, as Brundage himself notes, the anti-saloon battle failed to win the support of a majority of Denver's workers and even "greatly exacerbated emerging tensions within the [labour] movement." (54) As such, there is little justification for Brundage to conclude that labour's involvement in the



campaign constructed "a movement culture ... [which] continued to live on among the city's labor activists, coming to the fore especially in early twentieth-century labor radicalism." (80) Brundage may be right in making this assertion, but he certainly fails to demonstrate the connection in his book. By a similar token, Brundage's analysis of labour radicalism rests upon the experience of a small minority of workers in Denver. This criticism does not, of course, deny the validity of Brundage's study, but it does challenge his opening remark that labour radicalism "had a powerful influence upon the local working-class movement." (6) At best, radicals represented a small segment of western labour. Brundage's text is full of qualifications that make this clear. "The Socialist Labor party had virtually no presence in Denver" (104); "Syndicalism was never more than a minority current in the Denver labor movement in these years" (111); "Like earlier radicals, the IWW remained a minority force in the Denver movement as a whole." (162) While labour radicals have always exerted an influence far beyond their numbers, the extent of this influence needs to be examined more closely and critically. This leads to a third criticism to be made of Brundage's study: his decision to revisit the question of western labour radicalism in the first place.

The notion that the West — both in the US and in Canada — was home to an unusually radical labour movement is one that has come increasingly under attack in recent years. Sean Wilentz and Aristide Zolberg have even rejected the whole idea of "exceptionalism," that there exists a "normal" pattern of development against which particular countries or regions should be measured. In Canada, the pioneering works on western labour radicalism by Martin Robin, David Bercuson and Ross McCormack have been revised in two ways in the past twenty years. First, studies of labour in other regions have demonstrated that radicalism was not so much a function of geography as of

capitalist development. Second, even within the West scholars have found a wide range of responses to the conditions that confronted the working-class, many of which do not fit the label "radical." Studies by Allen Seager on New Westminster, Robert MacDonald on Vancouver and my own work on Calgary suggest that there was a sharp line dividing the experiences of western urban workers and those in the region's resource extraction industries. Recent work by Jeremy Mouat on British Columbia hard-rock miners also challenges the assumption that such workers were "naturally" inclined towards radicalism.

In this respect, *The Making of Western Labor Radicalism* marks a theoretical step backwards. Too readily Brundage accepts the existence of western radicalism as a historical phenomenon to be explained, rather than as a construct to be re-examined. Unfortunately, the two concepts central to Brundage's work — class and radicalism — receive little discussion or reflective examination, an absence that undermines Brundage's broader conclusions. His brief account of class formation, for example, is almost pre-Thompsonian in its static, structured appearance. A greater discussion of the voluminous literature on class formation might surely have benefited Brundage's examination of the evolution of working-class ideology and organization in Denver. As it stands, while the *Making of Western Labor Radicalism* tells us much about organized labour in Denver, it fails to advance the debate over class relations in western America.

David Bright  
Mount Royal College

Leon Fink, *In Search of the Working Class: Essays in American Labor History and Political Culture* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1994).

THERE HAS BEEN A lot of talk lately about the decline of labour history. Since

it continues to privilege the experiences of male workers, remains fixated on their institutions, and is theoretically naive, the story goes, the study of the working-class past is fast becoming yesterday's news. It was with this in mind that I read a collection of essays which span the career of one of America's second generation "new" labour historians, Leon Fink. While the essays cover a range of topics, they are united by Fink's sensitivity to the relationship between theory and evidence, and his ability to wrestle with the difficult questions posed by new historiographies. In this regard, *In Search of the Working Class* is both a timely and enriching contribution to the debate about the future course of labour history and certainly demonstrates that the rumours of its death are indeed premature.

Four of the nine essays are drawn from, or are related to, Fink's major contribution to American labour history, *Workingmen's Democracy: The Knights of Labor and American Politics*, which was published in 1983. In "Class Conflict American Style," Fink takes aim at "classic American Exceptionalist denials of the centrality of class to the American political universe" during the Gilded Age; it is an argument that many students of labour history know well. The tremendous change wrought by the emergence of industrial capitalism produced great social unrest as evidenced by the meteoric rise of the Knights of Labor. Drawing on their republican inheritance, the Knights envisioned a producers' democracy of sorts where the strength of organized working men would resuscitate "democratic citizenship" and protect the "public good within a regulated marketplace economy." (27) For Fink, this vision was as cultural as it was political; indeed, labour radicals often "dipped selectively into a popular storehouse of memory and myth to capture alternative images of human possibility." (26) In "Politics as Social History: A Case Study of Class Conflict and Political Development in Nineteenth-Century New England," Fink

reminds us that despite its short life, the Knights played a significant role in the emergence of representative democracy and the two-party system in Rutland, Vermont. In order to stave off the rise of independent labour candidates, the local Yankee elite mobilized the Republican party machine, "tightened local organization," and created a "stable executive leadership and permanent ward committees." (46) Against the backdrop of the Knights' nation-wide decline, many workers recognized the need to counter this renewed political offensive and shifted their allegiance from independent politics to the Democratic Party. Thus the "club like atmosphere" of town meetings in Rutland was eventually replaced by institutionalized two party competition. Clearly, historical "losers" matter; indeed, the town's "entire political edifice had been rendered, sundered, and reconstructed in the face of a radical challenge from below." (46)

Fink explores the linkages between political and social history further in "Labor, Liberty, and the Law: Trade Unionism and the problem of the American Constitutional Order." Here he examines the relationship between labour and the law from the emergence of Samuel Gompers to the post-World War II compromise between the AFL and the CIO. According to Fink, in the face of obstinate employers and judicial hostility the labour movement was unable to extend the protections afforded by collective bargaining unaided. As a result, it embraced the state — a power over which it historically held little sway — in order to exact some measure of protection. While some gains were recorded, more radical ways of interpreting and changing the world atrophied. "From such a reading," he concludes, "the proper critique of modern-day labor [lies] less in its acceptance of state labor regulation than in its weakness in adapting to a terrain where labor's political muscle would matter more than ever before." (163)

But Fink's understanding of labour history in general, and the Knights of Labor in particular, has not gone uncontested, as evidenced by a spirited exchange with T.J. Jackson Lears, John P. Diggins, George Lipsitz, Mari Jo Buhle, and Paul Buhle entitled "The New Labour History and the Powers of Historical Pessimism." Diggins remains unconvinced that the language of radical republicanism — "an immiscible chorus of political tongues" — espoused by the Knights is indicative of an oppositional challenge to industrial capitalism. It is not "incantations of language," but the "imperative of praxis" that proves the existence of radical politics, Diggins asserts. (124) In contrast, the Buhles alert Fink to the "pressing need" to engage with critical theory and "reevaluate the prevailing assumptions about the relationship between experience and meaning." (138) Challenged from both sides, Fink returns to the conceptual territory he first charted with Herbert Gutman at the University of Rochester and City College of New York in the 1970s. "Whether in an immigrant letter, a local election or strike report, or a slave register, Gutman sought in addition to accounts of acts and events the set of meanings through which largely unremembered people understood their times," he writes. "Rediscovering the language, as well as the deeds, of [Gutman's] many subjects was part of this process." (142) While this exchange is intriguing for what it reveals about the uses (and abuses) of hegemony, and the strengths and limitations of the turn to language, it also serves as a snapshot of labour history in transition.

Writing in "Looking Backward: Reflections on Workers' Culture and Certain Conceptual Dilemmas Within Labor History" and "Culture's Last Stand? Gender and the Search for Synthesis in American Labor History," Fink reflects critically on the accomplishments of "culturalists," and suggests that in order to regenerate the Thompsonian project labour historians must push their analyses

past the late 19th century. There is much to be learned about community, consciousness, and experience from gender history, Fink observes, and so long as "we recognize [its] boundaries," the "gendering of labor history" might endow the culturalist tradition with the "tougher, more self-critical angle of analysis" required to comprehend the complexity of workers' experiences in the 20th century. (245) But as Fink points out in "Intellectuals versus Workers': Academic Requirements and the Creation of Labor History," the task before labour scholars is not just an academic one, it is also political; to remain salient, historians of the working class must confront both questions of theory and the "yawning gap between the scholarly community and the world it presumes to describe" or risk further marginalization and antiquarianism. (223)

*In Search of the Working Class* chronicles the intellectual "meanderings" of an extremely talented and thoughtful historian of the American working class. The essays collected here (and I have not addressed them all) are both emblematic of the achievements of the "new" labour history and indicative of the issues that confront it. In the book's introduction Fink asked himself, and the reader, this question: "My writing has been stimulated by scholarly or political debates tied to a particular time and place. As those moments of inspiration have faded, are those products still worthy of review?" (vii) My answer to his question is a resounding yes!

Andy Parnaby  
Memorial University of Newfoundland

J. Robert Constantine, ed., *Gentle Rebel: Letters of Eugene V. Debs* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1995).

EUGENE VICTOR DEBS remained constantly in the American public eye from the time of his trial for refusing to obey a

federal injunction during the Pullman strike of 1894. After six months in Woodstock Jail, Illinois, he turned to Socialism, helped create the Socialist Party of America, and ran as a presidential candidate in every election from 1900 to 1920 except 1916, when he contested a Congressional district in Indiana. He conducted the campaign of 1920 from his cell in the Federal Prison in Atlanta, Georgia, where he had been incarcerated under the war-time Espionage Act of 1918. He was released by President Harding without a pardon on Christmas Day, 1921, after a public campaign on his behalf. Debs died in 1926.

During all these years Debs carried on a correspondence with a diverse group of people. Many were family members (like his brother Theodore, who acted as his secretary), fellow socialists, and personal friends, including writers like James Whitcomb Riley, Upton Sinclair, Sinclair Lewis, Carl Sandburg, and Claude Bowers. Others were simply fellow-citizens. Debs' letters show him prepared to give himself unsparingly to the Socialist Party, even to the point of frequently undermining his health. They also reveal an honest and generous man, scrupulously straightforward when he criticized yet scarcely ever betraying a hint of personal grudge. Sinclair Lewis wrote to him in 1926 of a dinner he had attended in which guests referred to Debs as the "one real honest-to-God saint of whom they had ever known." It was a widely held view among socialists and non-socialists alike.

Although Debs' tolerant, humane views undoubtedly account for his reputation as the "Gentle Rebel" of the present volume, or the "Citizen and Socialist" of Nick Salvatore's biography, this image possibly gives a wrong impression of Debs' politics. Among socialists in all countries in the period, it is tempting to see a sharp dichotomy between peaceful "revisionists" and violent "revolutionaries," with Debs safely in the former camp. In fact, the struggle was three-way, with a large group of "orthodox" Marxists between the two extremes, clinging to the

idea of a real revolution accomplished by purely democratic, non-violent means. This group included some of the best known names of the international socialist movement, including Karl Kautsky in Germany, Jules Guesde in France, a good section of the Independent Labour Party in Britain, and, in America, Eugene Debs. As Debs wrote to Kautsky, "It is from you, dear Comrade, that I learned some of my earliest and most precious lessons in Socialism. I have since wondered often how anyone, however feeble and benighted mentally, could read your crystal clear Marxian exposition and interpretation without becoming and remaining a socialist." This "democratic revolutionary" position explains Debs' consistent refusal to countenance a broad working-class party in spite of pleas from the likes of Samuel Jones or Henry Demarest Lloyd. It also accounts for his uneasy relationship with Victor Berger, the Milwaukee Socialist, whom Debs called a typical political boss and whom he suspected of reformist backsliding from real socialism, and of hankering after broad-based labour politics. Debs, of course, regarded Samuel Gompers and the American Federation of Labor as beyond hope and suspected Berger of toadying to both. Instead, Debs anticipated the rise of a pro-socialist industrial unionism that would break the AFL mould. Debs' "democratic revolutionary" position also explains his reconciliatory attitude toward Communism after its split from the Socialist Party. Claiming that his incarceration freed him of any responsibility for the division of the American left in 1919, he held out for unity. Like his counterparts in Europe who tried to form, in Lenin's phrase, a "two and a half" International somewhere between the Second (Reformist) and the Third (Communist), Debs only very reluctantly gave up on Russia. The anarchist Emma Goldman, who condemned the Soviet system in spite of being well-treated in Russia after her deportation from the United States in

1919, probably helped Debs change his mind.

Debs' consistent opposition to broad labour coalitions made his support in 1924 for the Conference for Progressive Political Action, headed by Robert La-Follette, all the more surprising. Some found it completely incomprehensible. Debs, however, explained to one enquirer that the "Socialist Party, enfeebled and decimated by the war, felt justified in casting its lot with the progressive organized workers who had declared their withdrawal from the old capitalist parties." He felt "satisfied that the future [would] vindicate the wisdom of this policy." The turnaround, however, might rather have vindicated many "right-wing" socialists who had argued for the policy earlier. With the Socialist party "as near a corpse as a thing can be and still show signs of life," as Debs remarked to his office manager Bertha Hale White in 1925, he must have wondered. The nearest he came to a confession in his correspondence, however, was his statement to Claude Bowers that, although "fundamental principles" were the same everywhere, "there is a different psychology in every nation, different economic and political conditions, and these have not been wisely reckoned with by socialists or they would be much farther along with the American movement."

All the themes discussed above are well covered in the present volume of Debs' letters, a selection from J. Robert Constantine's exhaustive three volume edition published in 1992. In this new volume, Constantine has replaced the explanatory footnotes with introductory paragraphs. He has also condensed the introductory biographical essay and reduced the number of photographs. The editing remains superb. In the matter of selection, Constantine has decided on a broad sampling from both personal letters and those concerned with public affairs. Scholars might have preferred to devote the one volume edition to the Socialist Party and civic matters, leaving aside the

more personal, some of which are less interesting. But the present selection certainly gives a well-rounded account of the man.

W.M. Dick  
University of Toronto

Colin Gordon, *New Deals: Business, Labor, and Politics in America, 1920-1935* (New York: Cambridge University Press 1994).

IN RECENT YEARS much of the focus of New Deal scholarship has shifted to the period of the late-New Deal and the transition from the New Deal to war. Colin Gordon's *New Deals* demonstrates once again, however, that the debate over the "early" New Deal is far from settled. Gordon poses a boldly revisionist challenge by contending that the "second" New Deal's Wagner and Social Security Acts were not the products of worker insurgency, reformist liberals, and an anti-business ideology. Rather they were "creatures" of business demands and indicative of the "essential conservatism" of the New Deal.

Gordon's arguments build on theories of rational choice and collective action to develop a sophisticated analysis of the relationship between politics and markets. In contrast to historians who stress the emergence of a "visible hand" or a viable associational capitalism by the 1920s, Gordon proposes a "disorganizational synthesis." (29) The rhetoric of business-government conflict, he contends, has obscured the fact that economic governance is shared by business and government. Business enjoys a "privileged" position in the formation of public policy, but it also confronts both intense competitive pressures and internal organizational disarray. Hence it is constantly weighing private and public controls to minimize competition while protecting profits and managerial authority. But because it is fragmented, it cannot impose private collective decisions to regulate

competition. It must seek political solutions, but because the American political system is also fragmented the costs and risks of these usually exceed the advantages. The result is a political economy that "tends toward organizational chaos." (34)

He applies this general framework to the interwar period to argue that the Wagner and the Social Security Acts were the culmination of business efforts that began in the 1920s to come to terms with what he describes as a "chronic crisis of competition." (85) Well before the Great Depression, business was frantically trying various strategies of collective action to reduce competitive pressures that Gordon variously describes as "profitless," "stagnant," "savage," "brutal," "merciless," "destructive," and "bloodthirsty." One of these strategies was organizing trade associations and peak associations, but these efforts at self-regulation turned out to be "organizational placebos" that could not enforce collective agreements.

Another strategy, although not widely adopted, was "regulatory unionism." Gordon concedes that the mass-production industries remained fiercely open shop, and the welfare capitalist systems of the twenties, he says, were nothing more than expressions of industry's demand to control workers and stabilize labour costs (no enlightened capitalists here). But some industries, he contends, realized that national unionization could restrain competition, minimize regional cost advantages, bar marginal competitors, and help sustain mass purchasing power. This alternative, he insists, would take on greater appeal in 1935.

Industry turned to politically backed controls when the depression struck. The first of these, of course, was the National Recovery Administration (NRA), which Gordon argues was "concerned less with strengthening the economy than with long-standing patterns of competition and disorganization." (171) The NRA, however, failed to resolve industry's organ-

izational disarray because it could not achieve effective code compliance.

The second new Deal, Gordon argues, was but an extension of the NRA experience and the efforts to abate competition during the twenties. For at least some industrialists, the lesson of the NRA was that the most logical and effective means of regulating industrial competition was through "business-minded unions." (199) Consequently, faced with severe competition and an invigorated labour movement, many businesses "turned to federal labour law as a last-best reprieve from the tortures of the market." Business, he is careful to argue, did not openly or eagerly embrace the Wagner Act, but its opposition was "superficial" and "cynical" (218) and its influence on the Act's origins and administration greater than generally recognized.

The Social Security Act was also the culmination of a quarter-century battle over the scope and costs of industrial welfare plans, state social insurance programs, and anticompetitive strategies. Faced with the threat of uneven costs and intensified regional competition, some business leaders wanted pensions and unemployment insurance nationalized to limit competition and eliminate regional disparities.

Although both acts were "business-friendly measures in progressive clothing," (280) it was not long before business became disenchanted with them. This souring was less a product of ideology than the failure to achieve recovery and minimize competition. And very quickly it became clear that both measures would impose new costs and raise new threats to managerial autonomy.

In the end, then, the New Deal was a reshuffling of an "old deck." It was "never meant to imply a fundamental overhaul of the economic order." (304) Its promise quickly outstripped its results because it never built a viable economic democracy.

This is an impressive book. The argument throughout is presented in a cogent,

lucid style. The research in new or seldom-used sources and the command of a wide range of business histories is exceptional. The analysis is always provocative.

In important places, however, the argument is more provocative than convincing. It is one thing to argue that the second New Deal had important roots in business-dominated initiatives of the twenties and of the NRA. It is quite another to say that the Wagner Act and the Social Security Act were the product of business and industry demands. Gordon sweeps away other influences far too easily and minimizes the role of public officials and the New Dealers who at times seem almost peripheral figures. He may well be right that historians have overstated the ideological divide between business and government during the 1930s, but then he overstates his own case for the virtual absence of ideological divisions. Scholars studying trade association activity may question his characterization of the futility of business organization.

But whether one agrees or disagrees, Gordon demands the serious attention of any scholar interested in the New Deal and the history of the 20th century's political economy.

David E. Hamilton  
University of Kentucky

Stephen Amberg, *The Union Inspiration in American Politics: The Autoworkers and the Making of a Liberal Industrial Order* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press 1994)

IN 1948 LABOUR relations scholar Sumner H. Slichter observed that America was gradually becoming a labouristic society dominated by workers rather than business. Today as organized labour becomes increasingly marginalized both in the plant and in politics, such a vision seems rather far-fetched. Since the late 1970s, scholars have been trying to explain why

labour's potential as a force for progressive change has never been fulfilled. David Brody, Nelson Lichtenstein and Howell John Harris, among many others, have described the development of a pluralistic industrial relations system that stripped workers of the potential for control of the shop floor and promoted productivity in exchange for high wages and benefits and a workplace rule of law. In politics labour lost its radical edge, abandoning its commitment to economic planning and redistribution to support Keynesian growth policies. Moreover, by eschewing independent labour politics to become a junior partner within the Democratic Party coalition, labour lost its ability to act as an independent political force.

Amberg uses the United Automobile Workers (UAW) as a case study to examine more closely the process which ultimately left labour a relatively powerless special interest group. To explain the development of the UAW, he sets up two ideal types of industrial orders, producerism and managerialism. Producerism is a form of industrial democracy associated with flexible production in which skilled workers participate in decision-making at all levels and are empowered politically. Under managerialism, which is associated with mass production, "all strategic decisions are made by owner-managers and executed down the line." Deskilled workers know only their immediate tasks, "work relations are based on contract," and links between work and politics are severed. (29)

According to Amberg, the social democratic program of the early UAW represented most closely the producerist ideal. As World War II ended, advocates of social democratic producerism within the UAW and the CIO pushed for the establishment of representative democracy in industry, full civil liberties for employees, management by functional knowledge rather than authority, a fully developed welfare state, and federal government planning to promote industrial

modernization. Amberg carefully details struggles during the late 1940s over industrial relations, in particular the bargaining rounds, and over national economic policy. During these struggles, determined employers and an acquiescent government put steady pressure on the UAW, forcing the autoworkers' union to narrow its goals. According to Amberg, the settlement reached in the auto industry by 1950 established the limits of the New Deal's industrial order. Under that settlement, managerialism in large part triumphed. Reuther abandoned the effort to establish institutional connections between industrial relations and national economic policy, exemplified by his demand that GM open its books and link prices to wages. Moreover, questions of investment, organization of work and product strategies were excluded from collective bargaining. Instead, the UAW traded job control for limited contractual restrictions on management and periodic wage increases and benefits. At the same time, labour remained firmly wedded to the Democratic Party, which abandoned the commitment to full employment and endorsed instead the politics of growth, or commercial Keynesianism.

The last part of Amberg's study examines the wide-ranging impact of labour's accord with capital in the auto industry. He identifies pockets of producerist resistance among skilled auto workers and in some small firms like Studebaker even as the accord was being shaped. Amberg contends that through the 1950s skilled autoworkers continued to struggle for greater control of the shop floor, advocating flexible work organization. But by the end of a decade of pressure from both management and union, skilled workers had lost their broader vision and become primarily interested in protecting their own special craft privileges. In contrast to the major auto companies, Studebaker had developed a more flexible model of production with all its employees involved in a broad range of work tasks. The effort to impose the postwar

settlement rigidified that firm's traditionally informal authority structure and ultimately led to its destruction. On the political side of the settlement, as junior partners of the Democratic Party neither the UAW nor the AFL-CIO were able to effectively promote labour's economic agenda during the Kennedy and Johnson administrations.

By the late 1960s the UAW faced troubles on every front. Insurgent rank and file movements emerged among workers who had grown impatient with the collective bargaining strategy which sacrificed working conditions for more pay and failed to address issues like racism. Moreover the tight boundaries established by the liberal industrial order meant that labour was unable to respond aggressively to new economic conditions. By the 1970s, the auto companies responded to increasing foreign competition by closing plants and subcontracting work, and the courts ruled that these decisions did not fall within the realm of collective bargaining. Amberg argues that ultimately the rigidities associated with the postwar settlement made it difficult for labour to defend itself in the more hostile economic and political climate of the past twenty years. By the late 1970s, the "virtuous circle of stable labor relations, high wages and profits and Democratic dominance" had collapsed and the auto unions and organized labour as a whole were in retreat. (274)

Amberg's study gives us a much better understanding of the development of the settlement in the auto industry and helps explain why labour has been unable to respond effectively to changed economic conditions. What is more problematic is his contention that social democratic producerism was ever an alternative. Even today when economic crisis has led managers to experiment with the flexible production which Amberg associates with producerism, he admits that workers are still excluded from investment decisions. While some leaders of the CIO used the language of producerism,



back in the 1940s, there is no evidence that there was any viable support in an industry committed to mass production or in government to move in that direction. As long as mass production paid for the highest standard of living in the world, it is questionable that there was significant support among workers, even Amberg's skilled workers, for an alternative labour-management system. In hindsight, it is easy to see the limitations of the postwar settlement which provided little protection for workers from the ravages of de-industrialization. But in the face of massive resistance from employers to any intrusion on managerial rights, it is perhaps better to view the postwar settlement as an achievement that significantly improved the lives of many workers.

Elizabeth Fones-Wolf  
West Virginia University

Robert Asher and Ronald Edsforth (with the assistance of Stephen Merlino), eds., *Autowork* (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1995).

THE SOPHISTICATED and thoughtful essays in *Autowork* cover the period from about 1914 to the present. They focus on shopfloor issues. This book both complements and intriguingly contrasts with an earlier collection, *On the Line: Essays in the History of Auto Work*, edited by Nelson Lichtenstein and Stephen Meyer (1989). The current volume, produced during a period of union rollback and declining labourite political influence, is less quick to judge the United Automobile Workers (UAW) negatively and more sensitive to the constraints, both historical and contemporary, that have limited opportunities for worker empowerment. From the mid-1930s onward, declare Asher and Edsforth, "UAW leaders worked very hard, aggressively, and imaginatively, within the constraints of the system of collective bargaining that was mandated by Congress and dominated by corporate power to expand the

autonomy and dignity of auto workers." (4)

The editors' introductory essay provides a balanced and incisive overview of the history of work relations in the industry, stressing the relative weakness of unionism, the conservatism of the political order, and the fact of enormous corporate power in shaping the context in which shopfloor issues were contested. Lindy Biggs' contribution outlines the relationship between factory design and work processes in the industry's first third-century. Biggs' contribution, along with the essays by Asher and Edsforth, call into question the usefulness of the theme of "deskilling" in characterizing autowork. Although neither explores the topic fully, these essays raise important questions about the nature of auto work at key transitional points in the changing production regimes of the early 20th century.

In "The Speedup: The Focal Point of Workers' Grievances, 1919-1941" (written with the assistance of Raymond Boryczka), Asher and Edsforth powerfully document the physically and emotionally exhausting nature of depression-era autowork and root the militancy that founded the UAW directly in workers' determination to gain redress. Even here, however, the authors note the divisive nature of many shop floor struggles and stress the difficulty faced by international union leaders in dealing with justifiable, but often impractical, worker expectations. "UAW leaders," they observe, "could neither endorse a level of militancy that would bring the union down, or refuse to resist the speedup that so angered their membership." (97)

Kevin Boyle's careful examination of worker attitudes during World War II challenges Nelson Lichtenstein's by-now familiar depiction of the World War II UAW as a no-holds-barred fight between militant rank and filers and production-obsessed union leaders. In a careful reading of grievance records, Boyle finds that control issues were far from the top of the auto worker's agenda. UAW officials, he

argues, responded intelligently to workplace pressures and workers themselves perceived their protests as examples of patriotic productionism in action.

Asher contributes a revisionist account of the important 1949 Ford strike, crediting Walter Reuther with a more responsive attitude toward shop-floor issues than previous writers do. An additional contribution of this essay is its careful tracing out of the ongoing shopfloor conflict at Ford that punctuated the putative golden age of auto production, the 1950s and 1960s. Ford managers sought constantly to undermine contractual protections and to expand managerial discretion while "at critical junctures, union officials at all levels provided a great deal of support to production workers in their resistance to management-initiated speedups ...." (153)

More sympathetic to the problems of union officials than the contributors to *On the Line*, participants in this collection are by no means uncritical of the union hierarchy. Edsforth, for example, sees Reuther as devious and disingenuous in his efforts to sidetrack a strong rank-and-file drive to shorten the work week. In a telling comparison of UAW response to shop-floor protest in Detroit and Lordstown in the 1960s and 1970s, Heather Ann Thompson skewers top leaders for their insensitivity to the distinctive idioms of black workers' protests. Sociologist Craig A. Zabala, however, uses vignettes of sabotage in a California assembly plant around 1980 to stress the symbiotic relationship between formal structures of collective bargaining and informal kinds of workers' resistance.

Steve Babson provides a detailed and thoughtful overview of Japanese-inspired changes in auto workplaces and in industrial relations regimes in the 1980s and 1990s. Babson's is an unusually cogent account, one that reveals how powerfully long-term struggles over the content and pace of work continue unabated, with the new idiom of "lean production" serving to obscure conflict at the point of produc-

tion. Babson's discussion of emerging UAW strategies designed to rebuild a shopfloor union presence in a changing environment offers at least a glimmer of hope in a period otherwise unfriendly to notions of true worker empowerment.

*Autowork* does not touch all bases. Absent are commentary on factional and ideological conflict in the emergent UAW of the 1930s and 1940s, sustained discussion of the union's key political role, and examination of the Reuther-era internal politics of the Auto Workers. Contributors to this collection assert, sometimes pointedly, the connections between shop-floor matters and the broader political economy, but no one explores in detail this dimension of autowork. Nonetheless, this is a superior collection of essays, one that profits from the insights of UAW critics of the 1960s and 1970s while attaining a balanced and broadly sympathetic perspective.

Robert H. Zieger  
University of Florida

Gilbert G. Gonzalez, *Labor and Community: Mexican Citrus Worker Villages in a Southern California County, 1900-1950* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1994).

GILBERT GONZALEZ offers a case study of the Chicano citrus worker communities of Orange County, California. Should those of us whose speciality does not lie in Chicano studies, or Southern Californian immigration be interested? Yes.

While his subjects had many experiences comparable to those of other immigrant communities, there are important distinguishing features which make this study an important addition to the history of workers and immigrants. First, unlike those in much of the literature on Mexican immigrants and immigrants in general, the California citrus communities comprised rural workers, whose lives and culture would be transformed only later in the century by urbanization. Second, the

Chicano immigrants maintained special forms of contract — particularly through the Mexican consulate — with their country of origin across a border contiguous with the United States. This contact contributed to the shape and speed of cultural change, as well as to the shape of labour relations in the citrus groves. These two aspects of the citrus worker villages lend a uniqueness to Gonzalez' study. His other major themes are more common in the literature on Northern American labour and ethnicity. Gonzalez shows the considerable strengths of the immigrant communities as they dealt with poverty, racism and forced segregation.

He demonstrates the interplay between a dynamic, large-scale, capitalist agricultural industry and the lives of farm-workers themselves. California citrus fruit-picking and packing were year-round activities. Until the Exclusion Act of 1882, most pickers were Chinese, replaced thereafter by the Japanese. In the first decades of the 20th century, the massive expansion of the citrus industry was fed by a huge influx of Mexican labour. Growers organized large cooperatives, dominated by the California Fruit Growers' Exchange (which took the name "Sunkist" after 1952).

Citrus production was second only to oil in importance to the California economy in the first half of the 20th century, most of it concentrated in six counties in Southern California. Gonzalez estimates that, at the height of production, 100,000 Mexican citrus workers and their families lived in the villages. Residents saw these villages not as migrant labour settlements but as permanent homes, and developed complex and durable community institutions despite harsh living conditions. Community events included Mexican Independence celebrations, religious observances, and various recreational activities. Gonzalez mines both newspaper accounts and oral history interviews to give a feeling for the texture of these occasions.

But the mainly autonomous village culture was part of a larger economic and cultural system. Public schools formed one set of institutions on the interface. The village school systems were racially segregated, with the Mexican segment characterized by lower pay for teachers, inferior buildings, and a curriculum geared toward vocational education. Ironically, the ultimate purpose of the enforced segregation was a program of cultural assimilation, which would nevertheless maintain class and status inequality for Mexican labour. Nor surprisingly, the schools became sites of cultural syncretism, where singing of the Mexican song, "Jesucita" might be sung at a Cinco de Mayo celebration whose program also featured "Did You Ever See a Lassie," and a Maypole dance. (108)

Americanization campaigns targeted adults for assimilation in the pre-World War I era. These efforts paralleled those in other parts of the country. The 1913 Commission of Immigration and Housing, supported by the California Fruit Growers' Exchange, promoted home visits and classes by Americanization teachers, and the establishment of Americanization centres. Like the schools, the centres were used and changed by the communities so that, to some extent, they served ends defined by the villagers themselves. Unlike urban Americanization programs, which typically dealt with immigrants from a variety of backgrounds, these became meeting grounds for two cultures, Mexican and American.

One chapter of Gonzalez' study is devoted to an account (a version of which appeared in *Labor History*) of the California citrus workers' strike of 1936. Violently suppressed, the strike brought support and leadership from the Mexican consulate, which ultimately contributed to a split between conservative and radical unionists. The growers, their Exchange, and a revitalized anti-strike Associated Farmers of California worked with law enforcement officials to defeat the workers and their union. While there

was some increase in wages, the strikers failed to get union recognition, many were blacklisted, and grower paternalism was shattered.

The citrus worker villages declined in the era of World War II for a variety of reasons. Labour shortages raised wages and drove growers to import cheaper migrant labour from Mexico. At the same time, other industries grew in Southern California, providing an expanded range of employment opportunities to the older generation. Cities and suburbs also began to expand into the citrus-growing regions, transforming the landscape itself. In this context, several civil rights organizations launched attacks on the segregation and inequality faced by Mexican Americans. As the era of the citrus worker villages passed, they were replaced by the urban barrio.

The argument put forward by Gonzalez is diffuse. Throughout the book there is a tension, rather than an easy complementarity, between narrative and analysis, between historical detail and larger theoretical concerns. Gonzalez provides a loose and often uncomfortable synthesis of a chronological account (the rise and fall of the villages) and a thematic exploration of a series of topics. Thus union organizing is discussed neither before nor after the one chapter on the 1936 strike. Nor do we follow systematically the kinds of structural shifts in capital organization which he promises in the introductory chapters. Some stylistic problems also intervene in the reading. Quotations are used where paraphrases would have been appropriate; the present tense crops up unexpectedly in the historical account. Finally, there are places where a partial knowledge of the primary and secondary literature is apparent. A glance at the footnotes on the Americanization chapter reveals omission of important primary and secondary literature, and inclusion of dates and less relevant studies.

Criticisms notwithstanding, *Labor and Community* helps to round out our picture of the Mexican experience in the

American Southwest. Scholars in this area will find the volume of value, as will those with interests in comparative work in ethnicity and labour.

Peter Seixas  
University of British Columbia

Elizabeth A. Fones-Wolf, *Selling Free Enterprise: The Business Assault on Labor and Liberalism, 1945-1960* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1994).

IN A MORE LIMITED fashion this book takes up the story and elements of the analysis in Elizabeth Cohen's brilliant 1990 work *Making a New Deal: Industrial Workers in Chicago 1919-1939*. That work explored the interaction of ethnic and mass cultures, and the creation of a CIO culture of unity. This new political culture became the foundation for a New Deal coalition dedicated to industrial democracy, social justice, and an interventionist welfare state. Fones-Wolf picks up an important part of this history in 1945, showing employers' post-war concern with and reaction to what they perceived as a labour-oriented political culture. They saw this demonstrated by, for example, much local civic support for the unions in the 1946 strike wave and the Democratic victory in 1948.

Using the records of business associations and industrial leaders, as well as union archives, she details the development of a powerful business offensive to recapture the political culture. The offensive took many forms including new human relations campaigns to contest for worker loyalty, economic education in the factory, corporate engagement in community relations programmes, promotion of private higher education, economic education in the schools, and a well-endowed battle for the political soul of the Protestant churches. Fones-Wolf is not content to show just the corporate side but also presents the union efforts to counter this ideological offensive with la-

bour education, political action and some use of mass communications.

One of her most interesting chapters is on "Business, Labor, and Religion." She draws on important sources from all sides in the National Council of Churches, including the papers of Charles P. Taft, the moderate brother of Senate Robert Taft, J. Howard Pew of Sun Oil, a business hard liner, and the liberal churchman G. Bromley Oxnam. These sources enable her to produce a sophisticated and nuanced portrayal of the power of money to undermine inclinations towards social justice on the part of the National Council of Churches. Unfortunately she does not devote comparable attention to the Catholic church with its traditional ties to the working class and organized labour.

The author gives us numerous examples of both union and employer efforts to use radio, television, and print to promote their positions. For the most part, however, she addresses only the more narrowly conceived propaganda of each side. Unlike Cohen, who portrayed the impact of commercial films, radio, and records, as well as broader aspects of the consumer culture, Fones-Wolf limits her study to the propaganda produced by the business associations and unions themselves. In rare departures she mentions *On the Waterfront*, the portrayal of labour in the Orphan Annie comic strip, and in the last paragraph of the book Ronald Reagan's work for General Electric. Yet, in the business offensive against the unions surely the business of mass communications had a more important role in the formation of consciousness than the tons of propaganda pamphlets produced by the National Association of Manufacturers. The "selling of free enterprise" by business was the very day work of Hollywood, the television industry, radio and the press. Perhaps that is a subject for a different study but its omission is disappointing.

Fones-Wolf does offer some interesting and challenging conclusions. First,

she argues effectively that the post war business offensive for, in the words of the late Bert Cochran "the intellectual reconquest of America," was the first act in the conservative domination of American political culture. Second, she observes that the idea of the 1950s as one of unrelieved consensus should be revised, for "it was the continuing attraction of liberalism and organized labor that was behind the ideological assault." She has made her case for both of those propositions.

Stephen Scheinberg  
Concordia University

Dorothy Ray Healey and Maurice Isserman, *California Red: A Life in the American Communist Party* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press 1993).

IN THE WAKE of New Left politics and renewed interest in working-class history in the 1960s and 1970s, many American academics became captivated by the history of the "Old Left," particularly the American Communist Party. At the same time, some former Communists began to write their memoirs and autobiographies; accounts by people like Vera Weisbord, Peggy Dennis, Al Richmond and, for a rare Communist with a sense of humour, Jessica Mitford, provided new insights into the politics, organization and gender relations of the Communist movement. These autobiographies emerged along with new interpretations of the CPUSA by historians such as Mark Naison, Paul Lyons, and Robin Kelley. These scholars, though not uncritical of the Party, were less inclined to emphasize the Soviet or Stalinist influence on the CPUSA, and rejected Theodore Draper's influential work which had concentrated on the role of Soviet foreign policy in determining all CPUSA policy and which had repudiated any notion of an "Americanized" party. Focusing on the trade union connection, the grass roots, particular campaigns, regional organization or the relationship of

the Party to particular groups such as African-Americans, this revisionist scholarship offered an antidote to Draperian interpretations which failed to explain why the movement did attract and hold many committed Leftists in the 1930s and 1940s.

*California Red* is a marriage of the second current of Communist historiography and the tradition of autobiographical memoir: it is the life story of Dorothy Ray Healey, a long-standing CPUSA leader, as told to and written by Maurice Isserman, a revisionist historian of the Party. Isserman's earlier book, *Which Side Are You On?*, explored the ideas and politics of the generation of Communists who joined the Party in the Depression decade and then weathered the storms of World War II and post-war debates. His assessment of Party history held out some sympathy for Earl Browder's attempt to "Americanize" the Party in the aftermath of World War II. As a child of an Old Left family, but a proponent of New Left ideas, Isserman approached Party history with considerable sympathy for the grass roots activism of Communists and their attempts to create a more "home-grown" variety of Communism.

Dorothy Ray Healey was a Communist from California who cut her first political teeth in the class versus class politics of the early 1930s, worked as a union organizer and party functionary, rose to positions of prominence in Los Angeles and the West Coast, and eventually became an advocate for reform within the National Party. Her story is a compelling one, told with vivid recall and some passion; although no longer a Party member, she remains committed to a socialist vision of social change. Because she was one of few women leaders in the Party whose activism stretched over almost five decades, because she often disagreed with the leadership, and because of the breadth of her activism, the memoir is a valuable addition to the autobiographical tradition of the American Left. It is sometimes self-critical, though certainly not to the

extent to which a more distant biographer, especially one critical of Stalinism, might have made it. It is, after all, Healey's attempt to understand, justify and explain her life, more than a critique of her own politics. As Isserman notes, one question always nags: why did she take so long to leave the Party? She was especially critical of the leadership after the 1950s, but persevered through Hungary, even Czechoslovakia, not to mention the domestic disasters of those years. Her stubborn longevity may be partly explained by her loyalty to the memory of long years of sacrifice, idealism, and devotion to the working-class struggles supported by the Party. One senses, however, in the detailed replays of the many wrangles within the inner Party sanctums that she relays in the later part of the book, an addictive inability to set aside the power struggles of the Party in the face of overwhelming evidence of atrophy and authoritarianism.

Although Isserman obviously asked her questions relating to these issues, he does not provide critical commentary on them. While the book is co-authored, the story and the dominant interpretation are Healey's, not Isserman's. He admits, for example, that her interpretation of Browder's position is rather different from his. Isserman's role was to interview, transcribe, edit and write the story, sometimes using his words to express Healey's thoughts. He also intersperses her text with excerpts from other sources such as newspapers or FBI reports, as well as interviews with Healey's family, friends, and comrades. While this "pastiche" style is sometimes disconcerting and distracting, it can also add small insights, contrasts, and ironies to Healey's dominant narrative.

*California Red* is one of the most revealing, informative and engaging accounts of an American Communist life ever published. It touches on many aspects of Party life from union organizing in the growing and canning industries of California to the inner power struggles of

National Party politics in the 1950s. The sections on union organizing, both at the grass roots level and later through Healey's work within the CIO are excellent, as are the detailed remembrances of her role as a club organizer and as a Party functionary. In the case of many campaigns and issues, Healey can rehearse the debates within the Communist camp as well as those with their adversaries, and she tries to create some understanding for her choices, as well as Party manoeuvres, by always exploring the political and social context within which the Party operated. And certainly, some passages are very moving, particularly those describing the opposition Communists and workers faced in the midst of early union organizing, or those delineating the persecution of the McCarthy period — Healey was arrested and imprisoned more than once, including under the infamous Smith Act.

Coming from a woman within a Party that claimed concern for women's oppression but was nonetheless dominated by male leaders, the memoir is also informative. Healey was never known for her advocacy of the "woman question" as much as for other political work — and perhaps this is precisely why she was taken seriously as a leader, unlike some other women, such as Elizabeth Gurley Flynn, who seemed to be more of a figurehead in later years. Healey is aware of the way in which the Party, through its political methods and ideology, made it more difficult for women than men to be active and rise to the leadership. One senses, however, that she was a rather exceptional, strong, committed, confident woman who was able to overcome the obstacles that weighed many other women down. Save for her relationship with her son, which was clearly absolutely central to her decisions, other aspects of her private life are often portrayed as they related to her political life, and her personal choices vis-à-vis relationships, pregnancies and so on were clearly moulded by the needs of the Party

at the time. In an earlier debate between former Communist Peggy Dennis and New Leftist Ellen Kay Trimberger about the relationship between the public and the private lives of Old Left women, Dennis admitted that it was difficult to combine the roles of leader/activist and wife/mother in the Party. As Dennis noted — and this is clearly true for Healey — Communist women did not concentrate on issues of "personal fulfilment" and they made the sacrifices they thought necessary for the collective causes promoted by the structured, disciplined party to which they were dedicated.

As part of the autobiographical tradition of Old Left memoirs, *California Red* is a valuable and revealing account of the Communist Party. It offers insight into the Party's history, considerable detail about Party work and life, and some critical appraisal from Healey of the successes and failures of her own work over five decades.

Joan Sangster  
Trent University

Harvey Klehr, John E. Haynes and Fridrikh I. Firsov, *The Secret World of American Communism* (New Haven & London: Yale University Press 1995).

THE AUTHORS SET OUT in this book to describe the relations of the Communist Party of the United States (CPUSA) with the Comintern, and Soviet intelligence agencies, based on a selection of ninety-two documents drawn from the large holdings of the Comintern archives in Moscow. The authors contend that the CPUSA was subservient to and received large subsidies from the Comintern and closely cooperated through its secret apparatus with Soviet intelligence services. The authors also place their findings inside the context of CPUSA historiography. Orthodox opinion contends "that the CPUSA was never an independent American political party but a creature given life and meaning by its umbilical ties to the

Soviet Union." (17) The "revisionist" school "holds that the American Communist movement was a normal, albeit radical, political participant in American democracy ... with its roots in America's democratic, populist, and revolutionary past." (17-8)

The authors' objective is to show that the revisionist school is wrong in all its main lines. While many of the documents included in the collection are interesting, the book itself is unscholarly. It is a political tract intended to settle a grudge with the new/old left. The authors employ tendentious, if not dishonest arguments, innuendo, and guilt by association.

The tract also lacks historical context and fails to address important historical issues. For example, what were the Comintern's relations with other national communist parties, or with the Communist Party of the Soviet Union (CPSU) and the Soviet government? In the 1920s British, French, and American diplomats assumed that national communist parties were mere creatures of the Comintern, which was an instrument of the Soviet government controlled by the CPSU. Was it all so simple? Narkomindel officials (from the commissariat for foreign affairs) often told western diplomats that the Soviet government could not always control the Comintern, and that Narkomindel certainly could not. They were incensed by Comintern activities, which interfered with business-like relations with the West and acquisition of long, cheap western credit to develop the Soviet economy.

The authors push their conclusions further than their evidence warrants. This may surprise, since one might have expected the vast Comintern archives to have given up more incriminating evidence. Yale University Press, in its sensational April 1995 press release, claims that the authors have bagged the Bolshie bear. But have they?

Consider a few examples. In order to show the extent of Comintern subsidies to foreign communist parties, and to dis-

credit the CPUSA for accepting them, the authors reproduce a ledger sheet showing payments in 1919-20 to various individuals, denominated in Russian rubles, valuables, or in foreign currencies. During the intervention period (1917-21), the Allied powers blockaded Soviet Russia and sought to destroy the value of the many types of circulating paper rubles. Rubles, especially Soviet rubles, had no foreign exchange value in January 1920, for example, when according to the authors the ledger sheet shows that American journalist John Reed received 1,008,000 rubles in valuables. When Reed tried unsuccessfully to leave Soviet Russia in February 1920, Finnish authorities stopped him with only "1,500 in various currencies and 102 diamonds estimated to be worth \$14,000, a small fortune in 1920," say the authors. But this was a trifling sum when compared with "several million dollars in valuables" which the authors claim the Comintern handed over to American communists. (24)

Dimitri Volkogonov in his book on V.I. Lenin (1994) states that the Comintern had no idea how much money it was passing out to foreign revolutionaries. But Reed tried to leave Soviet Russia with only \$15,500. What happened to the rest of the money and how was it sent to American communists since Reed died later in the year without returning to the United States? "We do not know," replied the authors, in a heated, defensive Internet exchange (H-Russia) with the present reviewer in July 1995. But if they do not know how the money was sent to the United States, how can they state categorically that several millions in red-tainted money was sent at all? The Bolsheviks, of course, saw no taint on the money. They considered themselves to be internationalists, and by their lights, it would have been dishonourable not to render aid to other communist parties.

The authors say the during the inter-war years the Comintern subsidies to the CPUSA were large (\$75,000, for example, in 1923). The \$75,000 was not big money



for a country as large and prosperous as the United States, but most Comintern subsidies and CPUSA expenditures mentioned in the authors' documents are three and four figures. The financial statement of the "Brother-Son" clandestine network (1942) shows total expenditures of \$11,311, a beginning balance of \$30,145, and no income. More than half the expenditures are three figures. In 1932 a CPUSA official complained " ... it is annoying to expect funds and not get them, because altho (sic) we are stretching out what we had, lack of assurance of any more prevents us progressing with the work in any way that will involve expense." (25, 211-2, 51)

The authors stress the importance of CPUSA secrecy and clandestine work. Once again the documents in the collection suggest that the secrecy was as amateurish as the sums expended to support it were modest. Not the three stooges by any means, but not the nefarious, pervasive operations which the authors seek to portray. In 1925 a CPUSA document complains of a "careless method of sending mail" (33); in 1932, of mail being sent to the wrong comrade (51); in 1939, of poor safeguarding of documents. (101) And contact with the Comintern was so clandestine that CPUSA officials complained (for example, in 1932 and 1942) about not hearing from it. In 1939 a top CPUSA official could not recall all the names of the members of Central Control Commission. Another document dated 1939 reports that "Party work at Ford companies is badly organized." (102) Some of the material is more soap opera than espionage. A party member, for example, visits his politically recalcitrant wife against party orders.

There were pervasive CPUSA espionage activities, say the authors, and "integral links" between the CPUSA and CPSU/Soviet intelligence agencies. (205) For example, seventeen CPUSA members were also members of the CPSU; by the authors' reckoning these seventeen become "many." (202) "More than forty"

alleged Communist agents working inside the American government become "dozens" on the next page (310-1), but of these only two were imprisoned. They say two documents "pilfered" from the State Department by a communist "thief" (110, 218) "prove" the CPUSA had "integral links to Soviet espionage." (205) This evidence is silly. Quite apart from the unimportance of the two documents and the conspicuous absurdity of the authors' contention, pilfered Soviet documents are a penny apiece in British and French archives. When American security agencies obtain Soviet documents or ciphers by clandestine means during World War II, the authors offer no negative comments. (237) In fact, they celebrate the revelations of the "Venona" decrypts, now being released by the American government. Undoubtedly it is a case of *deux poids, deux mesures*.

The authors characterize CPUSA head Earl Browder as an "NKVD Talent Spotter" (233) based on a single document in which Browder reported to the Comintern in 1940 that French Third Republic politician Pierre Cot was to work with the USSR for a Franco-Soviet alliance. A Soviet defector has alleged that Cot was a Soviet "agent"; the Venona decrypts prove it, assert the authors in their Internet posting of 13 July (see also 236-7). But other French cabinet ministers — for example, Georges Mandel and Paul Reynaud — turn up in Soviet cable traffic to Moscow. Mandel and Reynaud were strong advocates of a Franco-Soviet alliance, sometimes seeing the Soviet ambassador in Paris in the late 1930s to pass on information or to complain about the policies of their government. Does that make Reynaud and Mandel Soviet "agents"? If Cot acted disloyally toward France, it has yet to be proven.

Charles de Gaulle rebuffed Cot in 1940, when he offered his services to the Free French; he was "an embarrassment," the authors imply, because he was tainted by over-enthusiasm for the USSR. To support this point, the authors cite Jean La-

couture's biography of de Gaulle. But Lacouture notes that de Gaulle rejected Cot because of his ties with the rotten Third Republic, not the USSR, and that a year later de Gaulle wrote to Cot to praise his conduct as a "*bon Français*." In 1944 Cot went on a mission to Moscow for the French government at Alger. Is this honest treatment of the evidence?

Finally, there is the case of Soviet intelligence operations to obtain American nuclear secrets during World War II, in which the authors claim the CPUSA clandestine network was directly involved. They focus their attention on one Morris Cohen, code-name Louis, who worked in the "Brother-Son" clandestine network. A Soviet intelligence officer recently claimed that in 1942 Louis recruited for Soviet intelligence a physicist who was working on the Manhattan project to develop an atomic bomb. The authors produce an undated 1942 summary of "Son" activities, which referred to Louis' clandestine work. The document strongly implies that Louis was not in the United States in 1942, that in any event communications with him were "extremely difficult," and that the network did not know what he was doing. (209-10) Were there two comrade agents code-named Louis, or could one agent have been in two places at the same time? The authors later observe, almost inadvertently, that Soviet intelligence wanted its agents to sever Communist Party ties. Indeed, Soviet intelligence may not have trusted unprofessional and undisciplined CPUSA members to conduct its most important secret enterprises.

The authors claim in their Internet postings of 13 and 20 July that the Venona decrypts demonstrate "beyond a shadow of a doubt" that Julius and Ethel Rosenberg were "spies" "involved" in Soviet penetration of the Manhattan project. The decrypts appear to show that Julius Rosenberg provided technical and industrial information to Soviet agencies, but that he had little or nothing to do with penetration of Manhattan and that his

wife had nothing to do with it. Once again, is this honest treatment of the evidence?

The authors are unrelenting: "the CPUSA's own cover arm was an integral part of Soviet atomic espionage" (226); the CPUSA involvement in Soviet atomic espionage "undermine[d] the American political process." (218) The Soviet testing of an atomic bomb in 1949 destroyed the monopoly which the United States government hoped to retain for 10 to 20 years and destroyed the American "sense of physical security." The United States would henceforth have to face the danger of "serious civilian deaths or destruction" (225) just like Europe and the USSR, the authors might have added. Once again, a case of *deux poids, deux mesures*. However, the authors do not stop there: "Had the American nuclear monopoly lasted longer, Stalin might have refused to allow north Korean Communists to launch the Korean War, or the Chinese Communists might have hesitated to intervene in the war...." (226) The authors do not produce a single scrap of evidence to support such assertions. And then there is this preposterous statement: American "communists' duplicity [with Soviet agencies] poisoned normal political relationships and contributed to the harshness of the anti-communist reaction of the late 1940s and 1950s [read McCarthyism]." (106) Do the authors know nothing of Secretary of State Robert Lansing's malignant anti-Bolshevism, even in 1917, or of the 1919 Red scare, the Palmer raids, and the virulent anti-communism of the inter-war years which in the 1930s impeded the defence of the west against Nazism?

The gap between the authors' evidence and the authors' conclusions is wide. The above examples are not exceptions; on the contrary, in virtually every section of this tract the attentive reader will find such gaps. They call into question the very integrity of the scholarship. Yale University Press promises more books from these authors; the press would

do well to apply the epigram "Doubt everything" to their subsequent work.

"Mind the gap," warns the piped recording in the London Underground to exiting passengers. Readers! Mind the gap also! The evidence adduced in this tract suggests, contrary to the authors' view, that the CPUSA was a relatively small organization, largely made up of amateurs, working with small financial and other resources and having at times inadequate or sporadic communications with the Comintern and between its own various elements. While the CPUSA may well have had close working ties with Soviet intelligence agencies, the evidence produced by the authors fails to show it.

Michael Jabara Carley  
Ottawa

Bryan D. Palmer, *E.P. Thompson: Objections and Oppositions* (London: Verso 1994).

AS REGULAR READERS of *Labour/Le Travail* will already know, Bryan Palmer enjoyed enduring and increasingly close professional and personal ties with Edward Thompson during the last twenty years of the Thompson's life. Founded upon common commitments to historical writing, left politics and internationalism, and notwithstanding differences of culture, age, upbringing and occasional "rocky moments," the "odd friendship" between Thompson and Palmer developed a profound strength characterized by "an awkward mutuality," "reciprocal humours and self-deprecations" and passionate loyalties and objections. Thompson's death in the summer of 1993 "literally stopped" Palmer in his tracks. Palmer returned from paying respect to and celebrating Thompson's life at the family home in Worcester to write an obituary for *Labour/Le Travail*. The obituary grew, in veritable Thompsonian manner, into a "lengthy essay," published in two parts in 1993 and 1994, to stand as an eloquent and moving tribute to a fine,

passionate man and a historian of genius. The equally eloquent, moving and, we might add, rich, elegant, suggestive, and wide-ranging book under review is a useful and fascinating extension of this original "lengthy essay."

As Palmer himself observes in his Preface, the book does not claim to be a biography of Thompson. A full biography will, suggests the author, "no doubt be written some day, but it will of necessity entail deep researches into archival sources, family papers, far-flung correspondences, personal relationships, and the political and intellectual history of the mid-to-late twentieth century. It will require resources of expertise and sensitivity rarely found in any individual student of history; knowledges and appreciations that reach across the chronologies and academic boundaries, politics and poetics, that Thompson traversed in his life as a chronic objector. This will be a long and important treatment of a life of significance and complexity." Palmer's aim is more limited: "What follows will prove a mere footnote to this study, a memoir and a homage that skirt as much as they probe, introducing sets of reflections that are meant to illuminate suggestively more than they aim to provide definitive detail."

Palmer is, furthermore, only too aware of the potential dangers of hagiography and uncritical writing raised by his friendship with and admiration for Thompson. The author thus acknowledges openly his particular points of commitment and the "sense of benevolence" with which he has regarded his subject. But Palmer's overriding concern rests not with the presentation of a rigorously critical evaluation of Thompson's academic and political practice, but with setting his subject within his own context, terms of reference, and norms and values. Just as Thompson sought to restore contextualization, agency, worth, and respect to the lives of early 19th-century labouring people so Bryan Palmer is keen for the reader to hear Thompson's own voice and

observe the ways in which Thompson developed his outlook on life and his multifaceted personal and social identities. Thompson may not have to be rescued, like the stockingers and poor handloom weavers, from the "enormous condescension of posterity" (although the unpredictable swings of political and intellectual fashion may induce such a movement within the burgeoning "Thompson industry"), but the reconstruction of his own life, context and terms of reference is of undoubted historiographical, personal, and political importance. Palmer expresses well his purpose: "I know I have offered too many pages here, and I know, quite acutely, that they are likely to be dismissed, as have other pages I have written on Thompson, as 'hagiographic'. Thompson himself thought my 1980 book on him 'too uncritical perhaps?'. I have written these pages in what I tried to make Thompson's terms, rather than mine. My own criticisms seem rather unimportant at the moment. There will be others to do this kind of much-needed work. They should attend, however, to Thompson's own *history*, which this comment has pointed towards, and which the factory management of the Thompson academic industry has been lax in coaxing into production. They may find explanations and resonances in Thompson's past with those areas where legitimate difference arises out of his historical and political writings." (165-6).

Central to Palmer's project, therefore, is the construction of meaning. And, in true Thompsonian fashion, meaning is to be sought not in largely free-floating and de-contextualized ideas and languages, but rather in a series of engagements between language and ideas and the social world, between concept and evidence, the "personal" and the "social," the "personal" and the "historical" and 'political,' and between agency and conditioning structures. The Thompsonian method of historical investigation is, in effect, geared to the study and illumination of the teacher himself. The primary

task for Palmer is to empathize hermeneutically and to understand rather than rigorously and clinically to interrogate, criticize, and judge the academic and political work of the object of enquiry. Failure to appreciate this fact has, predictably and mistakenly led one recent critic, James D. Young, to condemn Palmer's study as "hagiographical and uncritical."

There is no doubt that *E.P. Thompson: Objections and Oppositions* succeeds admirably in fulfilling the aims of its author. Thompson's democratic, morally-charged, and socialist-humanist voice comes through loud and clear in his various roles as academic, political activist and "chronic objector" to cant, frozen orthodoxies, tyrannies and voices of unreason. The warm-heartedness and great generosity of E.P.T., whether as teacher or friend, combined with his sharp impatience with student and other examples of self-indulgence and lack of discipline, are also clearly revealed. And the text is full of illuminations, suggestions, reflections, and acute insights. The chronological and geographical span is impressive. For example, chapter one roots Thompson's internationalism partly in widespread family traditions and connections stretching from the United States (through his mother's side of the family), to Bulgaria (where his communist brother, Frank, fighting for the Partisans, had been executed), to India (where his father had engaged with politics of Indian independence), to Italy (where Edward served during World War II) and Yugoslavia (where Edward and Dorothy Towers, his future wife, worked on the Yugoslav Youth Railway construction project). Subsequent chapters cover a wide variety of topics. Chapters two and three embrace Edward and Dorothy's years in Halifax and involvement in extra-mural education and the Communist Party; their anti-Fascism and anti-Stalinism; their departure from the Party in 1956; the mixed reception to the publication of the *The Making of the English Working Class* (1963); and the intellectually productive, if politically

charged, period at Warwick University during the late 1960s and early 1970s. Thompson's disillusionment with and assaults upon Althusserian and many other forms of dogmatic and/or theoreticist Marxism during the 1970s, his massive influence upon the peace movement of the 1980s, and his continuing objections, passions and visions up to his death constitute the core subjects of chapters four to the concluding chapter seven.

Palmer tells his story in an engaging, nuanced, and lively manner. He writes clearly and with passion. *E.P. Thompson: Objections and Oppositions* is a "good read" which undoubtedly merits the attention of a wide range of readers, both academic and non-academic. As indicated earlier, the author is, however, fully alive to the fact that, as memoir, his study lacks by its very nature the completeness of a full biography. There are gaps to be filled and issues and questions which merit further elaboration: the nature of Thompson's domestic life; the links and tensions between the personal and the public/political; the profound emphasis on creative and democratic self- and collective activity and organization; and the sharp critique of Leninist vanguardism offered in *The Making of the English Working Class*. The nature of Thompson's political allegiances and visions in his later life, his thoughts upon the contemporary crisis and futures of socialism and organized labour, the nature of his long relations with the labour movement and manual and white-collar workers (which in turn could tell us much about the important, longstanding, and problematic issue of building lasting and mutually beneficial relations between middle- and working-class socialists in Britain), and the 'places' and 'functions' of socialist intellectuals in British academic and public life are topics which also merit extended treatment.

To offer such suggestions is, of course, to go way beyond the stated terms of reference of *E.P. Thompson: Objections and Oppositions*. Having produced

an excellent "footnote," Bryan Palmer is eminently qualified to write, either individually or as part of a collective, the complete biography of E.P. Thompson.

Neville Kirk  
Manchester Metropolitan University

Cormac O'Grada, *Ireland Before and After the Famine: Explorations in Economic History, 1800-1925* (Manchester and New York: Manchester University Press 1993).

IT IS RARE for a book that deals with relatively technical problems in Irish agricultural and demographic history (especially one that bears the imprint of a university press), to appear in a second edition so soon after the publication of the first. In the case of this volume, this can be partly explained by growing public and scholarly interest in the Irish Famine. Between its original publication in 1988 and the observance in 1995 of the one hundred and fiftieth anniversary of the arrival of the potato blight in Ireland, the number of famine-centred titles in print grew from a mere handful to a few dozen. But the popularity of this book is due above all to its impressive scholarship and to the author's ability to present innovative ideas about complex subjects in a clear and stimulating way.

The five inter-related essays which comprise *Ireland Before and After the Famine* are essentially the same as those which appeared in the first edition. Each has been revised and expanded to accommodate new research, to correct minor errors and to make stylistic improvements. O'Grada also adds some new items to the appendixes that are attached to every chapter, among them a letter from Charles Stewart Parnell's grandfather in 1798 which suggests that he helped shape Thomas Malthus' ideas about checks to over-population.

Malthus is the starting point for O'Grada's opening chapter on the pre-Famine economy. Early 19th-century Ire-

land appears to substantiate basic Malthusian principles: a rapidly expanding rural population awash in poverty and heavily dependant upon a single, highly vulnerable source of food, naturally fell victim to the calamity of 1845-50. This scenario, O'Grada argues, is over-simplified. The potato was a boon to most Irish people: there was nothing in their experience to suggest that it was a dangerous crop and its nutritional content protected them from the kinds of maladies that afflicted the masses of poor in other countries. Ireland's poverty, which was abysmal by any standards and which grew worse over time, was not uniformly pernicious. For those who survived infancy, life expectancy was about the same as in other European societies. Nor did their poverty make the Irish lower classes less healthy than their counterparts elsewhere. Data from the service records of the British Admiralty, in fact, indicate that Irish males were taller and presumably better-fed in childhood and adolescence than those of most other countries, including Britain.

Despite its inequities and its deficiencies, Ireland's economy before 1845 "did not contain the seeds of its own inevitable destruction by famine." (40) Had the potato blight not struck or had it struck later than it did, cheap sea transportation and expanding labour opportunities in Britain and America after mid-century would have provided a comparatively painless remedy for the country's poverty and over-population. To suggest, as O'Grada does, that one of the worse tragedies of the Famine lay in its unfortunate timing is not to make light of the calamity itself.

Without the Famine, it is also likely that historians would have judged 18th and early 19th Irish agriculture more favourably than they have. We lack abundant evidence concerning many aspects of pre-Famine farming but, as O'Grada shows in his second essay, it would appear to have been much healthier than

many have assumed. For all of its importance in the diets of Irish people, the potato accounted for a mere one-fifth of agricultural output in the early 1840s. Per-acre yields of other crops, especially wheat, barley and oats, compare favourably with those in other European countries. Agriculture on the eve of the Famine was highly commercialized: at least a quarter of everything produced on the land was exported. The traditional picture of a stagnant, backward economy in this period is therefore difficult to sustain.

O'Grada's essay on the "incidence and ideology" of the Famine offers a corrective to so-called revisionists who would downplay mortality figures and absolve British statesmen from blame in their mishandling of the crisis. About one million people, or one-ninth of the population, died as a result of the catastrophe of 1845-50, most of them from typhus and other Famine-related diseases. But in a real sense those who died were also victims of ideas — the ideas of political economists such as Adam Smith and Nassau Senior which guided the thinking of policy-makers in Whitehall on the matter of Famine relief and which were unsuited to the task of saving so many lives. O'Grada's discussion of these matters anticipates the more extensive recent work of such scholars as Peter Gray and Christine Kinealy.

This book concludes with two shorter essays on the post-Famine economy and population. The first suggests that traditional perceptions of such matters as landlord-tenant relations, the laziness of Irish farmers and the adoption of agricultural innovations since the mid-19th century have been overly gloomy. The final chapter is a wide-ranging discussion of inheritance, emigration and fertility.

Many of the ideas and arguments presented here are developed further in O'Grada's important new work, *Ireland: A New Economic History, 1780-1939*. Both books offer challenging ideas and

insights on almost every page and deserve to be read by everyone who has an interest in the economic and social forces that have shaped modern Ireland.

Gary Owens  
Huron College  
University of Western Ontario

Jean-Louis Robert, *Les Ouvriers, la Patrie et la Révolution, Paris 1914-1919* (Besançon: l'Université de Besançon 1995).

L'AUTEUR JEAN-LOUIS Robert, professeur à l'Université d'Orléans, présente dans ce livre la deuxième partie de sa thèse d'État intitulée *Ouvriers et mouvements ouvriers parisiens pendant la Grande Guerre et l'immédiat après guerre, histoire et anthropologie*. Il tente d'y suivre, comme le titre l'indique, l'attitude des ouvriers et du mouvement ouvrier à Paris entre le début de la guerre en 1914 et le traité de Versailles. L'auteur suit en parallèle deux volets du mouvement ouvrier, soit l'activité syndicale d'une part, et l'évolution du parti socialiste, d'autre part. À cause des aléas de la documentation conservée, le premier aspect fait cependant l'objet d'une couverture beaucoup plus systématique et développée que le premier. Grèves et réunions de base sont analysées de façon exhaustive, minutieuse et critique à partir de procès-verbaux et comptes rendus de réunions et d'assemblées, de rapports de police, de correspondances, de journaux, etc.

Les résultats de la recherche sont présentés sous forme chronologique en quatre grandes sections correspondant à des phases majeures de la guerre. La première, qui couvre la période entre août 1914 et décembre 1916, insiste sur des cassures décisives qui apparaissent et persisteront jusqu'à la fin de la guerre. Malgré l'Union sacrée au début de la guerre, on y voit se dessiner un mouvement pacifiste plus fort dans le département de la Seine qu'ailleurs en France, plus fort à

l'intérieur de certains syndicats et certaines sections socialistes et plus fort en banlieue parisienne que dans la capitale. Se développent également un discours et une pratique contradictoires, car si on critique vivement l'État, qui met en danger les intérêts des travailleurs, on sollicite son intervention de façon permanente.

«Le temps des crises» entre décembre 1916 et mars 1918 présente ensuite un mouvement social d'une ampleur sans précédent. Une certaine lassitude face à la guerre et ses effets sur la condition ouvrière jointe à une conjonction complexe où se cumulent des facteurs climatiques, économiques, militaires, de même que les premiers échos de la Révolution russe, entraînent une vague de grèves majeure, en particulier en mai-juin 1917. Ces dernières, féminines à 80 pour cent, ont la particularité d'émerger de la base et non du mouvement syndical organisé, reflétant la marginalité dans laquelle les femmes ont été tenues par ce mouvement. La progression du pacifisme ouvrier se poursuit et on voit s'opérer une césure entre un mouvement syndical en pleine expansion et un mouvement socialiste en chute libre.

Entre mars et novembre 1918, alors que l'offensive allemande et la contre-offensive alliée se succèdent, les sentiments profonds des travailleurs parisiens se révèlent. Même s'ils partagent tous une forme ou une autre de défensisme, le sentiment de classe et le sentiment inégalé de la nécessité de la lutte sociale se manifestent clairement. La guerre a accentué la fracture sociale, laissant d'un côté les ouvriers parisiens qui renforcent le mouvement syndical et de l'autre les patrons dont l'image négative est très généralement partagée.

La dernière section, peut être la plus réussie, porte sur juin 1919 et le mouvement de grève qui se développa pendant cette période caractérisée par la reconversion de l'économie, la démobilisation et l'attente du traité de paix. Toute la section est centrée sur la grève des métallos parisiens et le débat sur sa nature révolu-

tionnaire. L'analyse aborde d'abord l'idéologie des grévistes, polarisée du côté négatif par Clémenceau, les bourgeois et les dirigeants syndicaux confédéraux et fédéraux (à cause de leur refus d'entrer dans une dynamique révolutionnaire), et du côté positif par la Révolution soviétique, nouveau phare du mouvement ouvrier. Sont ensuite examinés les lieux de grèves et les stratégies de rue et brièvement les rapports avec les autres composantes de la classe ouvrière parisienne, en général centrées exclusivement sur les revendications à court terme plutôt que sur la révolution sociale.

Dans l'ensemble, on aurait pu s'attendre à une réflexion plus approfondie sur les relations entre les concepts de classe et de nation, pourtant au cœur de l'ouvrage. L'auteur, parti «d'une conception assez délibérément empirique pour éviter d'aboutir à une conclusion préinscrite dans un positionnement préétabli» n'arrive pas à une conclusion très claire à cet égard. On peut également déceler une perspective un peu étroite de l'approche qui est exclusivement centrée sur la région parisienne pendant la période considérée. Des comparaisons avec l'ensemble de la France, une contextualisation de l'analyse dans un temps plus long et une insertion plus importante dans les débats historiographiques auraient certes pu enrichir considérablement l'étude. Ces ajouts auraient d'autant plus augmenté l'intérêt des lecteurs que l'ensemble de l'ouvrage est collé trop étroitement à la thèse initiale «légèrement remaniée,» selon la présentation au dos de l'ouvrage. On pourrait ajouter trop légèrement remaniée. La profusion des détails et des nuances, de même que le foisonnement des intervenants pour la plupart inconnus, font en effet perdre de vue la perspective d'ensemble. Si dans une thèse, on n'a pas à se préoccuper des connaissances générales des membres du jury et qu'on se doit d'étayer sa thèse de façon très détaillée, un volume destiné au public, même historien, doit y être plus sensible. C'est là la responsabilité de la maison

d'édition qui doit exiger de l'auteur d'une thèse qu'il épargne au lecteur les mille et un méandres de la recherche pour mieux faire ressortir les grandes articulations de l'analyse. Le travail d'édition de cet ouvrage ne mérite d'ailleurs pas de félicitations car on y retrouve de nombreuses erreurs de toutes sortes.

Globalement, on peut souligner la patience et la minutie du travail de Jean-Louis Robert et la contribution certaine qu'il apporte à la connaissance du mouvement ouvrier. On peut cependant s'interroger sur l'audience qu'il recevra en dehors d'un cercle très étroit, alors qu'il apparaît clairement que l'auteur disposait des matériaux requis pour être à la hauteur des attentes suscitées par un titre aussi attrayant.

Christine Piette  
Université Laval

Lee Palmer Wandel, *Voracious Idols and Violent Hands: Iconoclasm in Reformation Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel* (Cambridge, New York and Melbourne: Cambridge University Press 1995).

ICONOCLASM, the destruction of religious images, is one of the areas where the popular energies behind the 16th-century Reformation become most evident. Iconoclasm was, in part, supported by the teachings of Reformation theologians, who wanted the images removed, but only in an orderly and legal manner. Ultimately iconoclasm was legitimized, with evident reluctance, by governing powers that were more concerned with the maintenance of civil order than with any of the disputed notions of true Christianity. Accordingly, by means of iconoclasm, anonymous actors from the "ordinary people" pressured and interacted with the theological and political elites. The end result was the bare austerity of the reformed churches of south Germany and Switzerland, one of the most striking material effects of the "Reformed" Reformation, which distinguished it not only from



the material richness of medieval Latin Christianity, but also from the cult of north Germany and Scandinavia, where Lutheran theologians and rulers suppressed iconoclasm, with its explosive popular energies.

As in her previous book, *Always Among Us: Images of the Poor in Zwingly's Zurich*, Lee Palmer Wandel has chosen a topic of importance to the social history of religion. As in that book, too, the source material on the main topic is limited. She has picked the three self-governing towns of Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel and closely analyzed trial records, petitions and chronicle accounts of iconoclasm there, as it was connected with the institution of a fully Protestant religious regime. This research has gone beyond published documentary collections and sifted hitherto unused archival material.

The resulting book is basically a collection of four essays with introduction and conclusion. The first articulates the sophisticated medieval theology of images, going back to the Syrian saint John of Damascus. This is followed by three essays on the iconoclasm of Zurich, Strasbourg and Basel, respectively. Iconoclasm presents different faces in these three polities. In Zurich, following less than a year of individual acts of iconoclasm, which were severely, if not draconically, punished, in June 1524 a committee of the town government systematically destroyed the objects of the older religious cult. In Strasbourg a much longer process stretching over seven years from 1524 was marked by the gradual "purification" of the town from religious images by the direct action of persons who were at first lightly punished, then admonished to refrain from further destruction, and in the end given full endorsement by a government mandate of February 1530. In Basel the government temporized with iconoclastic activists in 1528 and tried to maintain a policy of religious pluralism. The outcome was a riot of some two hundred commoners, that physically destroyed the religious ob-

jects of the old faith during two days in February 1529, and forced the governing council not only to acquiesce in the iconoclasm and complete it, but also to accept an exclusively Protestant religious order and to purge its own membership. Only in the trial records of iconoclasts from Zurich do the individual motives of the image-breakers come to light. In Strasbourg and Basel iconoclasm is presented as a more or less anonymous elemental force that the preachers encourage, to some degree, and to which the rulers surrender, despite their quest for compromise solutions. This difference is due to the author's primary dependence on chronicles in her treatment of Strasbourg and Basel, which is not the case in her treatment of Zurich.

The book establishes some important points about early Reformation iconoclasm. Most importantly it establishes the evangelical commoners ("ordinary people") as independent actors whose deeds cannot be accounted for by initiatives of the elites, the preachers and rulers. Also, Palmer Wandel shows that "iconoclasm" was more than a destruction of representative art such as could be attacked with Old Testament proof-texts; it included candles and altars, the whole eye-catching material paraphernalia of the old faith, which was forced to yield to the ear-catching Word, of the preachers, of the bible, and, presumably, of God.

Conditioned by the heterogeneity of her sources, Wandel interprets the motivation of iconoclasm as differing from town to town. In Zurich the material elements of worship, together with the tithe, amounted to robbery of the poor, "the true images of God," as well as fleecing of other commoners who wanted to "downsize" the elaborate and expensive medieval religious order. Some of the same tones were sounded in Strasbourg as in Zurich, but the main theme was that images were ancillary to altars upon which the "blasphemous" cult of the mass was centred ("blasphemous" because, to the Protestant way of thinking, the unique

sacrifice of Christ could not be repeated in the mass). In Basel Wandel sees anti-clericalism as the main theme, and the climactic iconoclastic riot as a carnivalesque invasion by commoners of the sacred space of an arrogant and privileged clerical elite. No doubt all of these motives played some part in the iconoclastic actions of the Reformation in Switzerland and south Germany.

The essays work well with a limited source material pertinent to an important topic. They impute a symbolic language to the iconoclastic acts, which the author interprets gracefully and imaginatively. One is sometimes reminded of Freudianism and its principle of "overdetermination," in which symbolic meanings are heaped upon each other and the more explanations the better. There may be something inherently subversive in interpreting Protestant history in this way. After all, Protestantism began in the search for the single "true" import of God's Word, as opposed to the "sea of meaning" favoured in medieval biblical exegesis.

James M. Stayer  
Queen's University

Hans-Jurgen Arendt, Sabine Hering, and Leonie Wagner, eds., *Nationalsozialistische Frauenpolitik vor 1933: Dokumentation* (Frankfurt/Main: dipa-Verlag 1995).

THIS IMPORTANT collection of documents dealing with National Socialist attitudes and policies directed towards women prior to 1933 fills an important gap in our knowledge of the development of National Socialist ideologies and practices in the years prior to the seizure of power. While there have been numerous works, including some excellent studies in English, on the effects of the Nazi regime between 1933-45, relatively little is known of the early years, when the Nazi party languished in obscurity along with other radical right wing movements until the depression provided a trigger for extremists of all sorts.

As Annette Kuhn points out in the preface, the study of these documents make it clear that as early as the summer of 1932, the general outlines of the Nazi programmes and attitudes towards women were clearly in place. The emphasis on racism, family politics, "eugenics" and the reduction of women to breeders of the next generation was clearly expressed, as was the gendered idea of the Nazi body politic, which clearly excluded women from high party office.

Part I of the book provides a thorough historical overview for the period under consideration, based on the editors' extensive readings of the documents. Part II contains the 257 documents selected for this volume. These are diverse: there are copies of official party directives involving women's organization; official pronouncements and speeches by party leaders and ideologists; propagandistic statements found in brochures and manifestos; articles in the printed media; as well as excerpts from diaries; memoirs, and letters, often from the women who helped to further this male-dominated and misogynist movement. Ironically, the vast majority of women who devoted their energies to furthering the Nazi cause believed they were achieving a position of equality on the basis of the National Socialist *Weltanschauung* which assigned radically separate spheres to men and women.

Part III is an appendix containing useful information on female membership in the Party and its auxiliaries, female voting patterns, short biographies, a chronology, and an index. This is followed by a series of photos and graphically illustrated documents. The quality of printing and photographic reproductions is high, and the book is well worth the DM 58. It is also worth noting that the book represents a fruitful collaborative effort involving scholars from both the Federal Republic of Germany and the former German Democratic Republic.

The book helps to further not only our understanding of the appeal of radical right-wing approaches to the "woman

question" to certain segments of the (mainly middle class) population, especially during times of economic dislocation during the 1920s and 1930s: it also sheds light on current right-wing radicalism and gender issues in Germany. National Socialist women formed an anti-feminist women's movement against the German women's movement, and were important in creating some respectability for the often rowdy members of the early Nazi party. The fact that present female sympathizers of the German Republican party also see themselves as the guardians of "feminine values" and opposed to feminism raises the issue of the continuity of certain constructions of womanhood, and the importance of these to the political realm.

Rosemarie Schade  
Concordia University

Eduardo Silva, *Prince of the People: The Life and Times of a Brazilian Free Man of Colour* (London: Verso, 1993).

BRAZIL in the 19th century was far more than the masters and the slaves. The free-born and freed — white, mulatto, mestizo and black — were numerous and participated in a dynamic and expanding economy, especially in the towns and on the agricultural and mining frontiers. A significant part of the free and freed were immigrants from Europe and Africa, who retained their links with their homelands (as the Brazilian quarter in Lagos, Nigeria attests) and their ethnic identity. Brazil during the Imperial regime (1822-1889) thus provides an excellent case study of the interplay of class, race, gender and ethnicity which has in recent years constituted such a rewarding approach to analysing the past.

One drawback to such a study of Imperial Brazil is the relative paucity of materials. The regime possessed no strong apparatus of control (and so generated limited records). The subordinated groups were not literate, and the en-

trenched system which dreamed of Brazil as the France of South America ignored their cultures. Eduardo Silva neatly circumvents the problem of sources by focusing his study on a single individual. Cândido da Fonseca Galvao a.k.a. His Highness Prince Oba II of Africa, hitherto dismissed as an alcoholic eccentric, was, as the author effectively shows, representative of a key socio-cultural group — the free-born men of colour — and a paradigm for analysis of the larger dynamics of society.

The subject of Silva's work was born at Lençoes in the diamond region of Bahia, the son of a former slave who was Yoruba, born in what is now Nigeria. On the mining frontier the factors of production were not so tightly controlled nor were cultural and racial boundaries so rigid. It was possible for an ex-slave to make an independent living and for his son to acquire the rudiments of the dominant culture, in particular literacy. The outbreak of the war against Paraguay in 1865 offered an avenue for advancement. The ranks of the *Voluntários da Pátria* (Volunteers of the Fatherland) contained both rich and poor, cultured and illiterate, white and coloured. Fonseca Galvao gained the post of sublieutenant. By a tradition inherited from the colonial period, military officers enjoyed *fidalgos* (noble) status.

Hopes for continued upward mobility proved vain. Invalided out of the war in 1866 with a hand wound, Fonseca Galvao found himself without prospects and without any means of living. He eventually moved to the national capital, Rio de Janeiro, and there he developed a new persona. Without denying the dominant religion, language and dress, he presented himself as Dom Oba II Príncipe d'Africa, the leader by birthright of an ethnic community — the Yoruba immigrants and their descendants. By so doing he sought both to secure his own place in the dominant society and to act as mediator for and so gain a clientele within the ethnic community.

As Silva demonstrates in Chapters 6 and 8 (perhaps the best parts of the book), Dom Oba achieved some success in the second goal during the 1880s, making effective use of the Yoruba symbols of power. Far from inhabiting a dream world, Fonseca Galvao-Dom Oba was an integral part of the *pequena Africa* (little Africa) of Rio city that blended the African and the Portuguese. The dominant culture did not take him seriously but, being patriarchal, client-oriented, and personal, it accommodated him, especially since he offered it no challenge. He could attend the Emperor's public audiences on Saturdays, bombard the authorities and newspapers with letters, and eke out a living from others' charity.

This kingdom fell with the Empire, overthrown by an army coup in November 1889. Stripped of his honorary lieutenancy for opposing the new republic, Dom Oba was no longer tolerated. He died a few months later. The people of colour were driven downwards by the flood of immigrants from Europe. Class and racial categories, much more strictly defined and enforced, were becoming synonymous.

Eduardo Silva's study is not flawless. It lacks a strong conceptual framework, so the individual chapters form separate studies of differing purpose and varying merit. The first two chapters in particular are too rambling and descriptive. The author seems oblivious to gender as a category of analysis. The text contains both mistakes of fact and misconceptions. Some of these may, however, be due to the translator's lack of understanding of the Brazilian context. Her lack of skill at times produces clumsy English. Nonetheless, the work is innovative, stimulating and shows what can be achieved in the field of Brazilian history.

Roderick J. Barman  
University of British Columbia

Christine Hünefeldt, *Paying the Price of Freedom: Family and Labor among Lima's Slaves, 1800-1854* (Berkeley: University of California Press 1994).

SLAVERY IN PERU ended with a governmental decree but according to this excellent monograph, the slaves themselves had already eroded the institution long before Peru's legislators succumbed to the tides of the movement for abolition. Rather than passive pawns in this struggle over the chains of human bondage, Lima's slaves were extremely inventive in their campaigns for personal freedom and did not accept either the identity or the values which owners tried to impose upon them. This book documents these strategies as well as the context in which they took place in post-Independence Peru. With the recent publication of Peter Blanchard's *Slavery and Abolition in Early Republican Peru*, the outlines of a once under-studied topic, Peruvian slavery in the early 19th century, are becoming clearer.

Although the slaves of Lima are the focus of this book, the author recognizes and explores the important connection between outlying estates and the urban centre. In a fascinating chapter, she describes not only the connections between the rural and urban worlds but the slaves' understanding that the opportunities for freedom were strategically better in the city. As such, they tried by whatever means possible to migrate. The reverberations of this connection between city and countryside in the lives of Lima's slaves re-emerges in other parts of the book. For example, recalcitrant slaves who petitioned either for a new master or for the chance to buy their freedom were often spirited away to an estate. This tactic, as practised by owners desperate to avoid considerable financial loss, was the object of many outraged petitions by the relatives of the slaves. This analytical perspective adds many more layers of complexity to the telling of the experiences of slaves; it provides a richness to

the monograph which would recommend it if only for this aspect.

Yet, the study has much more to offer. Marriage and the consequent family network were a major part of the slaves' tactics for freedom. Couples offered each other considerable support especially if one was free and could more easily petition authorities on the behalf of the enslaved partner. But the act of marriage, aside from any romantic inclinations, was an extremely potent weapon. The Catholic Church became one of the slaves' most important allies since the clerics upheld the rights of married slaves to cohabit. In their zeal to see the end of immoral extramarital relations, Church officials forbade the separation of married couples, prevented the sale of one partner or the transfer of one half of a couple to a distant place. The sanctity of marital relations thus became important within the arsenal of the slaves as they fought for their freedom.

The networks of marriage partners and children which derived from marriage were also vital to the slaves. Not only were those who had already escaped bondage able to intervene in abusive situations but also they had a greater capacity to acquire the funds to purchase the liberty of their relatives. Yet, the slaves themselves were not passive in this process. They often tried to lower their price to make freedom more accessible; they did so by feigning sickness or by acting out in a rebellious manner. Masters fought back by depositing these slaves in bakeries (which served as closed work-camps for disobedient slaves) or sending them into the countryside.

Slaves and their relatives also turned the values of Peruvian society against the masters and used these to attack the abuses they suffered. Female slaves, who often suffered the sexual depredations of male owners, argued that the loss of their virginity was grounds for manumission. Others contended that the fruit of such unions, a child born of a slave mother and free father, could not be a slave because

of its racial identity. Slave husbands argued against the presence of their wives in the same house as their own master since the humiliation of seemingly unavoidable abuses was inimical to the Catholic conception of marriage. Not all of these petitions were successful, but they demonstrate the slaves' understanding of the strategic use of the Catholic Church and the values which emanated from it and Peruvian society.

The author uses the testimony of slaves and their owners quite liberally and these excerpts provide a lively sense of the spirit of many of the slaves. It is clear that many of the slaves used the prevailing values of Peruvian society to their advantage but often rejected values which were demeaning to them. They challenged the identity which the elite wished to impose upon them and rejected the servitude which their condition implied. The complaints of masters can be just as evocative. In particular, the long saga, told by the mistress, of a slave called José Gregorio shows a very active and open contempt for the "rights" of ownership.

With impressive research, Christine Hünefeldt provides an engaging picture of the road to freedom for Lima slaves. She puts the slaves front and centre, making them the principal actors in this story. In fact, she concludes that the masters were not able to successfully resist the onslaught of the slaves' attacks on their bondage and in fact were fighting a losing battle. In this book, the politicians who eventually outlawed slavery in Peru are absent but they are not missed. It is an engaging study which historians of slavery and others specializing in the history of the family should read.

Sonya Lipsett-Rivera  
Carleton University

Kevin A. Yelvington, *Producing Power: Ethnicity, Gender, and Class in a Caribbean Workplace* (Philadelphia: Temple University Press 1995).

KEVIN A. YELVINGTON'S study of the interrelations of ethnicity, gender, and class in a Trinidadian factory is based on his participant observation from 1986 to 1987 and his doctoral thesis in social anthropology at the University of Sussex (1990). His fieldwork provided the basis for understanding the relations and culture in which these workers participate and for a critical evaluation of theories of social identity and social reproduction. This book is well organized and clearly written, the empirical observations well integrated with the theoretical concerns. Alongside Maria Patricia Fernandez-Kelly's *For We Are Sold, I and My People*, Aiwah Ong's *Spirits of Resistance and Capitalist Discipline*, and Helen I. Safa's *The Myth of the Male Breadwinner*, Yelvington's book is a major contribution to our understanding of the roles of women in the recent industrialization of the Third World.

An "industrial" organization of labour and ethnic segmentation of the labour process are not new in colonial and formerly colonized societies. Indeed, the Caribbean may be seen as having pioneered these aspects of the modern division of labour between the 17th and 19th centuries. Yelvington summarizes the wealth of material on the use of enslaved African and indentured Indian labour in Trinidad during the development of capitalism as the crucial context for the formation of contemporary inequalities based on ethnicity, gender, and class. What is relatively new in Trinidad, and many other countries, is the growth of export-led industrialization that coincides with a general decline of agricultural occupations. In this dual process there has been a dramatic decline in the jobs that are considered suitable for men and an increase in the availability of jobs for women, particularly young women.

The consequent restructuring of the labour force has resulted in more unemployed men and female breadwinners, a situation that has social implications reaching far beyond the workplace, into homes, politics, and social policy. The widespread nature of these changes gives Yelvington's study a significance far beyond the particular insights he provides into the social dynamics of a Trinidadian factory.

Employers in Trinidad use cultural and political as well as economic mechanisms to influence the availability and price of labour and to discipline their employees, but the employees react in various ways to the commodification of their labour power, often by drawing attention to the social and moral obligations that are implicit in the positions taken by the state and the capitalists. The historic transition from slave to wage labour, from the commodification of the labourer to that of his or her labour power, did not end their exploitation, but it did change the legal and social context of the continuing struggle for emancipation. By articulating a theory of practice that unites history, culture, structure, and human agency, and integrating the levels of the factory, the society, and the global economy, Yelvington clarifies the various ways that people may transform, and be formed by, the institutions and situations in which they work and live. As he says, "power and production are intimately bound up with each other and ... we cannot understand the creation and contestation of such significant social identities as ethnicity, class, and gender without also understanding the material productive arrangements of the specific context." (4) Yelvington takes a dialectical approach to the culture of domination and resistance: "Ethnicity, class, and gender are socially constructed in relation to each other," (8) and changing forms of consciousness and identity are related to changes in the mode of production. Chapter One outlines his theoretical approach to the interrelationship of ethnicity, gender, class, and the

politics of power under capitalism. Chapters Two and Three situate his ethnography in the history and economy of Trinidad and describe the work force and the work routine in the factory. Chapters Four, Five, and Six examine, in turn, ethnicity, gender, and class at work in the factory, and the conclusion returns to the theoretical issues with which the book began.

Like any good piece of scholarship, Yelvington's book raises as well as resolves questions. One question raised, for example, has to do with the distinction made by Michel de Certeau between strategies and tactics of resistance, in which tactics are conceived as an "art of the weak." While tactics may yield positive results, Yelvington points out that, "given the nature of the overarching power relationship, the utilization of these tactics provide [sic] a basis of further attempts to subordinate the subordinate in the long run." (229) Thus, a woman worker who emphasizes her passivity or sexuality in order to negotiate some improvement in her work situation contributes to the social construction of gender in such a way as to reinforce the subordination of women. Perhaps trade unions may be seen in this light, if we can see what is "strategic" at one level as a "tactic" at another level. To obtain unionization within a factory such as the one Yelvington studied may be a strategic victory for the workers, but in the society as a whole trade unionism remains a tactic of the weak in so far as it continues to acknowledge the subordination of the workers under capitalism. The issue of union recognition, therefore, may be crucial to workers' resistance in the factory, while it is a matter of compromise with capitalism in the society at large.

Yelvington's analysis is commendable because he helps us understand the variety of ways that people define and are socially defined in terms of their ethnic, gender, and class identities by the power relationships in their society. These relationships, because they are historically

and culturally specific, cannot be derived from abstractions about "hegemony" or "modes of production," but can be understood, as Yelvington shows quite brilliantly, only as they exist in the real activities of real people in particular conditions.

O. Nigel Bolland  
Colgate University

Zachary Lockman, ed., *Workers and Working Classes in the Middle East: Struggles, Histories, Historiographies* (Albany: State University of New York Press 1994).

THIS ANTHOLOGY on the state of the art in Middle Eastern labour history resulted from a 1990 workshop at Harvard University. It consists of articles with different methodologies, theoretical, temporal, and regional focuses by leading historians of the Middle East, many specialists in labour history. It provides a wealth of information to the non-area-specialist labour historian as well as conceptual and historiographical insights to the general Middle East historian. The all-too-common problem of eclecticism in anthologies deriving from conferences has been averted in this volume by a comprehensive analytical introduction by the editor and two critical essays at the end (by Edmund Burke III and Dipesh Chakrabarty), all informed by the debates at the workshop.

The study of workers and working classes in the Middle East has been neglected due to various historiographical biases. The Orientalist disdain for subaltern social groups and identities has reinforced the modernization theorists' conventional privileging of elites. Proponents of dependency theory have emphasized class, but devoted insufficient attention to a working class weakened by Western industrial capitalism. Recently, the New Left has focused attention on the working class as a revolutionary agent by subscribing to a more rigid Marxist analysis.

In the Introduction, Zachary Lockman reviews the existing paradigms and presents the revisionist agenda of this project. (*Labour may be on the margin of Middle Eastern studies, but Lockman's discussion reveals that labour history is far from being the most neglected aspect of Middle Eastern social history, in large part thanks to the past work of the contributors to this book.*) The Introduction, with diversity as its main theme, addresses the merits of the Middle East as a unit of analysis. The editor discusses the pitfalls of accepting the Middle East as a unit of inquiry by virtue of common (Islamic) cultural patterns or common transformations under the impact of the capitalist world economy. Lockman concludes that the Middle East is "a legitimate entity because it has meaning for many people, within the region itself and outside of it, however that meaning was originally produced." (xvii) He is less inclined to view the "working class" as a useful category; to be sure, the plurals in the book's title point to the project's emphasis on the multiplicity of experiences, self-views, and narratives.

The authors pose a number of new directions in the study of Middle Eastern labour and many agree on a research agenda that moves discourse analysis to the forefront. There is an overall appeal to view workers not only in the workplace but in their daily lives, and in the context of their domestic and public cultural practices rather than as the members of a vanguard fulfilling its deterministic role in the factory.

The core of the book consists of essays on Egypt. Why and how Egypt has come to constitute the laboratory for the study of Middle Eastern labour, however, is not addressed in the historiographical and historical discussion. Egypt does serve as a useful model here, and conceptualizations and problematics most elaborately articulated for Egypt are effectively addressed by the non-Egyptianist contributors as well. Yet, the focus on Egypt also creates a certain imbalance.

Several authors (Lockman, Joel Beinin, Ellis Goldberg) offer new insights and correctives on their past work on Egypt, as others (Kristin Koptiuch, Marsha Pripstein Posusney) dialogue closely with that work. The nuanced presentation of theoretical and historiographical issues pertaining to Egypt in a number of historical periods contrasts with the compendious substantive treatments of "histories and historiographies," particularly in the chapters on Turkey (Feroz Ahmad), Iran (Assef Bayat), and Iraq (Eric Davis).

These differences in scope and methodology do not present problems in the cohesion of the book, which is organized chronologically, but in the project's thematic consistency. In the early chapters, Sherry Vatter and Donald Quataert provide the late Ottoman backdrop. There are parallels between Quataert's broader analysis of state-labour relations and Vatter's appraisal of the journeyman-master relationship in Damascus. Both authors stress guild dynamism, and point to the workings of a moral economy in the workers' demands for fairness. Quataert discusses the modes in which workers expressed their grievances (petitions, public appeals) even as they groped for collective action in unions (which looked more like guilds than modern syndicates) vis-à-vis a repressive state.

In the first article that treats Egypt, Koptiuch describes the persistence of vibrant petty commodity production long after Egypt confronted industrial capitalism and well into the 20th century, thus imparting further strength to the case for abolishing the sharp dichotomies between artisan labour and "proletarian" labour. In a separate chapter, Lockman elaborates on another main theme of the volume: the significance of investigating the cultural components of class formation while exploring and accounting for the multifarious narratives of labour history, foremost among them those reflecting worker subjectivity. Goldberg then addresses one manifestation of the workers' voice by analysing some memoirs of Egyptian la-



bour activists from the 1930s. He argues that a relationship of agency rather than subordination prevailed between the workers and administrators/owners of textile factories as a result of the workers' rational expectation of benefits (primarily job security) deriving from enhanced productivity. Posusney, in contrast, is skeptical of attempts to understand worker consciousness with the very limited discursive evidence. She turns her attention to an analysis of collective action and upholds the moral economy argument by concluding that worker action in contemporary Egypt is by and large restorative (if not symbolic) rather than rational, seeking more favourable terms at times of economic prosperity. In the last chapter on Egypt, Beinín turns to contemporary Egyptian critiques of the historical role of the Left in the workers' movement as one of betrayal and co-opting by the Nasserist state. Beinín does not reject this argument, but takes issue with the contention that such betrayal was responsible for the dissipation of a revolutionary opportunity in 1977. The social movement of the late 1970s encompassed many different subaltern strata, he argues, which lacked a unified consciousness.

The volume's stress on the need to analyze worker attitudes in a broader cultural, economic, and political context finds concrete expression in the articles by Ahmad and Bayat, who look at Turkey and Iran, respectively, across an extended period. While most contributors would agree on the importance of the role of women on the one hand and Islam on the other, in the project of shifting the focus from "structure" to "culture" it is only in Ahmad's account that we encounter the female worker's voice, and in Bayat's some analysis of how class consciousness has come to be articulated through religion. Bayat and Davis provide concise accounts of labour historiography pertaining to Iran and Iraq, respectively, while the Turkish experience provides Ahmad the opportunity to investigate the vicissitudes in the transformation of workers'

economic struggles into political ones. Particularly poignant in Davis' account is the prominent role that the Iraqi working class played in politics and society in the 1940s and 1950s by transcending ethnic differences.

As Burke points out in his comments, this volume might have benefitted from a more consciously comparative approach. And as the editor laments by pointing to the financial constraints of the workshop, the collection does not include contributions from labour scholars pursuing careers in parts of the Middle East that are the objects of their research. The anthology remains, however, as perhaps the single most significant contribution to the study of labour in the Middle East by virtue of its breadth of scope and revisionist import. It builds on existing theoretical ground by offering further conceptual nuances, fresh information, and new directions for empirical research. Indeed, this collective effort by the leading historians of labour should be a paradigm for other components of Middle Eastern subaltern studies.

Hasan Kayali

University of California, San Diego

Martin J. Murray, *The Revolution Deferred: The Painful Birth of Post-Apartheid South Africa* (New York and London: Verso Books 1994).

FOR THOSE LOOKING for a well-informed coherent study of the historical transition era in South Africa (1990-94), this new publication by Martin Murray will be a useful starting point. In the introduction, he suggests that he will be combining a sociological and conjunctural approach. In practice, *The Revolution Deferred* is largely good political narrative (if sociologically informed) with little theoretical input. Murray is an agrarian historian of agrarian South Africa who has previously written a study of the politics of the 1980s. This sequel, like its predecessor, is based primarily on a

close reading of the best periodical literature in the country assisted by discussions with some of the more perceptive analysts in South Africa. Perhaps due to hindsight, it is the better volume. Murray occasionally makes factual mistakes — "Venda ... straddling the Limpopo River" (65) — and some of his interpretations require more supporting evidence — "de Klerk remained a partially immobilized captive of the 'securocrats' left over from the Botha era" (89) — but he generally has a keen eye for what is significant.

This book virtually stops with the 1994 election; only a few paragraphs at the end look forward to the post-election era. The key issues are strategic: Murray gives an excellent sense of the changing balance of forces in the transition period. From a perspective sympathetic to revolutionary change, he observes and evaluates the United Democratic Front (UDF) and the exiled African National Congress (ANC), the trade union movements and the "civic" organizations. Much is devoted to showing how factors such as the weakening of the armed struggle, the trajectory of violence, structural divisions within black South Africa and even within the South African black working class, help to explain growing weaknesses on the side of the forces for change as negotiations proceeded.

There was a strange disjuncture in South Africa between the world of struggle politics and the hard bargaining behind closed doors that eventually brought about the creation of a new political order and it is difficult to evaluate the actions of the men and women who were engaged in both at once or in succession. Is there in fact, as the title suggests, a deferred revolution waiting in the wings? Murray skates close to saying that providence ought to "address" adequately the historical social ills of South Africa but why should this be the case without an effective political or economic actor? (2)

Perhaps following the limitations of the kind of sources to which Murray turned, the ANC itself has not been subject

to a sweeping analysis. If so, the conceptualization of a "deferred revolution" might be harder to sustain. The ANC does not really show signs of a clearcut division between left and right. On the one hand, there is a universally acknowledged, still raw history of struggle bathed in moral rectitude. On the other, there is a strong capacity for pragmatism and a tendency towards opportunism. Inside the ANC, there will continue to be Left intellectuals who plot a trajectory of structural transformation without any real means of achieving their goals. It in fact suits even the most cynical or conservative in the leadership to continue to have such a pool of intellectuals and activists.

Murray's last pages express hope for the adoption of a coherent Keynesian programme on the part of the ANC but as of late 1995, relatively little has been delivered. Without it, as Murray clearly emphasizes, those that have power in civil society will continue to wield it. Murray exaggerates both the coherence of ANC strategy and its capacity to stand up to pressures from the business world in South Africa.

Yet the ANC's problem with delivery may have far more to do with competence and capacity than intention. I can repeat an anecdote I was told the other day concerning the first Communist government to take office in the Indian state of Kerala in the 1950s; the chief minister, Namboodiripad, commented that it was a complete error to have thought that they were then assuming power. All that they were doing was taking over an administration whose byways they hardly grasped.

Yet unlike the Kerala Communists, the ANC are apt to stay in office for a long time; their support base does not rest essentially on performance. Because of this, they may have the luxury of learning slowly and making mistakes. There may even be reason for radicals within the ANC, whether Communist Party members, trade unionists or others, to hope that their day will come. For black South

Africans, there are no alternatives to the ANC in sight.

*The Revolution Deferred* is a very useful book; nonetheless one perhaps needs to mention its generic limitations. Murray's more important analytical points, his strategic connections, are largely taken from a variety of South African critics. At most, he adds a note of caution or qualification. He is not really able to transcend what he has read in South Africa or to select the lasting themes that might give this work a more long-term analytical purchase. There is no convincing theory of transition or change by which Murray allows us to measure South African events. Murray has perhaps allowed himself too much scope to comment on an overly broad range of issues; a narrower but more focused study might have made a good book better.

William Freund  
University of Natal

Laurie Graham, *On the Line at Subaru-Isuzu: The Japanese Model and the American Worker* (Ithaca: ILR-Cornell University Press 1995).

THE ARRIVAL in North America of Japanese transplants allegedly marked the beginning of a golden age in the auto industry. In *The Machine That Changed the World*, a multi-million dollar cross-national study conducted by a team of Massachusetts Institute of Technology (MIT) researchers, Japanese production management, or lean production, was portrayed in evangelical tones as a post-Fordist corrective to mass production's inefficiencies and inflexibilities, its mind-numbing jobs performed by alienated workers, and its adversarial labour-management relations. While the study compiled reams of comparative statistics on output per person, defects, space utilization, die-change time, and other measures of efficiency, its portrayal of workers as multiskilled, empowered and continu-

ously challenged was devoid of an empirical foundation.

Graham's book is one of a handful of studies of auto transplants in North America that have exposed the MIT group's fanciful characterizations of what it's like to work under lean production. The author spent six months working on the assembly line at the Subaru-Isuzu (SIA) plant in Lafayette, Indiana. During this time, unbeknownst to the company and her co-workers, Graham was gathering data — mainly systematic observations and informal conversations with co-workers — for her PhD thesis. From a shopfloor perspective Graham provides a rich account of a lean factory and the experiences of workers as they were quickly transformed from raw recruits to hardened veterans.

A pre-employment screening process — batteries of tests and interviews conducted periodically over two months — is aimed at selecting (from some 30,000 applicants) a cooperative workforce motivated to work in a union-free plant. The procedures were not foolproof, however, as Graham and others gave answers they knew the company wanted. Successful applicants underwent three weeks of orientation and training, over one-half of which was devoted to communicating company values and shaping attitudes. Many workers also saw through this hype, although they pretended otherwise.

As they settled into their jobs, workers found that the lofty ideals transmitted earlier were not practised on the shopfloor. Instead, they experienced constant speedup, highly standardized jobs, continuous monitoring by supervisors and team leaders, tightly controlled and narrowly defined participation (kaizen), peer pressure, favouritism, and unscheduled, mandatory overtime. Women found themselves performing the least skilled and most labour-intensive jobs. There were few black workers and fewer still in any position of authority. The most jarring discrepancy between promise and reality was the alarmingly high incidence of

injuries, particularly repetitive strain injuries.

Graham isolates seven elements of SIA operations that generate what she calls an "iron-cage of control": stringent recruitment criteria, ideological training, philosophy of kaizen, team concept, company shaping of shopfloor culture, a computerized assembly line, and just-in-time production. She explains how each of these operates to achieve worker compliance. Despite the "iron-cage," workers engaged in acts of individual and collective resistance, ranging from refusals to participate in team meetings and company rituals to sabotaging the line. An entire chapter is devoted to a discussion of resistance.

"The Japanese model," Graham observes, "creates a highly controlled atmosphere aimed at preventing workers from expressing their inherent resentment of authority and domination, which could potentially lead to concerted action and could foster their independence from the company." Graham concludes that SIA, and by implication lean production in general, represents a post-Fordist, hegemonic workplace because it uses social as well as technical controls to contain resistance and generate consent. This is a remarkable conclusion since her data and analyses point in another direction. An organization is hegemonic only to the extent that subordinates internalize the dominant ideology and act accordingly. This does not describe workers at SIA any more than it does those at Mazda in Michigan, NUMMI in California, and CAMI in Ontario. In the above quote the operative words are "aimed at." Had SIA kept its promises of open communication, empowerment, cooperation, etc., Graham might have told a different story. Instead, she remarks: "With the demands of capitalist production, it became apparent that SIA was just like any other company operating within the same constraints." And in the author's own words, SIA was driven by "hidden and open intimidation." This is not the stuff out of which hegemony is

fashioned, nor is there anything to distinguish SIA as post-Fordist. (It also is instructive to recall that social controls were instituted at the Ford Highland Park plant in the second decade of this century. To qualify for \$5 a day wages workers had to demonstrate to company interviewers that their lifestyles met Henry Ford's rigid moral standards.)

Perhaps SIA workers were not as bloody-minded as Ben Hamper, the Flint auto worker who wrote *Rivthead* and whom Graham uses to typify workers under Fordist mass production. However, even if we assume that Hamper is typical, the contrast is not nearly as sharp as Graham suggests. Instead of committed workers who identified with the company, Graham found compliance, cynicism, and resistance. Certainly, the resistance would have been more focused and effective had an independent union been present, but that is another matter. Workers showed little interest in unionizing, but this reflected insecurity and fear rather than identification with the company. SIA showed on in-plant TV screens all the unionized plants in the US that had closed. SIA's large corps of temporary workers with lower wages and no benefits served as a constant reminder to the full-timers that their employment security was tenuous. And Graham's co-workers told her that they believed unionization would lead SIA to relocate. Ben Hamper did not face these kinds of threats. All this adds up not to hegemony but at best to what Michael Burawoy called hegemonic despotism, a term that Graham curiously ignores.

Post-Fordism is a misleading concept, but this is a minor quibble. This is an outstanding book. Like Satoshi Kamata's *Japan in the Passing Lane*, a participant observation study that starkly exposed the price Japanese workers pay for Toyota's success, Graham's ethnographic account of SIA shatters the sanguine mythology surrounding Japanese transplants in North America. The book is on the required reading list of my under-

graduate course in industrial sociology. It is a must read for students of lean production and team concept, and I recommend it to anyone interested in labour and industrial relations.

James Rinehart  
University of Western Ontario

Lydia Morris, *Dangerous Classes: The Underclass and Social Citizenship* (New York: Routledge 1994).

Jonathan Simon, *Poor Discipline: Parole and the Social Control of the Underclass, 1890-1900* (Chicago: Chicago University Press 1993).

Christopher Jencks, *The Homeless* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press 1994).

THE THREE BOOKS under review all address different aspects of concentrated urban poverty with particular reference to the United States. They each do so from a particular "left" perspective. Morris examines the literature on poverty and the welfare state in the USA and UK as a traditional social democrat. Jencks tries to make sense of social policy for the homeless as a befuddled liberal. And Simon unleashes the arsenal of poststructuralist deconstruction against the crisis of the parole system of California.

The object of all three books is the urban underclass. Over the past decade, both in the popular press and scholarly journals, the underclass has occupied an important place. Yet, in spite of this attention, the last ten years have done little to clarify what "it" is. On the one hand, there is a dispute about its novelty. William Julius Wilson, whose *The Truly Disadvantaged* is the best known treatment of the topic, contends that the underclass is a new phenomenon — a product of the combination of post-sixties social policy and the post-industrial transformation of the cities. Others — most notably Nicholas Lehman — trace the underclass' origins to the rural South of the late 19th century.

There is also a dispute concerning the cause of its emergence. Charles Murray, for example, in *Losing Ground*, contends that the urban poor are "rational-decision-makers" who have responded to the incentives built into social policy, particularly America's public assistance system. Lawrence Mead, in contrast, sees the problem in the wholesale breakdown of the moral integrity of urban communities — particularly concerning work and family. Only a widespread enforcement of social discipline can turn the situation around.

Lydia Morris is the only one of the three books reviewed here that examines the underclass in its entirety. She brings a refreshing cross-national perspective to a debate that has grown stale. The key lens through which she analyzes the underclass debate is the concept of "social citizenship" that she sees as the exact reverse of the underclass: social citizenship stands for "the promise of social inclusion, as opposed to [the underclass' connotation of moral and material exclusion]."

She provides a close reading of the development of the underclass debate in the United States from the perspective of British social welfare thought. She documents the durability of the idea of a socially excluded "residuum" throughout the 19th century and the efforts of social democrats to use the welfare state to incorporate this class into the social order. Thus, for Morris, the core of the conservative literature on the underclass is an attack on the viability of the welfare state. If we are to abandon the concept of social citizenship — give up on the dream of T.H. Marshall and subsequent social democrats to use government policy to ameliorate and to incorporate — in favour of an older model of class and social policy in which public aid is used as a means of social subordination and discipline, we must expect a continuing attack on existing social programs.

In the United States, of course, no commitment to a social democratic vision

of social citizenship was ever remotely made. American reformers — from the Progressives through the War on Poverty — however, did share the social democrats' vision of a gradualist amelioration of social need. In this respect, Morris' application of British models of social policy brings out an unstated feature of the American debate — the extent to which American liberals have abandoned this vision.

Nowhere is this more apparent than in Christopher Jencks' assessment of the problem of the homeless. As in his *Re-thinking Social Policy*, Jencks tries to reconstruct a sadder but wiser liberalism. As Morris' analysis would suggest, it is a liberalism in which the vision of social incorporation has diminished and the obligations of citizens have increased.

Jencks provides us with a skeptical review of the magnitude and causes of the problem of the homeless. Although he does not support advocates' views that the homeless population is now a significant proportion of the population, Jencks' "best guess" is that there were four times as many homeless in the late 1980s as there were at the beginning of the decade. Jencks finds that at the same time the homeless population was booming, the population in "single-room occupancy" buildings (SROs) declined.

Jencks concludes that the causes of the increase of homelessness cut across orthodox liberal and conservative explanations. Indeed, a neoconservative concern with "unintended consequences" of social policy is the most consistent theme in his account. The impact of the return of the mentally ill "to their community" turned — in the face of community institutional decline and tax pressures — into the widespread "dumping" of the mentally ill. The efforts of advocates to increase the availability and desirability of shelter may have increased the willingness of the poor to leave crowded private accommodations for the new shelters. The desire to reinforce housing standards may have led to the destruction of the

"substandard" housing that was the only type of housing the very poor could afford.

In essence, then, homelessness is for Jencks a symbol of the limits of the current liberal welfare regime. Life, for the poor, is hard, and there is no prospect that either the American economy or the social welfare system can fundamentally change that fact. As a result, even well-meaning efforts are likely to lead to dead-ends. For Jencks a program that promises limited, but concrete results (he suggests an increase in SROs and a public day-labourer program), are preferable to one which combines high-minded rhetoric with little prospect for success.

The limits of reform is a theme for Jonathan Simon as well. *Poor Discipline* could have been a very interesting case study of how changes in social conditions and the influence of public debate combined to change the functioning and ideology of the criminal justice system. In essence, Simon tells how a program that began life with the intention of returning individuals to productive work in their communities was affected by the breakdown of the low-skill labour market, the attenuation of social control in poor urban neighbourhoods, and shifts in policy (especially the replacement of indeterminate by mandatory sentences). In essence, the parole system had to redefine itself, judging its success not by how well former prisoners did, but how well the system was managed.

Unfortunately, someone apparently introduced Professor Simon to Michel Foucault at an impressionable age. Thus, instead of a historical case study, we are treated to a "genealogy" of parole. Although the poststructural rhetorical overlay does not undermine his accomplishment, it is not clear that it adds much to it.

Most strikingly, Simon — like Morris — sees the history of parole as part of the return to a 19th century vision of society in which the poor are officially excluded from full citizenship status. Certainly, the fact that one in four African-American

men in their 20s was in some form of correctional custody in 1988 underlines the extent to which surveillance and concentration — what Simon calls the “waste-management” model of corrections — has replaced a vision of social reform.

The social changes of the past two decades have knocked social reform on its ear. The welfare state reached the limits of its fiscal capacity just as changes in the world economy made it impossible for governments to control their rates of economic growth and unemployment. In the United States, the rise of a ferocious conservatism has made it easy to forget that reformers could no longer present a vision or a road map which led to a society that was more equal and just.

The “underclass” debate is only one aspect of our unsuccessful efforts to cope with this impasse. Just as the Prohibition campaigns of the early 20th century captured public anxiety over the impact of industrialization, urbanization, and immigration on American society, so the ghetto poor have served as our symbolic crusade. Although Morris and Simon are right to point to the similarities between the “dangerous class” rhetoric of the 19th century and contemporary rhetoric, the difference is that in 1880 we had never tried to construct a vast bureaucracy to ameliorate need and want. Now that it has been tried and found wanting, we are at a loss about what to do next.

Mark J. Stern  
University of Pennsylvania

## **Canadian Journal of History**

## **Annales canadiennes d'histoire**

**P**ublished since 1966, the *Canadian Journal of History/Annales canadiennes d'histoire* presents original and innovative scholarship from all fields of history — except Canadian history.

### ***Each issue normally features . . .***

- **feature articles** — original scholarship by historical specialists
- **review articles** by leading scholars
- **forty reviews** of the latest historical research in a wide variety of fields.

### ***A Sample of Articles in the last year . . .***

- David S. Parker, "Peruvian Politics and the Eight-Hour Day: Rethinking the 1919 General Strike"
- Brock Millman, "Henry Wilson's Mischief: Field Marshall Sir Henry Wilson's Rise to Power, 1917-18"
- Anita M. Walker and Edmund H. Dickerman, "Mind of an Assassin: Ravaillac and the Murder of Henry IV of France"
- Jean-Guy Daigle, "Femmes en trop, femmes sur le carreau: Reading et le Berkshire au milieu du XIX<sup>e</sup> siècle"

### ***Special April 1996 Issue and August 1996 Issue:***

The **April** issue contains four articles on markets and the medieval economy contributed by leading specialists to commemorate the work of the late **David L. Farmer**, a former editor of the *CJH* and a distinguished historian of medieval Britain.

The **August** issue contains articles by K.M. Wilson, "The Making and Putative Implementation of a British Foreign Policy of Gesture, December 1905 to August 1914"; R. Love, "Rituals of Majesty: France, Siam and Court Spectacle in Royal Image-Building at Versailles in 1685 and 1686"; Earlene Craver Leijonhufvud, "The Young Socialists in Italy, 1907-1915"; and the *CJH* Graduate Essay Competition winning entry by B. Hett, "Goak Here": A.J.P. Taylor and *The Origins of the Second World War*.



Subscriptions: CAN\$25 (individuals), CAN\$29 (institutions)

Mailing address: *Canadian Journal of History*, Department of History, 9 Campus Drive, University of Saskatchewan, Saskatoon, Canada S7N 5A5.

E-mail: [cjh@duke.usask.ca](mailto:cjh@duke.usask.ca) Web Site: <http://www.usask.ca/history/cjh>

Telephone: 306-966-5794 Fax: 306-966-5852